

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:95-cv-10533-GBD-KHP**

Marisol A., et al v. Rudolph Giuliani, et al
Assigned to: Judge George B. Daniels
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker
Demand: \$0
Related Case: 1:99-cv-00326-AJN
Case in other court: 99-07218.
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 12/13/1995
Date Terminated: 03/31/1999
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Marisol A.
*by her next friend, Rev. Dr. James
Alexander Forbes, Jr; by her next friend
Raymunda Cruz.*

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
Children's Rights, Inc.
404 Park Avenue South
11th Floor
New York, NY 10016
*TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY*

David M. Brodsky
Latham & Watkins LLP
885 Third Avenue, Suite 1000
New York, NY 10022
212-906-1628
Fax: 212-751-4864
Email: david.brodsky@lw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
Lawyers for Children, Inc.,
110 Lafayette St
8th Flr.
New York, NY 10013
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
Children's Rights Incorporated
330 Seventh Avenue
4th Floor
New York, NY 10001
(212)683-2210
Fax: (212) 683-4015
Email: info@childrensrights.org
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
New York State Department of Law
Litigation
120 Broadway, 24th Floor
New York, NY 10271
(212)-416-8306
Fax: (212)-416-6003
Email: rose.firestein@ag.ny.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
Children's Rights Incorporated
330 Seventh Avenue
4th Floor
New York, NY 10001

212-683-2210
Fax: (212) 683-4015
Email: info@childrensrights.org
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
Cahill Gordon & Reindel
80 Pine Street
New York, NY 10005
(212)701-3000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
Lawyers For Children
110 Lafayette Street
New York, NY 10013
(212)-966-6420
Email: bkramer@lawyersforchildren.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Lawrence B.
by his next friend, Dr. Vincent Bonagura

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Thomas C.
by his next friend, Dr. Margaret T. McHugh

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Shauna D.
by her next friend, Nedda de Castro

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

represented by

Ozzie E.
*by his next friends, Jill Chaifetz and Kim
Hawkins*

Carol A. Marcus
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Darren F.

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

David F.
by their next friends, Juan A. Figueroa

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)

and Rev. Marvin J. Owens

TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Bill G.

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Victoria G.
*by their next friend, Sister Dolores
Gartanutti*

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Betsy Kramer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Brandon H.
by his next friend, Thomas J. Moloney

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Plaintiff

Stephen I.
*by his next friend, Kevin Ryan, on their
own behalf and on behalf of and all
others similarly situated*

represented by **Carol A. Marcus**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/08/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY

David M. Brodsky
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Karen J. Freedman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Marcia Robinson Lowry
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Rose Elaine Firestein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Thomas F. Curnin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

V.

Defendant

Rudolph W. Giuliani
Mayor of the City of New York

represented by **Grace Goodman**
Paul A. Crotty
Corporation Counsel of the City of NY
100 Church Street
Room 20176
New York, NY 10007
(212)788-0963
LEAD ATTORNEY

Defendant

Marva Livingston Hammons
*Aministrator of the Human Resources
Administration and Commissioner of the
Dept. of Social Services of the City of
New York*

represented by **Grace Goodman**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Defendant

seorge E. Pataki
Governor of the State of New York

represented by **Michael S. Popkin**
Dennis C. Vacco
Attorney General of the State of NY
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
(212)416-8570

LEAD ATTORNEY

Defendant

Brian J. Wing
*Acting Commissioner of the Dept. of
Social Services of the State of New York*

represented by **Michael S. Popkin**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Defendant

Nicholas Scopetta
*in his official capacity as Commissioner
of the New York City Administration for
Children's Services*

represented by **Grace Goodman**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

Joel A.

represented by **Marc Christopher Falcone**
Paul Weiss (NY)
1285 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10019
(212)-373-3506
Fax: (212)-492-0506
Email: mfalcone@paulweiss.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

Michael D.

represented by **Marc Christopher Falcone**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

Eric R.

represented by **Marc Christopher Falcone**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

David S.

represented by **Marc Christopher Falcone**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

Maxx R.

represented by **Marc Christopher Falcone**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

Ray D.

represented by **Marc Christopher Falcone**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ADR Provider

SHEILA J. POOLE
*Acting Commissioner of the New York
State Office of Children and Family
Services*

represented by **Samantha Leigh Buchalter**
New York State Office of the Attorney
General (28 Liberty)
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005
212-416-6582
Fax: 212-416-6009
Email: samantha.buchalter@ag.ny.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Movant

Courtroom Television Network

represented by **Floyd Abrams**
Cahill Gordon & Reindel LLP
80 Pine Street
New York, NY 10005
(212)-701-3621
Fax: (212)-269-5420
Email: fabrams@cahill.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Plaintiff

Walter S.
*by his next friends, W.N. and N.N.,
grandparents*

represented by **Marcia Robinson Lowry**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Plaintiff

Richard S.
*by his next friends, W.N. and N.N.,
grandparents*

represented by **Marcia Robinson Lowry**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Mark G. Peters
Locke Lord LLP (NYC)
750 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10022
212-308-4411
Fax: 212-308-4844
Email: mpeters@edwardswildman.com
TERMINATED: 01/12/1999
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Plaintiff

Danielle J.
by her next friend, Angela Lloyd

represented by **Marcia Robinson Lowry**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Mark G. Peters
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/12/1999
LEAD ATTORNEY

Shirim Nothenberg
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/16/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/13/1995	1	COMPLAINT filed; Summons issued and Notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636(c); FILING FEE \$ 120 RECEIPT # 252080 (sc) (Entered: 12/14/1995)

12/13/1995		CASE REFERRED TO Judge Ward (sc) (Entered: 12/14/1995)
12/14/1995	2	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. for class certification , Return date 1/4/96 (cd) (Entered: 12/20/1995)
12/14/1995	3	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in support of [2-1] motion for class certification (cd) (Entered: 12/20/1995)
12/21/1995		Case accepted as related to 78 Cv 0957. Notice of assignment to follow. (sc) (Entered: 12/21/1995)
12/21/1995	4	Notice of asg _ to Judge Robert J. Ward Copy of notice and judge's rules mailed to Attorney(s) of record: Karen J. Freedman, Marcia Robinson Lowry . (sc) (Entered: 12/21/1995)
12/26/1995	5	Case Information Statement Addendum and Case Designation to a Magistrate Judge filed. Purs. to statement, it is suggested that the case be classified as unknown. Case is designated to Magistrate Judge Grubin. (sc) (Entered: 12/26/1995)
12/26/1995		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 12/27/1995)
01/31/1996	6	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted , or, in the alternative declining to exercise pendant jurisdiction over, or abstaining from deciding, the Seventh and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint, which are based on alleged violations of state law , Return date 2/12/96 (emil) (Entered: 02/05/1996)
01/31/1996	7	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft in support of [6-1] motion purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted, [6-2] motion declining to exercise pendant jurisdiction over, or abstaining from deciding, the Seventh and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint, which are based on alleged violations of state law (emil) (Entered: 02/05/1996)
01/31/1996	8	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft in opposition to class certification (emil) (Entered: 02/05/1996)
02/05/1996	9	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani et al (city defts) for an order modifying the TRO of 1/19/96 , Return date 1/26/96 (cd) (Entered: 02/06/1996)
02/05/1996	10	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani etal (city defts) in support of [9-1] motion for an order modifying the TRO of 1/19/96 (cd) (Entered: 02/06/1996)
02/05/1996	11	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to [6-1] motion purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted, [6-2] motion declining to exercise pendant jurisdiction over, or abstaining from deciding, the Seventh and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint, which are based on alleged violations of state law. Fld in night deposit on 2/5/96 on 7:51 p.m. (emil) (Entered: 02/07/1996)
02/06/1996	12	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to [6-1] motion purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted, [6-2] motion declining to exercise pendant jurisdiction over, or abstaining from deciding, the Seventh and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint, which are based on alleged violations of state law (emil) (Entered: 02/09/1996)

02/13/1996	13	NOTICE OF MOTION by George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing purs. to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP, to dismiss the complaint in part , Return date 2/12/96 (emil) (Entered: 02/15/1996)
02/13/1996	14	MEMORANDUM by George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing in support of [13-1] motion purs. to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP, to dismiss the complaint in part (emil) (Entered: 02/15/1996)
02/13/1996	15	MEMORANDUM by George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing in opposition to [2-1] motion for class certification (emil) (Entered: 02/15/1996)
02/14/1996	16	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases , or, in the alternative for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Pltffs' Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety , Return date 3/4/96 (emil) (Entered: 02/15/1996)
02/14/1996	17	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft in support of [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, [16-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Pltffs' Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety (emil) (Entered: 02/15/1996)
02/14/1996	18	AFFIRMATION of Grace Goodman by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft in support Re: [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, [16-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Pltffs' Second Request for of Documents in its entirety (emil) (Entered: 02/15/1996)
02/20/1996	19	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, [16-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Pltffs' Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety. Fld in night deposit on 2/20/96 at 10:47 p.m. (emil) (Entered: 02/22/1996)
02/20/1996	20	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in support re: [2-1] motion for class certification. Fld in night deposit on 2/20/96 at 10:48 p.m. (emil) (Entered: 02/22/1996)
02/20/1996	21	AFFIDAVIT in support of Marcia Robinson Lowry by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: [20-1] reply memorandum. Fld in night deposit on 2/20/96 at 10:48 p.m. (emil) (Entered: 02/22/1996)
02/21/1996	22	AFFIDAVIT (corrected copy) in support of Marcia Robinson Lowry by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: [20-1] reply memorandum. Fld in night deposit on 2/21/96 at 9:08 p.m. (emil) (Entered: 02/23/1996)
02/21/1996	24	REPLY MEMORANDUM by George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing in support re: [13-1] motion purs. to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP, to the complaint in part (emil) (Entered: 02/23/1996)
02/22/1996	23	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft in support re: [6-1] motion purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted, [6-2] motion declining to exercise pendant jurisdiction over, or abstaining from deciding, the Seventh and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint, which are based on alleged violations of state law (emil) (Entered: 02/23/1996)
02/23/1996	26	NOTICE OF MOTION by George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases , for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating plttf's Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety , Return date 3/4/96. Affirmation in support attached. (emil) (Entered: 02/23/1996)

		02/26/1996)
02/26/1996	25	NOTICE OF REDESIGNATION OF A CIVIL CASE TO ANOTHER MAGISTRATE JUDGE. The above entitled action has been redesignated to Magistrate Judge Eaton. Please note that this is the reassignment of the designation only. Copy of notice mailed to Attorney(s) of record: Karen J. Freedman, Marcia Robinson Lowry . (sc) (Entered: 02/26/1996)
02/26/1996	27	ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE; Show Cause Hearing set for 10:00 2/28/96 purs. to Rule 24 of the FRCP, for an order granting Court TV leave to intervene in this case for the limited purposes of (a) seeking to persuade this Court that Court TV may televise the 3/4/96 oral argument on plttfs' motion for class certification and defts' pretrial motions to dismiss and (b) obtaining the Court's written permission purs. to General Rule 7 of the Local Rules of this Court to televise the oral arguments scheduled for 3/4/96 (signed by Judge John E. Sprizzo, Part I); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 02/26/1996)
02/26/1996	28	MEMORANDUM by Court TV in support of [27-1] motion purs. to Rule 24 of the FRCP, for an order granting Court TV leave to intervene in this case for the limited purposes of (a) seeking to persuade this Court that Court TV may televise the 3/4/96 oral argument on plttfs' motion for class certification and defts' pretrial motions to dismiss and (b) obtaining the Court's written permission purs. to General Rule 7 of the Local Rules of this Court to televise the oral arguments scheduled for 3/4/96 (emil) (Entered: 02/26/1996)
02/26/1996	29	Affidavit of Service of Order to Show Cause and supporting papers upon the following: NYC Law Dept. by Grace Goodman, Esq. 2/23/96; Office of NYS Atty. Gen., by Ronald Younkins on 2/23/96; Lawyers for Children, Inc. by Karen Freedman on 2/23/96; Children's Rights, Inc. by Robinson on 2/23/96. (emil) Modified on 02/27/1996 (Entered: 02/27/1996)
02/27/1996	30	Affidavit of Service of Order to Show Cause and Letter of Jonathan Sherman dated 2/26/96 upon the following: Office of the Atty. Gen. by Ronald Younkins on 2/26/96; Lawyers for Children, Inc. by Karen Freedman on 2/26/96; Corp. Counsel of the City of NY by Grace Goodman on 2/26/96; Children's Rights, Inc. by Marcia Robinson Lowry on 2/26/96 (emil) (Entered: 02/28/1996)
02/28/1996		Motion hearing held re: [27-1] motion purs. to Rule 24 of the FRCP, for an order granting Court TV leave to intervene in this case for the limited purposes of (a) seeking to persuade this Court that Court TV may televise the 3/4/96 oral argument on plttfs' motion for class certification and defts' pretrial motions to dismiss and (b) obtaining the Court's written permission purs. to General Rule 7 of the Local Rules of this Court to televise the oral arguments scheduled for 3/4/96; decision reserved. (emil) (Entered: 02/28/1996)
02/28/1996	31	Reply affirmation of Grace Goodman by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft in support of [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, [16-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Plttfs' Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety (emil) (Entered: 02/29/1996)
02/28/1996	32	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft in support re: [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, [16-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Plttfs' Second Request for of Documents in its entirety (emil) (Entered: 02/29/1996)
02/29/1996	35	SUR-REPLY by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., H., Stephen I. Re: in opposition to defts' motions to bifurcate this action and to stay class-wide discovery. (emil) (Entered: 03/04/1996)
03/01/1996	33	DECLARATION of Lorna Bade Goodman in opposition by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft [27-1] motion purs. to Rule 24 of the FRCP, for an order granting Court TV leave intervene in this case for the limited purposes of (a) seeking to persuade this Court that Court TV may televise the 3/4/96 oral argument on plttfs' motion for class certification and defts' pretrial motions to dismiss and obtaining the Court's written permission purs. to General Rule 7 of the Local Rules of this Court to televise the arguments scheduled for 3/4/96 (emil)

		(Entered: 03/01/1996)
03/01/1996	34	MEMORANDUM & ORDER granting in part, mooting in part [27-1] motion purs. to Rule 24 of the FRCP, for an order granting Court leave to intervene in this case for the limited purposes of (a) seeking to persuade this Court that Court TV may televise the 3/4/96 oral argument on plttfs' motion for class certification and defts' pretrial motions to dismiss and (b) obtaining the Court's written permission purs. to General Rule 7 of the Local Rules of this Court to televise the oral arguments scheduled for 3/4/96, Inasmuch as the Court heard counsel for the Proposed Intervenor on 2/28/96, the portion of the motion seeking to intervene is moot. For the reasons stated in this Order, the portion of the motion seeking to televise the March 4 Argument is granted (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 03/04/1996)
03/01/1996		Memo endorsed on Order to Show Cause, doc. #27; motion disposed of in accordance w/ memorandum and order filed herewith (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 03/04/1996)
03/01/1996	36	NOTICE of attorney appearance (as co-counsel) for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. by Thomas F. (emil) (Entered: 03/04/1996)
03/04/1996		Motion hearing re: [26-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, [26-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating plttf's Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety, [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, [16-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Plttfs' Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety, [13-1] motion purs. to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP, to dismiss the complaint in part, [6-1] motion purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted, [6-2] motion declining to exercise pendant jurisdiction over, or abstaining from deciding, the Seventh and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint, which are based on alleged violations of state law, [2-1] motion for class certification (emil) (Entered: 03/05/1996)
03/05/1996	37	AFFIRMATION of Grace Goodman by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft Re: to suggest on the record the death of plttf "Lawrence B." (emil) (Entered: 03/06/1996)
03/07/1996	38	Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Discovery Disputes only when Dist. Judge is unavailable (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward) Referred to Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton (emil) (Entered: 03/08/1996)
03/12/1996	39	ORDER, Nicholas Scoppetta, in his official capacity as Commissioner of the New York City Administration for Children's Services, is substituted as a deft for Kathryn Croft. The NYC Child Welfare Administration having been renamed the NYC Administration for Children's Services, effective 2/12/96, all references in the parties' submissions to either the Child Welfare Administration or the Administration for Children's Services shall be considered inclusive (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 03/12/1996)
03/21/1996		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 03/25/1996)
04/10/1996	40	Letter filed dated 4/9/96 re change of address of Children's Rights, Inc., counsel for plttfs. (emil) Modified on 04/11/1996 (Entered: 04/11/1996)
05/01/1996	41	Letter filed by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. dated 4/29/96 re new telephone number for Children's Rights, Inc., counsel for plttf. (emil) (Entered: 05/03/1996)
05/08/1996	42	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 3/21/96 (emil) (Entered: 05/09/1996)
05/08/1996	43	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 2/28/96 (emil) (Entered: 05/09/1996)

05/14/1996	44	PROTECTIVE ORDER, regarding procedures that will govern the handling of individually-identifying information (as detailed in this order) (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 05/15/1996)
06/18/1996	45	MEMORANDUM OPINION #76777 denying [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases; denying [13-1] motion purs. to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP, to dismiss the complaint in part; denying [6-1] motion purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted; granting [2-1] motion for class certification, defts' motions to dismiss are denied to the extent that (1) custodial plttfs may pursue their substantive due process claims based on alleged violations of their right to be free from harm and all plttfs may pursue their procedural due process claims based on alleged violations of various provision of New York's Child Protective Services laws, codified at Title 6 of Article 6 of the New York Social Services Law; (2) plttfs may pursue their federal statutory claims based on the Adoption Assistance and Child Welfare Act, including the provision herein referred to as the Multiethnic Placement Act, the Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act, the Americans w/ Disabilities Act, and the Rehabilitation Act; and (3) plttfs may pursue their state law claims (Signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 06/19/1996)
06/18/1996		Memo endorsed on motion; denying [6-1] motion purs. to FRCP 12(b)(6), to dismiss portions of the First Cause of Action and the Second, Third, Fourth, Sixth, Seventh, and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint in their entirety for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted, denying [6-2] motion declining to exercise pendant jurisdiction over, or abstaining from deciding, the Seventh and Eighth Causes of Action in the complaint, which are based on alleged violations of state law (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 06/19/1996)
06/18/1996		Memo endorsed on motion; denying [16-1] motion purs. to FRCP 42(b), to bifurcate the discovery and trial of this action into two phases, denying [16-2] motion for a protective order purs. to FRCP 26(c) vacating Plttfs' Second Request for Production of Documents in its entirety (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 06/19/1996)
06/18/1996		Memo endorsed on motion; denying [13-1] motion purs. to Rule 12(b)(6) of the FRCP, to dismiss the complaint in part (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 06/19/1996)
06/18/1996		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [2-1] motion for class certification (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 06/19/1996)
07/03/1996		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 07/03/1996)
07/03/1996	46	ORDER, regarding resolution of the following motions: City and State defts' motions to dismiss, that the court decline to exercise its supplemental jurisdiction, that plttf's state law claims be deemed nonjusticiable, and that the court abstain; City defts' motion to bifurcate the proceedings; and plttfs' motion for class certification (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 07/05/1996)
07/09/1996	47	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 3/4/96 (emil) (Entered: 07/11/1996)
07/26/1996	48	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, the City defts' application purs. to 28 USC 1292(b) for certification for interlocutory appeal of this Court's order certifying this case as a class action is granted (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 07/26/1996)
08/02/1996	49	STIPULATION, extending time for City and State defts to Answer to the complaint is extended to 8/16/96 , reset answer due for 8/16/96 for Nicholas Scopetta, for Brian J. Wing, for George E. Pataki, for Marva Livingston Hammons, for Rudolph W. Giuliani (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (kg) (Entered: 08/02/1996)
08/07/1996	50	STIPULATION and ORDER, the parties to this action agree that the State Defts are deemed to have joined in the City Defts' application to certify the Court's Order, dated 7/3/96, for immediate appeal purs. to 28 USC 1292(b); and the State Defts shall have leave, along w/ the City Defts, to pursue said interlocutory appeal, under the terms of

		the Court's Order, dated 7/26/96, granting the City Defts' application. The State Defts participation in that Order shall be nunc pro tunc, and no deadline established by the Court's 7/26/96 Order shall be extended by virtue of this Stip (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (emil) (Entered: 08/08/1996)
08/08/1996		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 08/09/1996)
08/12/1996	51	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, defts' application purs. to 28 USC 1292(b) for certification for interlocutory appeal of this Court's order certifying this case as a class action is granted. Upon their consent, defts are directed to file their petition for permission to appeal w/ the clerk of the court of appeals within three business days from the date of this order (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 08/12/1996)
08/16/1996	52	ANSWER to Complaint by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta (Attorney Grace Goodman) (emil) (Entered: 08/19/1996)
08/20/1996	53	NOTICE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to take deposition of NYC Administration for Children's Services on 9/9/96; subpoena(s) issued. (emil) (Entered: 08/21/1996)
08/20/1996	54	NOTICE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to take deposition of Dept. of Social Services of the State of NY on 9/5/96; subpoena(s) issued. (emil) (Entered: 08/21/1996)
08/20/1996	55	ANSWER to Complaint by George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing (Attorney Michael S. Popkin) (emil) (Entered: 08/23/1996)
09/09/1996	56	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons purs. to FRCP 62 and 26(c), for a stay of classwide discovery pending determination of the appeal of this Court's order granting certification of a class , Return date 9/24/96. Declaration in support attached. (emil) (Entered: 09/10/1996)
09/09/1996	57	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons in support of [56-1] motion purs. to FRCP 62 and 26(c), for a stay of classwide discovery pending determination of the appeal of this Court's order granting certification of a class (emil) (Entered: 09/10/1996)
09/11/1996	58	True Copy of Order from the USCA as to George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing RE: Motion for leave to appeal under 28 U.S.C. 1292 (b): It is hereby ordered that the motion be and it hereby is granted. (96-9134). GEORGE LANGE III, Clerk, U.S.C.A. (Construed as a Notice of Appeal. Fee paid \$105.00 on 9/11/96, Receipt # E270377). (em) Modified on 09/12/1996 (Entered: 09/12/1996)
09/24/1996	59	True Copy of Order from the USCA as to Nicholas Scoppetta RE: Motion for permission to appeal pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1292(b). It is hereby ordered that the motion be and it hereby is granted. (96-9132 and 96-8036). (Construed as a Notice of Appeal). GEORGE LANGE III, Clerk, U.S.C.A. (em) (Entered: 09/24/1996)
10/02/1996	60	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to [56-1] motion purs. to FRCP 62 and 26(c), for a stay of classwide discovery pending determination of the appeal of this Court's order granting certification of a class (emil) (Entered: 10/04/1996)
10/07/1996	61	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 8/8/96 (emil) (Entered: 10/08/1996)
10/08/1996	62	NOTICE OF MOTION by The New York City Chapter of the National Association of Social Workers for an order allowing The NYC Chapter of the Nat'l Association of Social Workers to appear as an amicus curiae in this action , Return date 11/1/96 (emil) (Entered: 10/09/1996)
10/08/1996	63	MEMORANDUM by NYC Chapter of the Nat'l Association of Social Workers in support of [62-1] motion for an order allowing The NYC Chapter of the Nat'l Association of Social Workers to appear as an amicus curiae in this action (emil)

		(Entered: 10/09/1996)
10/08/1996	64	DECLARATION of Deborah K. Shepherd on behalf of NYC Chapter of the Nat'l Association of Social Worker in support [62-1] motion for an order allowing The NYC Chapter of the Nat'l Association of Social Workers to appear as an amicus curiae in this action (emil) (Entered: 10/09/1996)
10/09/1996		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 10/10/1996)
10/09/1996	65	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons in support re: [56-1] motion purs. to FRCP 62 and 26(c), for stay of classwide discovery pending determination of the appeal of this Court's order granting certification of a class. (Received in unit for docketing on 10/16/96 from 500 Pearl St.) (emil) (Entered: 10/16/1996)
10/10/1996		Memo endorsed on motion; denying [56-1] motion purs. to FRCP 62 and 26(c), for a stay of classwide discovery pending determination of the appeal of this Court's order granting certification of a class, discovery shall proceed in accordance w/ the oral direction of the Court as set forth in open court (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 10/10/1996)
10/16/1996	66	Letter filed addressed to Judge Ward from Terrence J. Galligan, dated 10/11/96 re withdrawal of NYC NASW's motion and supporting memorandum filed on 10/8/96 (emil) Modified on 10/16/1996 (Entered: 10/16/1996)
10/16/1996	67	Letter filed addressed to Judge Ward from Craig Levine dated 10/15/96 re request that the Court enter a stip & order regarding letters to be added to the record (emil) (Entered: 10/16/1996)
10/16/1996	68	STIPULATION and ORDER, the following documents were intended to be included in the Court record of this matter, and should therefore be added to the docket of this action: Letter dated 4/2/96, annexed as Exhibit A; Letter dated 4/5/96, annexed as Exhibit B (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (emil) (Entered: 10/17/1996)
10/16/1996	68	Letter filed addressed to Judge Ward from Craig Levine, dated 4/2/96 re: to address the class action status of the claims represented by the now-deceased named plttf, Lawrence B. (emil) (Entered: 10/17/1996)
10/16/1996	68	Letter filed addressed to Judge Ward from Grace Goodman, dated 4/5/96 re: response to plttf's letter dated 4/2/96, concerning the deceased plttf Lawrence B (emil) (Entered: 10/17/1996)
10/16/1996		Memo endorsed on motion; withdrawing [62-1] motion for an order allowing The NYC Chapter of the Nat'l Association of Social Workers to appear as an amicus curiae in this action (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 10/17/1996)
10/28/1996	69	Notice that the original record on appeal has been certified and transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals (emil) (Entered: 10/30/1996)
11/08/1996	70	STIPULATION and ORDER, regarding documents to be added to the docket of this action (copies of these documents are attached to this Stip as exhibits): Letter dated 2/13/96; Letter dated 2/13/96; Letter dated 2/9/96; Letter dated 2/13/96 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (emil) (Entered: 11/12/1996)
11/08/1996	70	Copy of Letter addressed to Judge Ward from Carolyn A. Kubitschek dated 2/13/96. (Docketed as per Stip & Order of Judge Ward) (emil) (Entered: 11/12/1996)
11/08/1996	70	Copy of Letter addressed to Judge Ward from Marcia Robinson Lowry dated 2/13/96. (Docketed as per Stip & Order of Judge Ward) (emil) (Entered: 11/12/1996)
11/08/1996	70	Copy of Letter addressed to Judge Ward from Geoffrey A. Mort, dated 2/9/96. (Docketed as per Stip & Order of Judge Ward) (emil) (Entered: 11/12/1996)
11/08/1996	70	Copy of Letter addressed to Judge Ward from Steven M. Conolly, dated 2/13/96. (Docketed as Stip & Order of Judge Ward) (emil) (Entered: 11/12/1996)
11/22/1996		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 11/25/1996)

12/02/1996	71	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 10/9/96 (emil) (Entered: 12/02/1996)
12/16/1996		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 12/17/1996)
01/02/1997	72	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of 11/22/96 (ls) (Entered: 01/02/1997)
01/03/1997	73	Filed Memo-Endorsement on letter to USMJ, Francis from dated 12/26/96, In Re: extending time....plttf shall answer by 1/31/97 and defts may reply by 2/14/97. Plttf shall send copies of all correspondence to defts' counsel (signed by Magistrate Judge James C. Francis IV) (kg) (Entered: 01/06/1997)
01/17/1997	74	STIPULATION and ORDER, extending time to 1/31/97 for defts to respond to plttfs' Second Requests for Admissions (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (emil) (Entered: 01/17/1997)
01/29/1997	75	STIPULATION and ORDER, a jointly selected Case Review Team, agreed upon by the parties, is appointed by the Court to conduct a case record review. The Case Review Team consists of the Center for the Study of Social Policy, the United Way of New York City, and a designee of the NYS Dept. of Social Services who shall act w/ absolute neutrality in the conduct of this case record review and not as a representative of the state defts (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (emil) (Entered: 01/29/1997)
02/07/1997	76	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 12/16/96 (emil) (Entered: 02/10/1997)
02/11/1997		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 02/14/1997)
02/24/1997	77	STIPULATION and ORDER, inadvertent production of any documents that would be subject to a claim of privilege will not be deemed a waiver of that privilege, and the party receiving such a document shall return it promptly upon its identification as privileged, without making a copy (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (emil) (Entered: 02/25/1997)
03/07/1997		Pre-trial conference held (emil) (Entered: 03/10/1997)
03/10/1997	78	SCHEDULING ORDER: Discovery cutoff 10/1/97; Joint Pretrial Order or motion(s) for summary judgment to be submitted on or before 10/31/97; in the event any plttf fails to comply w/ the Court's direction, or to seek an extension by timely application, the Court on its own motion will dismiss plttf's claim for lack of prosecution. In the event that any debt fails to comply w/ this or any subsequent scheduling order or to seek an extension by timely application, the debt's answer will be stricken, and the Court shall enter appropriate injunctive relief in favor of plttfs and against such debt upon a default judgment (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 03/11/1997)
03/10/1997	79	ORDER, the Clerk of the Court is to accept the funds (for case record review) for deposit and subsequently transfer them to the CRIS, interest bearing account in the name of "Marisol v. Giuliani Case Record Review". The Clerk of the Court shall deduct from the income on the investment a fee not exceeding the fee authorized by the Judicial Conference of the U.S. and set by the Director of the Administrative Office equal to 10% of the income earned for deduction in the investment so held without further order of the Court. Withdrawal of the funds may only be effected by further order of this Court (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. Sent to Cashier's Office on 3/11/97. (emil) (Entered: 03/11/1997)
03/14/1997	80	STIPULATION and ORDER, regarding the integrity of records included in the joint case record review. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (kg) (Entered: 03/14/1997)
03/14/1997	81	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. for an order directing defts to provide documentary discovery withheld, and permitting deposition inquiries blocked, on the basis of deliberative privilege, and to provide the parties w/ guidance regarding the scope of said privilege in this litigation , Return date not indicated. Fld in night deposit on 3/14/97 at 11:57 p.m. (emil) (Entered: 03/17/1997)

03/14/1997	82	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in support of [81-1] motion for an order directing defts to provide documentary discovery withheld, and permitting deposition inquiries blocked, on the basis of deliberative privilege, and to provide the parties w/ guidance regarding the scope of said privilege in this litigation. Fld in night deposit on 3/14/97 at 11:58 p.m. (emil) (Entered: 03/17/1997)
03/21/1997	83	STIPULATION and ORDER, the original paragraph 9 of the Stip & Order Establishing a Joint Case Record Review, entered by the Court on 1/28/97, is null and void. Paragraph 9 shall now hold as follows: 9. The plttfs, city defts & state defts shall share equally in all costs associated w/ the case record review, as specified in a budget to be submitted to the parties by the Case Review Team, which budget thall include a payment mechanism acceptable to the Case Review Team. The state defts shall be entitled to credit against their financial obligation in the amount of the reasonable value of the time spent on the case record review by their designated member of the Case Review Team and any other DSS employee who, at the request of the Case Review Team, may make a high-level contribution to the case record review of the sort for which the members of the Case Review Team from CSSP and UWNYP are compensated. The plttfs shall be entitled to a credit against their financial obligation in the amount of the reasonable value of the contribution to the case record review made by CSSP. CSSP agrees and is ordered never to bill or otherwise charge any of the parties herein for any portion of CSSP's work on, or expenses incurred in connection with, the case record review. In the event that either the city defts or the state defts do not accept the budget, those defts have the right to withdraw from this agreement (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (emil) (Entered: 03/21/1997)
04/01/1997	84	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons in opposition to [81-1] motion for an order directing defts to provide documentary discovery withheld, and permitting deposition inquiries blocked, on the basis of deliberative privilege, and to provide the parties w/ guidance regarding the scope of said privilege in this litigation (emil) (Entered: 04/02/1997)
04/01/1997	85	SUPPLEMENTAL AFFIDAVIT of Nicholas Scoppetta by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons Re: [81-1] motion for an order directing defts to provide documentary discovery withheld, and permitting deposition inquiries blocked, on the basis of deliberative privilege, and to provide the parties w/ guidance regarding the scope of said privilege in this litigation (emil) (Entered: 04/02/1997)
04/03/1997	86	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 2/11/97 (emil) (Entered: 04/04/1997)
04/03/1997	87	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in further support re: [81-1] motion for an order directing defts to provide documentary discovery withheld, and permitting deposition inquiries blocked, on the basis deliberative privilege, and to provide the parties w/ guidance regarding the scope of said privilege in this litigation. Fld in night deposit on 4/3/97 at 3:51 a.m. (emil) (Entered: 04/04/1997)
04/10/1997	88	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. by Carol A. Marcus (emil) (Entered: 04/14/1997)
04/16/1997		Pre-trial conference held (as to City Defts only) (emil) (Entered: 04/17/1997)
04/18/1997		Motion hearing held re: City Defts' Order to Show Cause for TRO; Application withdrawn purs. to oral representation by plttf to comply voluntarily (emil) (Entered: 04/22/1997)
04/18/1997		Pre-trial conference held as to State Defts only (emil) (Entered: 04/22/1997)
04/18/1997	89	ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE by City Defendants; Show Cause Hearing set for 10:00 a.m. on 5/8/97 to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action , prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Children's Services, except as may be permitted by law , to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 04/22/1997)

04/18/1997	89	AFFIDAVIT OF CHRISTOPHER in support by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta Re: [89-1] motion to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action, [89-2] motion prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Children's Services, except as may be permitted by law, [89-3] motion to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action. (dcap) (Entered: 07/15/1998)
04/18/1997	90	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of [89-1] motion to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action, [89-2] motion prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Children's Services, except as may be permitted by law, [89-3] motion to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action. (dcap) (Entered: 07/15/1998)
04/28/1997	91	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to [89-1] motion to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action, [89-2] motion prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Children's Services, except as may be permitted by law, [89-3] motion to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action. (email) (Entered: 04/28/1997)
05/01/1997	92	ORDER, for Rebecca Kim Kimura to withdraw as attorney as counsel for plttfs (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (email) (Entered: 05/02/1997)
05/02/1997	93	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to withdraw the Notice of Appearance of Carol A. Marcus , Return date not indicated. Affidavit in support attached. (email) (Entered: 05/05/1997)
05/08/1997	94	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 3/7/97 (email) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/08/1997		Motion hearing held re: [93-1] motion to withdraw the Notice of Appearance of Carol A. Marcus, [89-1] motion to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action, [89-2] motion prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Services, except as may be permitted by law, [89-3] motion to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action., [81-1] motion for an order directing depts to provide documentary discovery withheld, and permitting deposition inquiries blocked, on the basis of deliberative privilege, and to provide the parties w/ guidance regarding the scope of said privilege in this litigation (email) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/08/1997	95	AFFIDAVIT in support of Christopher Juge by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons Re: [89-1] motion to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action, [89-2] motion prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Children's Services, except as may be permitted by law, [89-3] motion to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action. (email) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/08/1997	96	AFFIDAVIT in support of Robert L. Little by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons Re: [89-1] motion to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action, [89-2] motion prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Children's Services, except as may be permitted by law, [89-3] motion to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action. (email) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/08/1997		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [93-1] motion to withdraw the Notice of Appearance of Carol A. Marcus (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (email) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/08/1997		Memo endorsed on motion, doc. #81, the within motion to compel discovery withheld on the basis of deliberative privilege disposed of in accordance w/ Memorandum Decision filed this date (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (email) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/08/1997	97	ORDER/MEMORANDUM DECISION, plttfs move (doc. #81) for an order directing depts to provide documentary discovery withheld and to permit deposition inquiries

		objected to on the basis of the deliberative privilege and to provide the parties w/ guidance regarding the scope of the privilege in this litigation. After having briefed the matter, the parties appeared before the Court on 4/16/97. It was agreed that plttfs would specify a representative number of documents which the Court would review in camera. By letter dated 4/18/97, plttfs presented a list of representative documents for which individual in camera review was sought. The Court has reviewed the documents and rules upon the objections as set forth in this Memorandum Decision (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/08/1997	98	ORDER, plttf's motion to withdraw the Notice of Appearance of Carol A. Marcus is granted and Ms. Marcus' Notice of Appearance, filed on 4/10/97, is deemed withdrawn (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 05/09/1997)
05/09/1997	99	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. by Rose E. Firestein (emil) (Entered: 05/12/1997)
05/09/1997	100	Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial/After Initial Case Mgmt. Conference held by Dist. Judge (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Referred to Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton (emil) (Entered: 05/12/1997)
05/12/1997	101	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. by David M. Brodsky (emil) (Entered: 05/13/1997)
05/13/1997	102	Objection(s) by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Kathryn Croft and Nicholas Scoppetta to plttfs' First Updated Document Request (emil) (Entered: 05/14/1997)
05/13/1997		Evidentiary hearing held on plttfs' application for a TRO (emil) (Entered: 05/15/1997)
05/14/1997		Evidentiary hearing held on plttfs' application for a TRO. Application granted as modified by the Court. (emil) (Entered: 05/15/1997)
05/14/1997		Memo endorsed on motion; denying as moot [89-1] motion to disqualify Carol Marcus from this action; denying as moot [89-2] motion prohibiting Carol Marcus from disclosing any confidences or secrets she acquired while employed at the Administration for Children's Services, except as may be permitted by law; denying as moot [89-3] motion to disqualify Children's Right Inc. from this action. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 05/15/1997)
05/14/1997	105	ORDER, that portion of the city defts' Motion to Disqualify Counsel as seeks to disqualify Carol A. Marcus as counsel for plttfs in this matter is denied as moot. That portion of the city defts' Motion to Disqualify Counsel as seeks to disqualify other attys from Children's Rights, Inc. as counsel for plttfs is also denied as moot (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 05/15/1997)
05/15/1997	103	AMENDED ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I.; Show Cause Hearing set for 9:30 5/22/97 for a preliminary and permanent injunction , for temporary restraining order (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) Modified on 05/15/1997 (Entered: 05/15/1997)
05/15/1997	104	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in support of [103-1] motion for a preliminary and permanent injunction, [103-2] motion for a temporary restraining order (emil) (Entered: 05/15/1997)
05/28/1997		Memo endorsed on motion; [103-1] motion for a preliminary and permanent injunction, [103-2] motion for temporary restraining order. Defts have agreed to extend the temporary restraining order to 6/12/97. Return date reset to 6/12/97 for [103-1] motion for a preliminary and permanent injunction, 6/12/97 for [103-2] motion for temporary restraining order (signed Judge Miriam G. Cedarbaum, Part I); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 05/29/1997)
06/03/1997	106	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of April 16, 1997. (sac) (Entered: 06/03/1997)

06/03/1997	107	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of April 18, 1997. (sac) (Entered: 06/03/1997)
06/12/1997	108	ORDER, Return date reset to 6/27/97 @10:00 for [103-1] motion for a preliminary and permanent injunction ; the TRO issued on 5/14/97 is extended to 6/27/97 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 06/13/1997)
06/16/1997		Discovery conference (contested issue) held on 6/16/97 before USMJ Eaton (ls) (Entered: 06/17/1997)
06/24/1997	109	ORDER, that the Court authorized disclosure of information contained in files in completed adoptions for the purpose of conducting the joint case review in connection with this case; all records so disclosed shall be maintained in accordance with the terms and conditions for record retention and maintenance set forth in this Court's prior orders dated 1/128/97 and 3/13/97 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 06/24/1997)
06/24/1997	110	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, as per "Must the State produce documents from 1/1/90 or from 1/1/94?" the State is directed to send plttfs, by 7/1/97 by fax and be mail, an answer to the following (see doc.); As per "Must the State produce copies of all the documents it received from the City" the plttfs are directed to provide the State with (a) set of relevant City documents that required some sort of action by the NYDSS, (b) a list describing these documents and giving each a #, (c) a list of specific State officials (12 at most), Within 21 days of receipt, the State shall perform the 3 "tasks" described on page 3 etc.; As per "Must the City answer the second request for admissions" it will be a satisfactory response if the City cites and adopts a pertinent portion of the updated case review; as per "The plttfs' request for futher in camera review of documents" I sustain the City's invocation of privilege as to documents #1, 13, 7, 18, 19 and 20, the City is directed to sent an in camera affidavit by 7/1/97 by fax and be mail answering the following questions (see doc.) (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 06/26/1997)
06/27/1997	111	ORDER, reset show cause hearing for 10:00 a.m. 7/9/97, for preliminary & permanent injunction and temporary restraining order (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kg) Modified on 06/27/1997 (Entered: 06/27/1997)
07/01/1997	112	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER: In response to my 6/24/97 Memorandum and Order, Grace Goodman submitted an in camera affidavit dtd 6/27/97. I now sustain the City's invocation of privilege as to documents #5 and 11. In document #5 the four sentences that I singled out in my prior order contain opinions themselves, and are intertwined with additional opinions and recommendations. Document #11 was a handwritten draft by Julie Lilien for John Linder's eyes only, suggesting a format for recording some of the SupCon data (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (kg) Modified on 07/02/1997 (Entered: 07/02/1997)
07/01/1997	121	ORDER, authorizing interim payment of expenses to United Way of NYC from CRIS Acct 95cv10533: the Clerk of the Court is directed to arrange for the transfer of \$71,855.60 from the funds currently held by CRIS in acct #95cxv10533, to the Registry of this Court; the Clerk of the Court is to prepare a check in the amount of \$71,855.60 made payable to "United Way of New York City" and advise Mr. David Daykin, Director of Research that he may pick it up or arrange for mailing. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 07/16/1997)
07/09/1997	113	ORDER, reset show cause hearing for 10:00 a.m. 7/18/97 ; extending time of the TRO issued on 5/14/97 is extended to 7/18/97 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kg) (Entered: 07/09/1997)
07/09/1997	114	NOTICE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to take deposition of Phyllis Boyd and Paula Porter on 8/7/97; subpoena(s) issued. (kg) (Entered: 07/10/1997)
07/09/1997	115	NOTICE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., H., Stephen I. to take deposition of Nina Melito on subpoena(s) issued. (kg) (Entered: 07/10/1997)
07/09/1997	116	NOTICE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., H., Stephen I. to take deposition of Curtis Still on 8/14/97; subpoena(s) issued. (kg) (Entered: 07/10/1997)

07/09/1997	117	Objection(s) to [110-1] order as per "Must the State produce documents from 1/1/90 or from 1/1/94?" the State is directed to send plttfs, by 7/1/97 by fax and be mail, an answer to the following (see doc.); As per "Must the State produce copies of all the documents it received from the City" the plttfs are directed to provide the State with (a) set of relevant City documents that required some sort of action by the NYDSS, (b) a list describing these documents and giving each a #, (c) a list of specific State officials (12 at most), Within 21 days of receipt, the State shall perform the 3 "tasks" described on page 3 etc.; As per "Must the City answer the second request for admissions" it will be a satisfactory response if the City cites and adopts a pertinent portion of the updated case review; as per "The plttfs' request for futher in camera review of documents" I sustain the City's invocation of privilege as to documents #1, 13, 7, 18, 19 and 20, the City is directed to sent an in camera affidavit by 7/1/97 by fax and be mail answering the following questions (see doc.) by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. (kg) (Entered: 07/10/1997)
07/10/1997	118	Before MJ Eaton; Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 6/16/97 (cd) (Entered: 07/11/1997)
07/10/1997		Remark by Cashier's Office on doc. #121 (page 2), on 7/10/97 the following transaction was made: Received Check #447650 in the amount of \$71,855.60 payable to United Way of New York City, mailed 7/10/97 to attn: Valerie Moore as per David Daykin. (lam) (Entered: 07/16/1997)
07/14/1997	122	AFFIDAVIT in opposition of Joseph E. Nitsche , for the State Defts, to the plttfs' request for review of the 6/24/97 Memorandum and Order of US Magistrate Eaton. (lam) (Entered: 07/16/1997)
07/14/1997	123	RESPONSE by State Defts to plttfs' objections Re: [117-1] to the 6/24/97 Memorandum and Order of Magistrate Judge Eaton re [110-1] order as per "Must the State produce documents from 1/1/90 or from 1/1/94?" the State is directed to send plttfs, by 7/1/97 by fax and be mail, an answer to the following (see doc.); As per "Must the State produce copies of all the documents it received from the City" the plttfs are directed to provide the State with (a) set of relevant City documents that required some sort of action by the NYDSS, (b) a list describing these documents and giving each a #, (c) a list of specific State officials (12 at most), Within 21 days of receipt, the State shall perform the 3 "tasks" described on page 3 etc.; As per "Must the City answer the second request for admissions" it will be a satisfactory response if the City cites and adopts a pertinent portion of the updated case review; as per "The plttfs' request for futher in camera review of documents" I sustain the City's invocation of privilege as to documents #1, 13, 7, 18, 19 and 20, the City is directed to sent an in camera affidavit by 7/1/97 by fax and be mail answering the following questions (see doc.) (lam) (Entered: 07/16/1997)
07/15/1997	119	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 5/8/97 @10:00 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 07/15/1997)
07/15/1997	120	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 5/13 and 5/14/97 before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 07/15/1997)
07/17/1997	124	STIPULATION and ORDER, the State defts may assert the atty-client, work product and/or the self-evaluative or deliberative process privilege to any document inadvertently produced to plttfs' counsel in response to plttfs' counsel's letter of 6/24/97, and that plttfs will not assert that such inadvertent production constitutes a waiver of the privilege. Plttfs, however, reserve their right to argue the privilege does not apply to a document so identified, but we will not do so on the basis of its inadvertent production. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward) (lam) (Entered: 07/18/1997)
07/18/1997		Memo endorsed on motion; withdrawing [103-1] motion for a preliminary and permanent injunction, withdrawing [103-2] motion for temporary restraining order (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 07/21/1997)
07/18/1997	125	INTERIM STIPULATION and ORDER concerning overnights at pre-placement (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (lam) (Entered: 07/22/1997)
07/22/1997	126	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. re: [122-1] affidavit, and in support of their objections to the 6/24/97 Memorandum and order of

		Magistrate Judge Eaton re [117-1]. (lam) (Entered: 07/23/1997)
08/06/1997		Hearing begun and concluded : Pltff's objections to Magistrate Judge Eaton's decision of 6/24/97 (purs to Rule 72(A_ FRCP); Decision reserved. Submitted by Michael Guaranich, Deputy Court Clerk. (lam) (Entered: 08/07/1997)
09/10/1997		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 09/11/1997)
09/11/1997	127	Letter filed by Marcia Robinson Lowry of Children's Rights by pltffs Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. dated 9/8/97 re raising several issues involving the city defts; important, long-requested and relevand discovery documents are still not being produced by defts and that defts are, in essence, being permitted to extend the trial date by failing to devote sufficient resources to this case. Seeking the Court's assistance in establishing deadlines for outstanding discovery. (lam) (Entered: 09/11/1997)
09/11/1997	128	Letter filed by Grace Goodman, Asst Corp Counsel, atty for City Defts dated 9/9/97 re stating City defts' position on the items understood to be on the agenda for the conference now scheduled fot 9/10/97 @2:00. (lam) (Entered: 09/11/1997)
09/11/1997	129	Letter filed by Grace Goodman, Asst Corp Counsel, atty for City defts dated 9/9/97 re response in detail to the letter from pltffs' counsel, Children's Rights Inc. dated 9/8/97. (lam) (Entered: 09/11/1997)
09/11/1997	130	Letter filed by Thomas F. Curnin, atty for pltffs Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. dated 9/9/97 re to bring to the attention of the Court instances in which the State defts have failed to respond to long-standing requests made by pltffs for documents and other information. Pltffs request the Court to order the State defts to comply with pltffs' requests. (lam) (Entered: 09/11/1997)
09/11/1997	131	Letter filed by Judith T. Kramer, Asst Atty General, atty for the State defts dated 9/9/97 re response to pltffs' letter to the Court dated 9/9/97 regarding alleged outstanding discovery. (lam) (Entered: 09/11/1997)
09/11/1997	132	Letter filed by Marcia Robinson Lowry of Children's Rights by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. dated 9/10/97 re in response to several of the assertions in defts' several letters of 9/9/97, and to report on a development since our most recent submission. (lam) (Entered: 09/11/1997)
09/15/1997		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward as to State Defts only. (lam) (Entered: 09/18/1997)
09/17/1997	133	AFFIDAVIT in opposition of Brian J. Wing to the pltffs' request for copies of any and all documents related to the reorganization of the NYS Dept. of Social Services. (lam) (Entered: 09/18/1997)
09/19/1997	134	NOTICE OF MOTION by City defts' for protective order purs to FRCP 26(c), preventing the release of or disclosure to any non-party of the "Case Record Review Reports" prepared in connection with this suit until the time that these Reports have been received in evidence at the trial . With affidavit attached. Return date 9/25/97. (lam) Modified on 09/22/1997 (Entered: 09/22/1997)
09/19/1997	135	MEMORANDUM by City defts' in support of [134-1] motion for protective order purs to FRCP 26(c), preventing the release of or disclosure to any non-party of the "Case Record Review Reports" prepared in connection with this suit until the time that these Reports have been received in evidence at the trial (lam) (Entered: 09/22/1997)
09/23/1997	136	MEMORANDUM of Amicus Curiae The New York Times Co. in opposition to City deft's [134-1] motion for protective order purs to FRCP 26(c), preventing the release of or disclosure to any non-party of the "Case Record Review Reports" prepared in connection with this suit until the time that these Reports have been received in evidence at the trial (lam) (Entered: 09/24/1997)
09/23/1997		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 09/24/1997)

09/24/1997	137	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to the City defts' [134-1] motion for protective order purs to FRCP 26(c), preventing the release of or disclosure to any non-party of the "Case Record Review Reports" prepared in connection with this suit until the time that these Reports have been received in evidence at the trial (lam) (Entered: 09/24/1997)
09/25/1997	138	REPLY MEMORANDUM by City Defendants re: [134-1] motion for protective order purs to FRCP 26(c), preventing the release of or disclosure to any non-party of the "Case Record Review Reports" prepared in connection with this suit until the time that these Reports have been received in evidence at the trial (lam) (Entered: 09/26/1997)
10/01/1997		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 10/02/1997)
10/02/1997	139	AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER, vacating the Scheduling Order dated 3/7/97; by 10/10/97 defts shall serve and file written interrogatories ascertaining from plttfs the information deemed necessary by the Court of Appeals; by 11/10/97 plttfs shall serve answers to defts' interrogatories; by 11/14/97 the parties shall set a firm schedule for all noticed depositions, and for the production of all outstanding discovery and shall advise the Court of the schedule; by 12/31/97 the parties shall complete all factual discovery; by 1/9/98 plttfs shall serve their expert reports on defts; by 1/19/98 defts shall serve their expert reports on plttfs; by 2/9/98 all depositions of plttfs' expert witnesses shall be completed; by 2/18/98 all depositions of expert witnesses shall be completed; reset joint pretrial order to be submitted on or before 3/18/98 ; final pretrial conference for 10:00 3/23/98; by 3/27/98 @12:00 the parties shall file their proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law; the trial shall commence on 3/30/98 @10:00; if any party fails to comply with this scheduling order or to seek an extension by timely application, the Court, on motion of the parties or on its own motion, shall issue such orders as it deems necessary, including, but not limited to, orders of preclusion, contempt, dismissal, and an order striking a deft's answer, providing for an inquest and the entry of a default judgment (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward) ; Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 10/02/1997)
10/10/1997		Memo endorsed on motion; denying in accordance with memorandum decision filed herewith [134-1] motion for protective order purs to FRCP 26(c), preventing the release of or disclosure to any non-party of the "Case Record Review Reports" prepared in connection with this suit until the time that these Reports have been received in evidence at the trial (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 10/10/1997)
10/10/1997	140	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER denying [134-1] motion for protective order purs to FRCP 26(c), preventing the release of or disclosure to any non-party of the "Case Record Review Reports" prepared in connection with this suit until the time that these Reports have been received in evidence at the trial. The presumption of access to the Report is strong due to the likelihood that the Report will play a significant role in the Court's exercise of Article III power in this case, and the public's interest in this litigation. Moreover, defts have failed to show good cause for the issuance of a protective order. In light of the public's interest in monitoring both the Article III functions of this Court and the operations of ACS and DSS, it would be impovident of the Court to delay release of the Report. Therefore, defts' motion for a protective order purs to Rule 36(c), FRCP is denied. Notwithstanding the denial of the motion for a protective order, release of the Report shall be stayed until 10/16/97 @5:00pm, to afford defts the opportunity to apply to the Court of Appeals for a further stay if so advised. Absent a stay from the Court of Appeals, the Report will be filed with the Clerk of the Court on 10/17/97 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 10/10/1997)
10/14/1997	141	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 8/6/97 @10:00 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 10/14/1997)
10/14/1997	142	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 10/1/97 @1:15 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 10/14/1997)
10/14/1997	143	NOTICE OF APPEAL by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. ; from [140-1] order Notwithstanding the denial of the motion for a protective order, release of the Report shall be stayed until 10/16/97 @5:00pm, to afford defts the opportunity to apply to the

		Court of Appeals for a further stay if so advised. Absent a stay from the Court of Appeals, the Report will be filed with the Clerk of the Court on 10/17/97, [140-2] relief . Copies of notice of appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: David M. Brodsky . \$105.00 Appeal filing fee paid on receipt # E 299329 on October 14, 1997. (dt) (Entered: 10/15/1997)
10/17/1997	144	True Copy of Order from the USCA RE: Ordered that the motion for temporary stay pending the appeal is hereby granted pending consideration of this motion by the three judge panel sitting 10/21/97. GEORGE LANGE III, CLERK. (kk) (Entered: 10/20/1997)
10/21/1997		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 10/21/1997)
10/21/1997	145	Case Record Review: Services to Families with Open Indicated Cases (lam) (Entered: 10/21/1997)
10/21/1997	146	MANDATE OF USCA (certified copy) Re: [143-1] appeal by Stephen I., Brandon H., Victoria G., Bill G., David F., Darren F., Ozzie E., Shauna D., Thomas C., Lawrence B., Marisol A. It is now hereby ordered, adjudged, and decreed that the order be and it hereby affirmed. (96-9132,96-9134) George Lange, III, Clerk, USCA. (as) (Entered: 10/23/1997)
10/31/1997		pre-trial conference held and concluded before Judge Ward on 10/31/97 (ls) (Entered: 11/03/1997)
11/10/1997	147	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 9/15/97 @12:00 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 11/10/1997)
11/10/1997	148	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 9/10/97 @2:10 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 11/10/1997)
11/10/1997	149	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 9/21/97 @10:15 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 11/10/1997)
11/10/1997	150	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 9/10/97 @10:00 before Judge Pitman. (lam) (Entered: 11/10/1997)
11/12/1997	151	RESPONSE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, George E. Pataki Re: City defts' First Set of Interrogatories dated 10/10/97. (lam) (Entered: 11/12/1997)
11/12/1997	152	RESPONSE by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, George E. Pataki Re: State defts' First Set of Interrogatories dated 10/9/97. (lam) (Entered: 11/12/1997)
11/18/1997	153	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, I am responding to the 11/17/97 joint letter from Mr. Curnin and Ms. Stanch; I have reviewed in camera the unredacted copy of Document C 707, which was marked as Fazio Exhibit 4 and is a one-page memorandum dated 1/14/97 from ACS employee Michael Ng to Deputy Commissioner Linda Gibbs; I sustain the City's invocation of the deliberative process privilege (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 11/19/1997)
12/01/1997	154	MANDATE OF USCA (certified copy) Re: It is hereby ordered that docket number 97-9294 is deleted as to this appeal. (97-9282, 97-9294) George Lange, III, Clerk, USCA. (as) (Entered: 12/02/1997)
12/05/1997	155	Case Record Review: Services to Children in Foster Care and their families; prepared by Marisol Joint Case Review Team, December, 1997 (lam) (Entered: 12/05/1997)
12/08/1997	156	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, in response to the joint letter from Mr. Curnin and Ms Goodman dated 12/4/97, I permit the plttfs to name up to 15 employees of the Administration for Children's Services; I direct the City defts to cause the files of those named employees to be searched for documents responsive to Items 1 through 13 in Plttfs' Tenth Request for Production of Documents from the City defts -- and to produce the documents within 14 days of the receipt of the plttfs' list of names (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 12/09/1997)

12/09/1997	157	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 10/31/97 @ 10:35 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/09/1997)
12/09/1997	158	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 10/21/97 @ 10:00 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/09/1997)
12/09/1997	159	NOTICE OF MOTION by City defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to quash deposition of Howard Wilson . With declaration attached. Return date 12/17/97 @ 10:00. (lam) (Entered: 12/11/1997)
12/09/1997	160	ORDER, authorizing partial payment of expenses to United Way of New York City from CRIS acct 95-civ-10533: the Clerk of the Court is directed to arrange for the transfer of \$64,431.58, the entire amount currently held by the CRIS in acct #95-civ-10533, to the Registry of this Court; the Clerk of the Court is to prepare a check for \$64,431.58 made payable to "United Way of New York City" and advise David Daykin, Director of Research, United Way of New York City that he may pick it up or make arrangements for the mailing of the check (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 12/16/1997)
12/11/1997		Remark by Cashiers Office on doc. #160 (page 2) on 12/11/97 the following transaction was made: Received Check #460081 in the amount of \$64,431.58 payable to United Way of NYC; mailed 12/12/97. (lam) (Entered: 12/16/1997)
12/15/1997	161	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to [159-1] motion to quash deposition of Howard Wilson (lam) (Entered: 12/17/1997)
12/15/1997		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/17/1997)
12/16/1997		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/17/1997)
12/16/1997	162	SECOND AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: Factual Discovery cutoff 1/30/98; plfff's shall serve their expert reports on defts by 2/6/98; all depositions of plfffs' expert witnesses due by 3/6/98; defts to serve their expert reports on plfffs by 3/6/98; Joint Pretrial order to be submitted on or before 4/1/98; Final Pretrial conference set for 10:00 4/6/98 which shall include motions in limine; all deposition of expert witnesses by 4/6/98; parties shall file proposed findings fact and conclusions of law by 4/10/98 @ 12:00 noon; the trial shall commence on 4/13/98 @ 10:00; if any party fails to comply with this scheduling order or to seek an by timely application, the Court, on motion of the parties or on its own motion, shall issue such orders as it deems necessary, including, but not limited to, orders of preclusion, contempt, dismissal, and an order striking a deft's answer, providing for an inquest and the entry of a default judgment (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 12/19/1997 (Entered: 12/18/1997)
12/17/1997	163	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta re: in support of [159-1] motion to quash deposition of Howard Wilson (sac) (Entered: 12/23/1997)
12/19/1997		Motion hearing re: [159-1] motion to quash deposition of Howard Wilson. City defts Motion denied in accordance with our decision rendered this date in open Court. (lam) (Entered: 12/19/1997)
12/19/1997		Memo endorsed on motion; denying [159-1] motion to quash deposition of Howard Wilson (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 12/22/1997)
12/24/1997	164	MEMORANDUM by City defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of [159-1] motion to quash deposition of Howard Wilson (lam) (Entered: 12/29/1997)
01/05/1998		Remark by Cashiers Office on doc. # 208 (page 2), on 1/5/98 the following transaction was made: Received check #460596 in the amount of \$13,074.47 payable to United Way of NYC; mailed on 1/5/98. (lam) (Entered: 02/20/1998)
01/05/1998	318	ORDER granting [317-1] endorsed motion for Craig Levine, Children's Rights, Inc. to withdraw as attorney; Motion granted (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 01/07/1999)

01/16/1998	165	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible following the return date of this motion; hold city defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief . With affidavit attached. Return date 1/30/98 (lam) (Entered: 01/20/1998)
01/16/1998	166	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in support of [165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible following the date of this motion; hold city defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief (lam) (Entered: 01/20/1998)
01/20/1998	170	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to quash , and for protective order pursuant ot F.R. Civ. Pro. 26 (c) precluding the deposition of defendant Giuliani Return date 1/28/98. Attached Declaration of Margaret G. King (ys) (Entered: 01/22/1998)
01/20/1998	171	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of [170-1] motion to quash, [170-2] motion for protective order pursuant ot F.R. Civ. Pro. 26 (c) precluding the deposition of defendant Giuliani (ys) (Entered: 01/22/1998)
01/20/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 01/26/1998)
01/20/1998	208	ORDER, authorizing payment of expenses to United Way of New York City from CRIS Account 95civ10533: that the Clerk of the Court, having received additional funds on 12/18/97, is directed to arrange for the transfer of \$13,074.47, the balance of payment requested by the application dated 10/6/97, from the funds currently held by the CRIS in acct #95cv10533, to the Registry of this Court; that the Clerk of the Court prepare a check in the amount of \$13,074.47 payable to "United Way of New York City" and advise David Daykin for pick up or to arrange for mailing (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 02/20/1998)
01/21/1998	167	THIRD AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: no party shall request any further discovery, except for specific documents identified during oral deposition, as of 1/21/98 @5:00; setting factual Discovery cutoff 2/20/98; plttfs shall serve their expert reports on defts by 2/27/98; all depositions of plttfs' expert witnesses by 3/27/98; defts shall serve their expert reports on plttfs by 3/27/98; all depositions of expert witnesses by 4/17/98; A Joint Pretrial order to be submitted on or before 4/20/98; A Final Pretrial conference is set for 10:00 4/22/98; the parties shall file their proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law by 4/24/98 @12:00 noon; the trial shall commence on 4/27/98 @10:00; if any party fails to comply with this scheduling order or to seek an extension by timely application, the Court, on motion of the parties or on its own motion, shall issue such orders as it deems necessary, including but not limited to, orders of preclusion, contempt, dismissal, and an order striking a deft's answer, providing for an inquest and the entry of a default judgment (signed by Judge Robert Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 01/23/1998 (Entered: 01/22/1998)

01/21/1998	168	MEMORANDUM by City Defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of their Motion to Dismiss pre-placement claims and to vacate the "Interim Stipulation and Order" (motion not filed) (lam) (Entered: 01/22/1998)
01/21/1998	169	DECLARATION in support by Grace Goodman, atty for City Defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta re: Motion to dismiss claims and vacate the Stipulation on preplacement. (lam) (Entered: 01/22/1998)
01/22/1998		Remark by Cashiers Office on doc.#207 (page 2), on 1/22/98 the following transaction was made: Received check #462403 in the amount of \$64,758.21 payable to United Way of NYC; mailed 1/23/98. (lam) (Entered: 02/20/1998)
01/23/1998	172	Withdrawal of [143-1] appeal by Stephen I., Brandon H., Victoria G., Bill G., David F., Darren F., Ozzie E., Shauna D., Thomas C., Lawrence B., Marisol A. . (97-9282) George Lange, III, Clerk, USCA. (as) (Entered: 01/26/1998)
01/26/1998	173	NOTICE OF CROSS MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to compel City Defts to respond to certain interrogatories and to compel City Defts to produce certain documents improperly withheld as privileged . With affirmation attached. Return date 2/10/98 @9:30. (lam) (Entered: 01/27/1998)
01/26/1998	174	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to City Defts' Motion to Compel complete responses to the City defts' Second Set of Interrogatories, contention interrogatories and request for the production of documents and things (motion not filed) and in support of plttfs' [173-1] cross motion to compel City Defts to respond to certain interrogatories and to compel City Defts to produce certain documents withheld as privileged (lam) (Entered: 01/27/1998)
01/26/1998	175	AFFIRMATION of Craig R. Levine, atty for plttfs Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. (lam) (Entered: 01/27/1998)
02/02/1998	176	MEMORANDUM by George E. Pataki in support of deft's Motion for Protective Order and to quash the notice of deposition served on Governor Pataki (motion not filed) (lam) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/02/1998	177	AFFIDAVIT in support by George E. Pataki Re: State's motion for a protective order to strike plttfs' notice of deposition (motion not filed) (lam) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/02/1998	178	AFFIDAVIT of Judith T. Kramer, Asst Atty General RE: relevent documents exchanged between the parties (lam) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/03/1998	179	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One – comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been abused or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two – comprised of children in families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three – comprised of children in the custody of the Amdinistration for Children's Services ; to intervene the following 3 additional named plttfs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. ; to substiute Nedda De Castro for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substitue Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Steven I., and to add Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf Marisol A. With affirmation attached. Return date 2/3/98. (lam) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/03/1998	180	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in support of [179-1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One – comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been abused or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two – comprised of children in families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three – comprised of children in the custody of the Amdinistration for Children's Services, [179-2] motion to intervene the following 3 additional named plttfs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., [179-3] motion to substiute Nedda De Castro

		for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substitute Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Steven I., and to add Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf Marisol A. (lam) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/04/1998	181	Reply affidavit of John P. Woods, Asst Corp by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in further support of City defts' motion to compel answers to interrogatories and the production of documents. (lam) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/04/1998	182	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in further support of their motion to compel complete answers to the City defts' Second Set of Interrogatories, Contention Interrogatories and request for the Production of Documents and things. (lam) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/04/1998	183	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER; I am responding to the 2/2/98 joint letter from Mr. Curnin and AAG Kramer. I direct the State to produce to me by 2/5/98 for my in camera review (a) the 13–page preliminary draft written by Judy Gallo and shown to her at her deposition, (b) the "first edited" version of said draft which was edited by John Stupp and (c) an in camera affidavit stating the reasons why the State maintains these documents to be privileged in whole or in part. I am willing to consider whether the State should be required to produce 10 to 12 identified documents created prior to 1994. I direct plttfs to serve a list of these documents, no more than 12 (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (sac) (Entered: 02/05/1998)
02/04/1998	184	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to defts' [170–1] motion to quash, [170–2] motion for protective order pursuant of F.R. Civ. Pro. 26 (c) precluding the deposition of defendant Giuliani (lam) (Entered: 02/06/1998)
02/04/1998	185	AFFIRMATION by Mark G. Peters, an atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: upon review of documents in counsel's files, upon personal knowledge and/or upon information and belief. (lam) (Entered: 02/06/1998)
02/04/1998	186	Reply affidavit of Mark G. Peters, an atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in further support of [173–1] cross motion to compel City Defts to respond to certain interrogatories and to compel City Defts to produce certain documents improperly withheld as privileged (lam) (Entered: 02/06/1998)
02/04/1998	187	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. for leave to file a sur–reply in opposition to City defts' motion to compel complete responses to the City defts' 2nd set of interrogatories, contention interrogatories and requests for the production of documents and things . With Sur–Reply attached. Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 02/06/1998)
02/04/1998	188	AFFIRMATION in support of Craig Levine, an atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: [187–1] motion for leave to file a sur–reply in opposition to City defts' motion to compel complete responses to the City defts' 2nd set of interrogatories, contention interrogatories and requests for the production of and things (lam) (Entered: 02/06/1998)
02/05/1998	193	NOTICE OF MOTION by George E. Pataki for a protective order quashing the notice of deposition for the Governor purs to FRCP 26 . Return date 3/6/98 @9:30. (lam) (Entered: 02/10/1998)
02/06/1998	189	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of December 19, 1997 (bm) (Entered: 02/06/1998)
02/06/1998	190	ORDER, that the Queens County Family Court comply with the Subpoena by transcribing and producing to this Court on or before 2/6/98 @10:00am a written transcript of all sworn testimony and/or any other statements made at the Hearing (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 02/06/1998)

		02/09/1998)
02/06/1998	191	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, by 5:00pm on 2/9/98, the City defts must serve (a) complete answers to Interrogatories 8, 28, 29 and 30 of plttf's Seventh Set, (b) copies of the documents described in Mr. Curnin's 11/13/97 letter to Ms. Stanch, and (c) a copy of the draft Operating Protocol for the Accountability Review Unit, or, in the alternative, copies of all documents that are currently governing the operation of the Accountability Review Unit; I will rule on the other discovery disputes in the near future; until further notice, any future discovery dispute must be submitted in a single joint letter purs to my Standing Order for Discovery Disputes (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed and faxed by Chambers. (lam) Modified on 02/13/1998 (Entered: 02/09/1998)
02/06/1998	192	CLARIFYING ORDER, Sua spone, I wish to clarigy paragraph 1(b) of the Memorandum and Order issued by me this morning; By 5:00 pm on 2/9/98, the City defts must serve copies of all unprivileged documents described in Mr. Curnin's 11/13/97 letter to Ms. Stanch, and a detailed privilege log describing each privileged document if any (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 02/09/1998)
02/09/1998	196	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, I sustain the position, of the State defts objection to producing the draft of a report to be submitted to the Legislature regarding the suspension of 153-d sanctions, except to the following extent: I direct the State defts to produce to plttfs, by 3:00pm on 2/10/98, legible copies of (a) the 2 charts annexed to the draft and referred to as Tables 1 and 2, and (b) the lower half of page 4 (beginning at Sanction Process) and all of pages 5 through 9 of Ms. Gallo's draft; I write further with respect to pages 10 and 11, which contain Ms. Gallo's draft of preliminary recommendations; Mr. Curnin's 2/6/98 letter, near the end, argues that even if I find that these preliminary recommendations are privileged (which I do) I should order that they be turned over at a later date when the final report is issued, I decline to make such an order; I direct only that the State defts turn over the entire final report as soon as it is released; Mr. Curnin also requests an opportunity to examine, purs to FRCP 30(b)(6), the individual most knowlegeable about the report's final recommednation; on this request, he will have to confer with AAG Kramer and then, if there is no agreement, send me a single joint letter (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 02/11/1998)
02/09/1998	197	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, plttf's expert reports are due on 2/27/98; I have decided to require the plttfs to provide also on 2/27/98, additional answers to some of the defts' Second Set of Interrogatories ; except for the rulings in this document, I deny the City defts' [170-1] motion to quash, deny [170-2] motion for protective order pursuant ot F.R. Civ. Pro. 26 (c) precluding the deposition of defendant Giuliani, and including their request for an extension beyond 3/27/98 for serving the defts' expert reports; except for my 2/6/98 rulings I deny plttfs' [173-1] cross motion to compel City Defts to respond to certain interrogatories and to compel City Defts to produce certain documents improperly withheld as privileged (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies faxed and mailed by Chambers. (lam) (Entered: 02/11/1998)
02/10/1998	194	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 12/16/97 @ 10:00am before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 02/10/1998)
02/10/1998	195	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 12/15/97 @ 10:10am before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 02/10/1998)
02/10/1998	198	AFFIDAVIT of Thomas F. Curnin, atty for plttfs Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: to provide the Court with relevant documents. (lam) Modified on 02/23/1998 (Entered: 02/11/1998)
02/10/1998	199	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to [193-1] motion for a protective order quashing the notice of deposition for the Governor purs to FRCP 26 (lam) (Entered: 02/11/1998)
02/10/1998	200	DECLARATION by Grace Gooman, Ast Corp. Counsel, atty for City defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to plttfs'

		[165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible following the return date of this motion; hold city defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief and in support of application by City defts for a modification of the Stipulation to remove any ongoing monitoring provisions. (lam) (Entered: 02/11/1998)
02/10/1998	201	MEMORANDUM by City defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to plttfs' [165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible following the return date of this motion; hold city defts civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief (lam) (Entered: 02/11/1998)
02/10/1998	202	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, in response to the 2/9/98 joint letter from Ms. Lowry and Ms. Rubin 1. Production of unredacted documents, giving the names of the Children and parents in various reports reviewed by Deputy Commissioner William Bell: I direct the City defts to produce unredacted copies of the documents, giving the names of the children and parents, by 2/11/98, unless the City defts serve an affidavit from a knowledgeable official (a) stating that the names of the children and parents were redacted from these reports before they were submitted to Mr. Bell, and (b) specifying what burdens would have to be undertaken by the City defts in order to produce the names to the plttfs; 2. Production of documents relating to the depositions of Featherstone and Fendall: I see no reason why the City defts have no yet produced the Pearlman weekly reports and the Cardieri weekly reports, and the Hassan study; I direct the City defts to produce them by 5:00 on 2/11/98; I direct the City defts to answer the discovery requests relating to Paula Fendall as extensively as possible by 9:30 on 2/11/98, and to give full answers by 2/20/98; Production of the report from the Comptroller's office concerning the performance of OCI investigations: I direct the City defts to produce this report by 9:30 on 2/11/98; Production for in camera review of 36 specified documents: I direct the City defts to submit only 7 documents #7, 8, 9, 18, 23, 32, and 34 in the joint letter -- for in camera review, plus in camera affidavit setting for the the basis for the claims of privilege, by 2/17/98 @11:00 by hand or fax (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed and faxed by Chambers. (lam) (Entered: 02/13/1998)
02/16/1998	207	ORDER, authorizing interim payment of expenses to United Way of New York City from CRIS Account 95civ10533: the Clerk of the Court is directed to arrange for the transfer of \$64,758.21 from the funds currently held by the CRIS in acct #95civ10533, to the Registry of this Court; that the Clerk of the Court prepare forthwith a check in the amount of \$64,758.21 payable to "United Way of New York City" and advise David Daykin for pickup or to arrange for mailing (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 02/20/1998)
02/17/1998	203	ORDER, that the City defts are directed to serve answers to all of the interrogatories in plttfs' 10th and 11th and 12th Sets by 2/20/98 ; the City defts are directed to produce, by 12:00 noon on 2/18/98, all of the documents identified in the 6 page Appendix to the joint letter; the City defts are also directed to produce David Fazio for futher deposition on 2/20/98 from 9:00am to 1:00pm ; the deposition of Elan Melamid is closed; I will reconsider my ruling on the report from the Comptroller's office concerning the performance of OCI investigations; I direct Ms. Rubin to submit it to

		me by 2/20/98 for in camera review, plus an in camera affidavit from an official in the Comptroller's Office setting forth the basis for the claims of privilege (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton) Copies mailed and faxed by Chambers. (lam) (Entered: 02/19/1998)
02/17/1998	204	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta re: in support of [170-1] motion to quash, [170-2] motion for protective order pursuant ot F.R. Civ. Pro. 26 (c) precluding the deposition of defendant Giuliani (lam) (Entered: 02/19/1998)
02/17/1998	205	Reply declaration of Margaret G. King, Asst Corp Counsel for Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of [170-1] motion to quash, [170-2] motion for protective order pursuant ot F.R. Civ. Pro. 26 (c) precluding the deposition of defendant Giuliani (lam) (Entered: 02/19/1998)
02/18/1998	206	STIPULATION and ORDER, that any information provided by any agent or employee of St. Vincents Hospital and Medical Center to the parties in this action shall be subject to the Confidentiality Order dated 5/14/96; any information which has the potential to identify any present or former patient of St. Vincents Hospital shall be kept confidential and shall not be disclosed to any person except as authorized by this Court's previous Order and any reference to any present or future patient shall be by first name and last initial only; in the event that any confidential information is quoted or summarized in any papers filed with the Clerk of the Court, such document shall be filed under seal (signed by Judge Barbara S. Jones). (lam) (Entered: 02/20/1998)
02/18/1998	210	AFFIDAVIT of Judith T. Kramer, Asst Atty General, for the state defts George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing Re: additional relevant documents exchanged between the parties. (lam) (Entered: 02/23/1998)
02/18/1998	211	REPLY MEMORANDUM by George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing re: [199-1] opposition memorandum (lam) (Entered: 02/23/1998)
02/19/1998	209	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, at the end of my 2/10/98 Memorandum and Order, I agreed to conduct an in camera review of documents #7,8,9,18,23,32, and 34 on pages 6-8 of the 2/9/98 joint letter from Ms. Lowry and Ms. Rubin; I have now completed that in camera review; I uphold the City defts' claims of privilege except as follows: I enclose doc. #23 (Bates stamped C 33540) except that I have redacted the 6th "bullet point" and the 11th "bullet point"; I also enclose 1 page from doc. #32 (Bates stamped C 33566) except that I have redacted several lines of pre-decisional, deliberative discussion; there is no need to produce the page Bates stamped C 33570, since it is an exact duplicate of page C 33566 (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed and faxed by Chambers. (lam) Modified on 02/23/1998 (Entered: 02/20/1998)
02/20/1998	212	MEMORANDUM by state defts George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing in opposition to [179-1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One – comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been abused or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two – comprised of children in families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three – comprised of children in the custody of the Amdinistration for Children's Services, [179-2] motion to intervene the following 3 additional named ptffs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., [179-3] motion to substiute Nedda De Castro for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named ptff Shauna D., and to substitue Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named ptff Steven I., and to add Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named ptff Marisol A. (lam) (Entered: 02/23/1998)
02/20/1998	213	AFFIDAVIT of Judith T. Kramer, Asst Atty General, for State Defts George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing Re: with additional relevant documents exchanged betywwen the parties. (lam) (Entered: 02/23/1998)
02/20/1998	214	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to compel answers to the City Defts Third Set of Interrogatories, Contention Interrogatories ; and requests for the production of documents ; and to extend the time for the City Defts to submit expert reports by a period equal to that from 2/2/98 when the ptffs should have submitted complete answers to the Third Set to the date when the ptffs actually submit such answers . Affidavit attached. Return

		date 3/2/98 @9:30. (lam) (Entered: 02/24/1998)
02/20/1998	215	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, responding to the 7 disputes set forth in the 2/19/98 joint letter from Mr. Curnin and Ms. Kramer; (Rule 30(b)(6) Deposition re Final 153-d Report) (Rule 30(b)(6) Deposition re Internal Audit Office) (Rule 30(b)(6) Deposition re Dollar Amounts of Sanctions) by 3/6/98 the State defts must either (a) produce the dollar amounts of sanctions for ACS non-compliance from January 1994 through June 1997, or (b) produce for deposition the person most knowledgeable about the dollar amounts of sanctions; (Documents requested by Pltffs during depositions) all documents requested by any party during a deposition must be produced no later than 10 days after the request, I believe the other portions of Dispute #4 are moot (Child Fatality Database) I direct Mr. Curnin and Ms. Kramer to arrange a telephone conference with me about Dispute #5; (Deposition Notice for Natoli & Gallo) I defer ruling on this dispute, and direct the parties to keep me posted on their efforts to resolve it through compromise; (State's Production of Documents) I believe this dispute is moot (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 02/26/1998 (Entered: 02/24/1998)
02/20/1998	216	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, if the City defts or Mr. Wilson assert any privilege claims to which the pltffs object, I direct Ms. Stanch or Mr. Wilson to submit the disputed document to me by 2/25/98 at 3:00pm for an in camera review, plus an in camera affidavit or affidavits setting forth the basis for the claims of privilege ; I direct Ms. Stanch to produce to pltffs, by 2/27/98 @12:00 noon, all remaining responsive documents in the possession or control of the City defts; I direct Mr. Wilson to produce to pltffs, by 2/27/98 @12:00noon, all documents in his possession or control which are responsive to the document request in the 11/7/97 Notice of Deposition delivered to Mr. Wilson with a cover letter dated 11/12/97 ; I direct Mr. Wilson to appear for deposition on 3/4/98 from 9:30am to 5:30pm at the offices of Cahill Gordon & Reindel (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed and faxed by Chambers. (lam) (Entered: 02/24/1998)
02/23/1998	217	NOTICE OF CROSS MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to dismiss certain pltffs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b) . With declaration attached. Return date 3/6/98 @2:00. (lam) (Entered: 02/24/1998)
02/23/1998	218	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of [217-1] cross motion to dismiss certain pltffs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b) (lam) (Entered: 02/24/1998)
02/23/1998	219	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of their [214-1] motion to compel answers to the City Defts Third Set of Interrogatories, Contention Interrogatories, [214-2] motion requests for the production of documents, [214-3] motion to extend the time for the City Defts to submit expert reports by a period equal to that from 2/2/98 when the pltffs should have submitted complete answers to the Third Set to the date when the pltffs actually submit such answers (lam) (Entered: 02/24/1998)
02/23/1998	220	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. re: in support of their [165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible following the return date of this motion; hold city defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit pltffs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay pltffs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief (lam) (Entered: 02/25/1998)
02/23/1998	221	AFFIDAVIT in support of Rose E. Firestein, atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: [165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as

		possible following the return date of this motion; hold city defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief (lam) (Entered: 02/25/1998)
02/23/1998	222	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to defts' Motion to Dismiss pre-placement claims and to vacate the "Interim Stipulation and Order" (lam) (Entered: 02/25/1998)
02/23/1998	223	AFFIRMATION of Mark Peters, an atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. (lam) (Entered: 02/25/1998)
02/26/1998	224	DECLARATION in opposition by Grace Goodman, Asst Corp Counsel for Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to plttfs' [179-1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One - comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been abused or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two - comprised of children in families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three - comprised of children in the custody of the Amdinistration for Children's Services, [179-2] motion to intervene the following 3 additional named plttfs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., [179-3] motion to substiute Nedda De Castro for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substitue Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Steven I., and to add Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf Marisol A. (lam) (Entered: 02/27/1998)
02/26/1998	225	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to [179-1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One - comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been abused or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two - comprised of children in families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three - comprised of children in the custody of the Amdinistration for Children's Services, [179-2] motion to intervene the following 3 additional named plttfs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., [179-3] motion to substiute Nedda De Castro for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substitue Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Steven I., and to add Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf Marisol A. (lam) (Entered: 02/27/1998)
02/26/1998	226	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, I am responding to the 2/19/98 joint letter from Mr. Levine and Ms. Rubin; I have reconsidered my 2/17/98 order, paragraph 4, which ruled that the deposition of Elan Melamid is closed. The plttfs now propose 2 compromises to take additional discovery from Mr. Melamid -- (a) a further deposition of no longer than 90 minutes or (b) an off-the-record telephone conference of no longer than 90 minutes. I decline to order either one (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 03/02/1998)
02/26/1998	228	Filed Memo-Endorsement on letter to Magistrate Judge Eaton from Linda J. Stanch, atty for the City defts dated 2/25/98, granting the request for an extension of time to produce documents for in camera inspection and in camera affidavits until 2:00pm on 2/26/98 (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton) (lam) (Entered: 03/02/1998)
02/27/1998	227	SUPPLEMENTAI DECLARATION in support by Grace Goodman, Asst Corp Counsel, atty for Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta [217-1] cross motion to dismiss certain plttfs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b). With affidavits attached. (lam) Modified on 03/02/1998 (Entered: 03/02/1998)

02/27/1998	229	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter to Magistrate Judge Eaton from Susan Lambiasa, counsel for plttfs and Betsy J. Witten, counsel for City defts dated 2/25/98, writing to request resolution of a discovery matter. The Defts' position is correct. The only exception would be if the plttfs categorically state that Lyn Slater will not be a witness at the trial (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton) (lam) Modified on 03/03/1998 (Entered: 03/02/1998)
02/27/1998	232	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to defts' [217–1] cross motion to dismiss certain plttfs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b) (lam) (Entered: 03/03/1998)
02/27/1998	233	AFFIDAVIT of Mark G. Peters, atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: upon review of documents in counsel's files, personal knowlege and/or information and belief (lam) (Entered: 03/03/1998)
02/27/1998	234	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in opposition to City Defts' [214–1] motion to compel answers to the City Defts Third Set of Interrogatories, Contention Interrogatories, [214–2] motion requests for the production of documents (lam) (Entered: 03/04/1998)
03/02/1998	230	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, on 2/26/98 Linda Stanch sent me 27 documents; I have reviewed them in camera; I uphold the City defts' assertions of privilege, with the following exceptions ; I direct the City defts to produce, by 3/2/98, document 4 (the City may redact the handwritten notes) and document 16 (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 03/02/1998)
03/02/1998	231	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, further to pages 8–10 of the 2/13/98 joint letter from Craig Levine and Gail Rubin, I have now reviewed in camera: (a) a 2/5/98 Preliminary Draft of a report by the Office of the Comptroller entitled "Review of the Procedures used by the Office of Confidential Investigation to respond to allegations of child abuse or neglect" and (b) a 2/20/98 affidavit of Deputy Comptroller Roger Liwer, asserting privilege and saying he anticipates that a final report will be issued by mid–March; I will give the City defts until 3/17/98, on that date, they must produce (a) the final report or (b) the latest draft redacting only the sections marked "Recommendation", in either event, the City defts must also mail a courtesy copy to me (signed by Magistrate Judge Douglas F. Eaton); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 03/03/1998)
03/03/1998	235	AFFIDAVIT of Ann O'Reilly in Reply to Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion to dismiss Pre–Placement Claims and to Vacate the Interim Stipulation and Order (djc) (Entered: 03/04/1998)
03/03/1998	236	City Defendants' Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of their Motion to Vacate the "Interim Stipulation and Order" (djc) (Entered: 03/04/1998)
03/03/1998	237	AFFIRMATION of Mark G. Peters, an atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: review of documents in counsel's files, upon personal knowledge and/or upon information and belief. (lam) (Entered: 03/05/1998)
03/03/1998	238	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. re: in further support of plttfs' [179–1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One – comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two – comprised of children in families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three – comprised of children in the custody of the Amdinistration for Children's Services, [179–2] motion to intervene the following 3 additional named plttfs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., [179–3] motion to substiute Nedda De Castro for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substiute Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Steven I., and to add Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf Marisol A. (lam) (Entered: 03/05/1998)

03/04/1998	239	REPLY MEMORANDUM by City defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta re: in further support of their [217-1] cross motion to dismiss certain plttfs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b) (lam) (Entered: 03/06/1998)
03/06/1998		Hearing re: pending Motions Re: Designation of sub-classes re to plttfs; Judge Ward's decision reserved (lam) (Entered: 03/12/1998)
03/16/1998	240	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 1/20/98 @2:00 before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 03/16/1998)
03/17/1998	241	SUR-REPLY AFFIDAVIT in further opposition of Ann O'Rielly, by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta Re: to plttfs' [165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon possible following the return date of this motion; defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief (lam) Modified on 03/20/1998 (Entered: 03/20/1998)
03/17/1998	242	SUR-REPLY DECLARATION in opposition by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to plttfs' [165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible following the return date of this motion; hold city defts civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; Order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; Order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief (lam) (Entered: 03/20/1998)
03/23/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [170-1] motion to quash, granting [170-2] motion for protective order pursuant to F.R. Civ. Pro. 26 (c) precluding the deposition of defendant Giuliani (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (djc) (Entered: 03/24/1998)
03/23/1998	243	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER, City defendants' motion to quash the notice of deposition and for a protective order precluding the deposition of Mayor Giuliani is granted. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (djc) (Entered: 03/25/1998)
03/24/1998	244	ORDER FOR EXAMINATION AND REPORT; that purs. to Rule 35 of the F.R.C.P. the "S." children are to submit to a mental examination conducted by Dr. Gary Gosselin or other psychiatric/psychological experts of City defts' choice w/o plttfs' counsel present and w/o audio-taping ; that City defts' experts are to issue a report in the same manner as plttfs' experts ; (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); copies mailed (ls) (Entered: 03/25/1998)
03/26/1998		Before Judge Ward; Pre-trial conference held (cd) (Entered: 03/26/1998)
04/01/1998	245	MEMORANDUM & ORDER; State defts have moved this Court for an order quashing the notice of deposition of George E. Pataki, Governor of the State of NY, and for a protective order precluding the deposition of Governor Pataki purs. to Rule 26(c)(1), (3), (4) of the FRCP. It is ordered that State defts designate witnesses w/ knowledge of the factual information furnished to Governor Pataki on which his decisions were based within 5 business days of the date of this Memorandum & Order and that the depositions of these witnesses be conducted within 10 business days thereafter. It is further ordered that in the event State defts are unwilling or unable to

		comply w/ the foregoing direction that Governor Pataki either furnish an affidavit concerning the issues identified in this Memorandum & Order by 4/15/98 or appear for an oral deposition at a time and place convenient to his schedule but in no event later than 4/30/98 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (emil) (Entered: 04/02/1998)
04/01/1998	246	Memo endorsed on copy of motion, doc. #193; motion disposed of in accordance w/ memorandum & order filed herewith (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (emil) (Entered: 04/02/1998)
04/03/1998	247	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, plaintiffs shall return all copies of two memoranda concerning the adoption of Marisol A. in their possession to Ctiy defendants and these documents are not to be used by plaintiffs in connection with this or any other litigation (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 04/03/1998)
04/03/1998		Memorandum to Docket Clerk: pending motions: plttf's Motion for Contempt; Plttfs' Motion for Intervention; City defts' Motion to Dismiss plttfs' pre-placement claims and to vacate interim Stipulation : 7/17/97; Oral arguments heard; A written Decision to be filed by the Court. (lam) (Entered: 04/07/1998)
04/20/1998	248	ORDER concerning experts' reports and depositions; the City defts, who failed to comply with the Third Amended Scheduling Order dated 1/20/98 which directed that city defts' expert witness reports be served and file by 3/27/98, are to serve and file those reports as follows: all reports with the exception of those from Dr. Gary Gosselin, Robert B. McKeagney, Dr. Fred Wulczyn, Dr. Michael Aronoff, Dr. Glen S. Hirsch and Prof. Laurence Lynn, shall be served and by the close of business on 4/20/98; the report of Dr. Gosselin shall be served and filed by the close of business on 4/21/98; the reports of Robert B. McKeagney and Dr. Fred Wuczyn shall be served and filed by the close of business on 4/24/98; the reports of Dr. Michael Aronoff and Dr. Glen S. Hirsch shall be served and filed by the close of business on 5/1/98; the report of Prof. Laurence Lynn shall be served and filed by the close of business on 5/12/98; no expert depositions shall be disclosed to any expert until his or her report is served and filed (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 04/23/1998 (Entered: 04/21/1998)
04/20/1998	249	AMENDED ORDER concerning experts' reports and depositions; the city defts, who failed to comply with the Third Amended Scheduling Order dated 1/20/98 which directed that city defts' expert witness reports be served on or before 3/27/98, are to serve those reports as follows: all reports with the exception of the reports from Dr. Gary Gosselin, Robert B. McKeagney, Fran Gutterman, Mary Ann Quaranta, Dr. Aronoff, Dr. Glen S. Hirsch and Prof. Laurence Lynn, shall be served by the close of business on 4/20/98; the report of Dr. Gary Gosselin shall be served by the close of business on 4/21/98; the reports of Robert B. McKeagney, Fran Gutterman and Mary Ann Quaranta shall be served by the close of business on 4/24/98; the reports of Dr. Michael Aronoff and Dr. Glen S. Hirsch shall be served by the close of business on 5/1/98; the report of Prof. Laurence Lynn shall be served by the close of business on 5/12/98; no expert depositions shall be disclosed to any expert until his or her report is served (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 04/23/1998 (Entered: 04/21/1998)
04/23/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; "The portion of the within motion seeking certification of subclasses is granted in accordance with the Memorandum Decision and Order filed this date. A decision with respect to the balance of the motion will be filed shortly"; granting [179-1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One – comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two – comprised of in families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three – comprised of children in the custody of the Amdinistration for Children's (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 04/24/1998)
04/23/1998	250	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER granting [179-1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One – comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been abused or neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two – comprised of children in families in

		which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three – comprised of children in the custody of the Administration for Children's Services (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 05/04/1998 (Entered: 04/24/1998)
04/30/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 05/05/1998)
04/30/1998	251	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. for Suzanne Frances Nossel and Rose Firestein to appear pro hac vice . With affidavits by Suzanne Frances Nossel and Rose Firestein and Certificates attached. Return date not indicated. (lam) Modified on 05/14/1998 (Entered: 05/05/1998)
05/01/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 05/05/1998)
05/04/1998	252	Memo endorsed on motion; granting in part, denying in part [214-1] motion to compel answers to the City Defts Third Set of Interrogatories, Contention Interrogatories, granting in part, denying in part [214-2] motion requests for the production of documents, granting in part, denying in part [214-3] motion to extend the time for the City Defts to submit expert reports by a period equal to that from 2/2/98 when the plttfs should have submitted complete answers to the Third Set to the date when the plttfs actually submit such answers; "The within motion is disposed of in accordance with the oral rulings made by the Court on 4/30 and 5/1/98" (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 05/05/1998)
05/04/1998		Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Evidentiary Hearing on plttfs' Motion for Contempt held 5/4, 5/5. 5/6, 5/7 5/8, 5/11 concluded; total days of hearing – 6 days; Judge's decision 5/11/98: Plttfs' motion denied in accordance with the oral decision rendered this date into the stenographic record; this Motion denied without prejudice. Submitted by Michael Guranich, Deputy Court Clerk (lam) (Entered: 05/12/1998)
05/07/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; withdrawing as moot [251-1] motion for Suzanne Frances Nossel and Rose Firestein to appear pro hac vice (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 05/08/1998)
05/08/1998	253	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 3/26/98 @10:00 before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 05/08/1998)
05/08/1998	254	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 3/6/98 @2:30 before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 05/08/1998)
05/12/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; denying [165-1] motion to schedule an evidentiary hearing as soon as possible following the return date of this motion; hold city defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement; other defts to devise a detailed plan to end multiple overnights within 15 days of the Court's Order; permit plttfs an opportunity to comment on the plan; and Order city defts to implement this plan, as modified by the Court, to end multiple overnights on or before 4/30/98; order that, in the interim, city defts cease their practice of housing children ranging in age from 7-21 in the same sleeping room; order city defts to have children who remain at Pre-Placement for multiple overnights evaluated by a Child Evaluation Specialist; that city defts pay plttfs' attys' fees and costs in connection with this motion and with the underlying motion for a TRO and preliminary injunctive relief. The within motion is denied in accordance with the oral decision rendered this date (5/11/98) (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 05/12/1998)
05/13/1998	255	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. to preclude the admission into evidence of expert testimony or portions of expert reports that violate the Stipulation and Order Establishing a Joint Record Review . Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 05/15/1998)
05/13/1998	256	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. in support of [255-1] motion to preclude the admission into evidence of expert testimony or portions of expert reports that violate the Stipulation and Order Establishing a Joint Record Review (filed in night deposit with motion on 5/13/98 @7:25) (lam) (Entered: 05/15/1998)

		05/15/1998)
05/13/1998	257	AFFIDAVIT of Marcia Robinson Lowry, atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: Exhibit A, a true and exact copy of the Table of Contents page of the Proposed Research Plan for Marisol v. Giuliani, submitted by the Joint Case Review Team on 2/28/97. (lam) (Entered: 05/15/1998)
05/19/1998	258	AFFIRMATION of Rose E. Firestein, atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. Re: in response to City defts' sur-reply [242-1] affidavit, [241-1] affidavit, to pltffs' [165-1] motion to hold city defts in civil contempt for their violation of the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement (lam) (Entered: 05/21/1998)
05/22/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; The balance of the within motion is granted in accordance with the memorandum decision filed herewith. Settle order on notice re: [179-1] motion to certify the following 3 subclasses: 1)Subclass One – comprised of children whom the defts know or should know have been neglected/maltreated by virtue of a report of abuse or neglect/maltreatment; 2)Subclass Two – comprised of families in which there is an open indicated report of abuse or neglect; 3)Subclass Three – comprised of children in the custody of the Administration for Children's Services, granted re: [179-2] motion to intervene the 3 additional named pltffs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., granted re: [179-3] motion to substitute Nedda De Castro Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substitute Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Lawrence B., and to Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf A (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) Modified on 03/19/1999 (Entered: 05/26/1998)
05/22/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; granting in part, denying in part in accordance with the memorandum decision filed herewith. Settle order on notice re: [217-1] cross motion to dismiss certain pltffs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b) (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) Modified on 03/19/1999 (Entered: 05/26/1998)
05/22/1998	259	MEMORANDUM DECISION granting pltffs' [179-2] motion to intervene the following 3 additional named pltffs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle granting [179-3] motion to substiute Nedda De Castro for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substiute Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Lawrence B., and to Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf Marisol A., denying City defts' [217-1] cross motion to dismiss certain pltffs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b); the cross-motion of city defts for an order dismissing certain claims is granted in part and denied in part in accordance with this memorandum decision (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 03/19/1999 (Entered: 06/01/1998)
05/27/1998	261	MEMORANUM DECISION AND ORDER, denying City defts' motion to dismiss pltffs' claims regarding the Pre-Placement Center and vacating the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 05/27/1998)
05/27/1998	260	Memo endorsed on motion filed by Grace Goodman, Asst Corp Counsel, atty for City defts; for an order purs to FRCP 12(b)(1), 60(b)(4), or in the alternative, FRCP 56(b), vacating the Interim Stipulation and Order dated 7/17/97 as void for lack of jurisdiction when it was entered, and dismissing all purported claims of harm from conditions or overnight stays at the Administration for Children's Services' Pre-Placement center for lack of any plttf to assert such claims. Motion denied in accordance with memorandum decision filed herewith (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 06/03/1998 (Entered: 06/03/1998)
05/28/1998	262	MEMORANDUM by city defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to pltffs' [255-1] motion to preclude the admission into evidence of expert testimony or portions of expert reports that violate the Stipulation and Order Establishing a Joint Record Review (lam) (Entered: 06/01/1998)
05/28/1998	263	AFFIRMATION in opposition of Margaret G. King, Asst Corp Counsel for Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta Re: pltffs' [255-1]

		motion to preclude the admission evidence of expert testimony or portions of expert reports that violate the Stipulation and Order Establishing a Joint Record Review (lam) Modified on 06/02/1998 (Entered: 06/02/1998)
06/01/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 06/02/1998)
06/01/1998	264	FOURTH AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: Discovery cutoff by 6/15/98 Any motions in limine shall be served and filed by 6/22/98; Any opposition to such motions shall be served and filed by 6/29/98; Any reply shall be served and filed by 7/6/98; A Joint Pretrial order to be submitted on or before 7/13/98; Final Pretrial conference set for 10:00 7/17/98; Proposed findings of fact due by 7/22/98; The Trial shall commence on 7/27/98 at 10:00 a.m.; If any party fails to comply with this scheduling order or to seek an extension by timely application, the Court, on motion of the parties, or on its own motion, shall issue such orders as it deems necessary, including, but not limited to, orders of preclusion, contempt, dismissal, and an order striking a defts' answer, providing for an inquest and the entry of a default judgment (signed by Judge Robert Ward) Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 06/04/1998 (Entered: 06/02/1998)
06/01/1998	266	AFFIRMATION by Marcia Robinson Lowry, atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. (lam) (Entered: 06/05/1998)
06/01/1998	267	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. re: [255-1] motion to preclude the admission into evidence of expert testimony or portions of expert reports that violate the Stipulation and Order Establishing a Joint Record Review (filed in night deposit on 6/1/98 @5:41) (lam) (Entered: 06/05/1998)
06/02/1998	265	ORDER that the third decretal paragraph of the Fourth amended Scheduling Order dated 6/1/98 is superseded; reset joint pretrial order due for 7/13/98 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 06/05/1998 (Entered: 06/03/1998)
06/04/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [255-1] motion to preclude the admission into evidence of expert testimony or portions of expert reports that violate the Stipulation and Order Establishing a Joint Record Review. Motion granted in accordance with memorandum decision filed herewith (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 06/05/1998)
06/04/1998	268	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER granting [255-1] motion to preclude the admission into evidence of expert testimony or portions of expert reports that violate the Stipulation and Order Establishing a Joint Record Review. Accordingly, the motion to preclude pages and 9-14 of the report of Daniel S. Levy and pages 34-41 of the report of Robert B. McKeagney, as well as any testimony on the subject, is granted (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 06/05/1998 (Entered: 06/05/1998)
06/05/1998	271	ANSWER by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to Intervening Complaint of plttfs Richard and Walter S., by their next friends W.N. and N.N., and Danielle J., by her next friend Angela Lloyd (emil) (Entered: 06/11/1998)
06/08/1998	269	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of April 30, 1998 (jp) (Entered: 06/08/1998)
06/10/1998	270	ORDER granting [179-2] motion to intervene the following 3 additional named plttfs: Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J.; granting [179-3] motion to substiute Nedda De Castro for Kathryn Conroy as next friend to named plttf Shauna D., and to substitute Dr. Vincent Bonagura for Prof. Mitchell I. Ginsburg as next friend to named plttf Lawrence B., and to add Raymunda Cruz as a second next friend to named plttf Marisol A.; granting in part, denying in part [217-1] cross motion to dismiss certain plttfs, next friends, and legal claims purs to FRCP 56(b) (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward) Copies mailed (lam) Modified on 03/19/1999 (Entered: 06/11/1998)
06/10/1998	272	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of April 3, 1998 (bm) (Entered: 06/11/1998)
06/10/1998	273	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard

		S., Danielle J. for an order establishing temporal limits on the scope of admissible evidence at trial, and requiring limited supplemental discovery due within 10 days of the service of plttfs' 16th Request for the Production of Documents . Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 06/12/1998)
06/10/1998	274	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. in support of plttfs' motion in limine [273-1] establishing temporal limits on the scope of admissible evidence at trial, and requiring limited supplemental discovery due within 10 days of the service of plttfs' 16th Request for the Production Documents (lam) (Entered: 06/12/1998)
06/10/1998	275	AFFIRMATION Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna of Marcia Robinson Lowry, atty for D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. (filed in night deposit on 6/10/98 @7:48 along with doc. #273 & #274) (lam) (Entered: 06/12/1998)
06/11/1998	276	MEMORANDUM in limine by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta re: concerning the temporal bounds of relevant evidence. (lam) (Entered: 06/16/1998)
06/17/1998	277	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. in opposition to city defts' in limine motion concerning the temporal bounds of relevant evidence (motion not filed) (lam) (Entered: 06/19/1998)
06/17/1998	278	AFFIRMATION of Mark G. Peters, atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. (lam) (Entered: 06/19/1998)
06/17/1998	279	RESPONSIVE MEMORANDUM by City Defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta to [273-1] motion for an order establishing temporal limits on the scope of admissible evidence at trial, and requiring limited supplemental discovery due within 10 days of the service of plttfs' 16th Request for the Production of Documents (lam) (Entered: 06/19/1998)
06/17/1998	280	AFFIRMATION in opposition of Margaret G. King, Asst Corp Counsel, atty for Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta Re: [273-1] motion for an order establishing temporal limits on the scope of admissible evidence at trial, and requiring limited supplemental discovery due within 10 days of the service of plttfs' 16th Request for the Production of Documents (lam) (Entered: 06/19/1998)
06/22/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [273-1] motion for an order establishing temporal limits on the scope of admissible evidence at trial, and requiring limited supplemental discovery due within 10 days of the service of plttfs' 16th Request for the Production of Documents; The within motion is disposed of in accordance with order filed herewith (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 06/24/1998)
06/22/1998	281	ORDER upon consideration of plttfs' and City defts' cross-motions for an order establishing temporal limits on the scope of evidence admissible at trial, and the parties' respective responses to the cross-motions, that evidence pertaining to liability, as well as remedy, shall be confined to the period beginning on 1/1/95 and continuing up and through the trial with the exception that limited evidence regarding background information prior to 1/1/95 shall be admitted, provided that it comports with Federal Rules of Evidence 401 and 403; defts shall serve and file full and complete answers to plttfs' 16th Request for Production of Documents within 20 days of the date of this Order and shall continue to supplement and update all of plttfs' discovery requests purs to FRCP 26(e)(2); any evidence defts intend to introduce at trial concerning information garnered after 2/20/98 be fully disclosed to plttfs immediately, and under no circumstances shall disclosure be made later than 48 hrs before defts intend to utilize such information at trial (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 06/24/1998)
06/25/1998	282	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial . With declaration attached. Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 06/26/1998)

06/25/1998	283	MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta in support of [282-1] motion in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial (lam) (Entered: 06/26/1998)
07/01/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 07/06/1998)
07/06/1998	284	AFFIRMATION of Mark G. Peters, and atty for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. (lam) (Entered: 07/07/1998)
07/06/1998	285	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. in opposition to City defts' [282-1] motion in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial (lam) (Entered: 07/07/1998)
07/06/1998	286	AFFIDAVIT/AFFIRMATION of Robert Suddath, psychiatrist, asked for a review by counsel for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. Re: upon review of defts' [282-1] motion in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial (lam) (Entered: 07/07/1998)
07/10/1998	287	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 5/8 and 5/11/98 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 07/13/1998)
07/13/1998	288	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of July 1, 1998 (jp) (Entered: 07/13/1998)
07/13/1998	289	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Ward filed for dates of May 4-7, 1998 (jp) (Entered: 07/13/1998)
07/14/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward (lam) (Entered: 07/16/1998)
07/15/1998	290	STIPULATION and ORDER, that City defts may amend their Answers to the Complaint and to the Intervening Complaint to assert the defenses of res judicata and collateral estoppel; nothing in this Stipulation shall be contrued as waiving plttfs' rights to object to the filing of any motion based upon such defenses or to object to such motion itself; nothing in this Stipulation shall be construed as affirming the validity of any proposed defense based upon res judicata or collateral estoppel (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (lam) (Entered: 07/16/1998)
07/16/1998	291	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta re: in support of [282-1] motion in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial (lam) (Entered: 07/17/1998)
07/16/1998	292	REPLY DECLARATION in support by Margaret G. King, atty for Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta re: [282-1] motion in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial (lam) (Entered: 07/17/1998)
07/17/1998	293	AMENDED ANSWER to Complaint by City Defts' Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, Nicholas Scoppetta : amends [52-1] answer, [271-1] intervenor answer (lam) (Entered: 07/21/1998)
07/17/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward; Judges decision: city defts motion in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial granted in part and denied in part in accordance with the oral decision rendered into the stenographer Record-Ward, J. (lam) (Entered: 07/23/1998)
07/21/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; terminating [282-1] motion in limine to preclude plttfs' presentation of certain evidence at trial. The within motion in limine is disposed of in accordance with oral decision rendered this date (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 07/22/1998)
07/22/1998	294	PLTFFS' PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW regarding the cases of Lisa J. and Allen F., Larry H., Nolan M., Deborah L., Charles R., Walter and Richard S., Amy V., and Andrew P., and regarding the expert reports of Anita Marshall and Peter J. Walsh. (lam) (Entered: 07/23/1998)

07/22/1998	295	Revised Identification of Witnesses to be call on plttfs' Case-In-Chief against the City and State Defts by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. (lam) (Entered: 07/23/1998)
07/23/1998	296	State defts' Proposed Conclusions of Law (lam) (Entered: 07/24/1998)
07/23/1998	297	STATE DEFTS' PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW (lam) (Entered: 07/24/1998)
07/23/1998	298	CITY DEFTS' PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW (volume I & II) (lam) (Entered: 07/24/1998)
07/23/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward; Trial adjourned from 7/27/98 @10:00am to 8/3/98 @10:00am. (lam) (Entered: 07/29/1998)
07/24/1998	299	STIPULATION and ORDER, the plttfs and the City defts are engaged in productive discussions that may lead to the settlement of this action against the City defts only and accordingly, wish to adjourn the scheduled trial date of this action for a limited time to facilitate further discussion; the trial of this action, scheduled to begin on 7/27/98, shall, with the approval of the Court, be adjourned until 8/3/98 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward) (lam) (Entered: 07/28/1998)
07/24/1998	300	ORDER concerning testimony of expert witnesses (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 07/28/1998)
07/30/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward; Judge's decision: trial adjourned from 8/3/98 @10:00am to 9/16/98 @10:00am. (lam) (Entered: 07/30/1998)
07/31/1998	301	STIPULATION and ORDER, the plttf and City defts have agreed to continue to attempt to arrive at a settlement of this action against the City defts only; Accordingly, the parties wish to further adjourn the scheduled trial date of this action; the trial of this action scheduled to begin on 8/3/98, shall be adjourned until 9/16/98 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (lam) Modified on 08/04/1998 (Entered: 08/03/1998)
08/04/1998	302	BRIEF of amicus curiae filed by James Tierney, friend of the children. (lam) (Entered: 08/06/1998)
08/07/1998	303	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 6/1/98 @11:40 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 08/07/1998)
08/14/1998	304	MEMORANDUM by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. re: on the Proper Standard applicable to their 1983 Claims and Supplemental State Statutory Claims. (lam) (Entered: 08/17/1998)
08/17/1998	305	CORRECTED COPY OF MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. re: on the Proper Standard Applicable to their 1983 Claims and Supplemental State Statutory Claims. (lam) (Entered: 08/18/1998)
08/20/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 08/21/1998)
09/14/1998		Pre-trial conference held; Judge's Decision: Trial adjourned from 9/16/98 @10:00am to 10/6/98 @10:00am; upon Joint Request of all parties, Ward J. (lam) (Entered: 09/16/1998)
09/16/1998	306	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 7/14/98 @10:00am before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 09/16/1998)
09/16/1998	307	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 7/17/98 @10:15 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 09/16/1998)
09/16/1998	308	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 7/30/98 @3:00pm before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 09/16/1998)
09/18/1998	309	PRETRIAL MEMORANDUM OF LAW on the standards applicable to plttfs' claims. (lam) (Entered: 09/22/1998)

09/28/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward: Judge's Decision: upon request of all parties, the Court adjourns the trial from 10/6/98 to 10/8/98. (lam) (Entered: 10/01/1998)
10/08/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward; Trial adjourned without date. (lam) (Entered: 10/13/1998)
10/15/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 10/22/1998)
10/19/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 10/22/1998)
11/05/1998	310	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 8/20/98 @2:15pm before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 11/05/1998)
11/18/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/02/1998)
11/20/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/02/1998)
11/30/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/02/1998)
12/02/1998		Pre-trial conference held before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 12/04/1998)
12/02/1998	311	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT filed by City Defts. (lam) (Entered: 12/04/1998)
12/02/1998	312	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT filed by the State Defts. (lam) (Entered: 12/04/1998)
12/04/1998	313	ORDER, directing distribution of Legal Notice of Proposed Settlement Agreements in Marisol v. Giuliani and Proposed Dismissal of Wilder v. Bernstein and related matters (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 12/07/1998)
12/09/1998	314	ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE and Temporary Restraining Order by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J.; Show Cause Hearing set for 2:00 12/17/98: that the parties show cause why an Order should not be entered suspending the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement which was "so ordered" by this Court on 7/17/97, pending the expiration of the July 1997 order by its terms ; that pending hearing and determination of the issues raised in the Joint Declaration for an Order suspending the July 1997 order, let enforcement of that July 1997 order be stayed (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward) Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 12/14/1998)
12/17/1998	315	ORDER that the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement which was "so-ordered" by this Court on 7/17/97, is suspended, pending the expiration of the 7/17/97 order upon Court approval of the Settlement Agreements (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 12/21/1998)
12/17/1998		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [314-1] motion that the parties show cause why an Order should not be entered suspending the Interim Stipulation and Order Concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement which was "so ordered" by this Court on 7/17/97, pending the expiration of the July 1997 order by its terms, granting [314-2] motion that pending hearing and determination of the issues raised in the Joint Declaration for an Order suspending the July 1997 order, let enforcement of that July 1997 order be stayed; The within joint motion to suspend the Interim Stipulation and Order concerning Overnights at Pre-Placement, dated 7/17/97, is granted. No opposition (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 12/21/1998)
12/29/1998	316	NOTICE OF MOTION by counsel for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. for Craig Levine to withdraw as attorney . With Memorandum of Law. Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 01/05/1999)
12/29/1998	317	Memo endorsed on motion;, for Craig Levine, Children's Rights, Inc. to withdraw as attorney; Motion granted (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. With Memorandum of Law attached. (lam) (Entered: 01/07/1999)
01/06/1999	319	NOTICE OF MOTION for Mark Peters to withdraw as attorneyf or plntfs Return date not indicated; attached is a memo in support (cd) (Entered: 01/08/1999)

01/12/1999		Memo endorsed on motion; granting [319-1] motion for Mark Peters to withdraw as attorney for plttfs (Terminated attorney Mark G. Peters for Danielle J., attorney Mark G. Peters for Richard S. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 01/12/1999)
01/12/1999	320	ORDER granting [319-1] motion for Mark Peters to withdraw as attorney for plttfs (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 01/12/1999)
01/15/1999	321	AMENDED MEMORANDUM in support of motion to intervene and objections to proposed class action settlement by intervenor Joel plaintiffs. (kw) (Entered: 01/19/1999)
01/21/1999	323	MEMORANDUM by State defendants in support of the State settlement agreement and in opposition to motion to intervene. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/21/1999	324	MEMORANDUM by city defendants' in support of the Marisol settlement agreement and the dismissal of Wilder and in opposition to the motion by the Joel A. plaintiffs to intervene. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/21/1999	325	MEMORANDUM by plaintiffs in support of approval and entry of Marisol settlement agreements; in opposition to motion to intervene; and in further support of Wilder joint motion to dismiss. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/21/1999	326	DECLARATION of Gail Rubin, on behalf of City Defendants i support of the settlement and in opposition to the motion by the Joel A. Plaintiffs to intervene. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/22/1999		Hearing begun and concluded on 1/22/99 on the class action settlement agreements filed with the Court on 12/2/98. Judge's decision: the Court having hearing all parties responding to the fairness of the settlement, finds that the settlements are fair, reasonable & appropriate and approving the settlements. Settle Judgment on 2 day's notice. A written opinion will follow. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/22/1999	327	Letters to Judge Ward in objections to settlement agreements. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/25/1999		Memo endorsed on memorandum in support of motion to intervene doc. #321; the portion of the within motion seeking to intervene for the purpose of interposing objections to the proposed class action settlement is granted. The balance of the motion has been withdrawn in open court (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kw) Modified on 01/27/1999 (Entered: 01/27/1999)
01/25/1999	322	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER, this Court grants Intervenors' motion to intervene and the additional relief stated in this document, conditioned on this Court's approval of the Marisol City Settlement Agreement and dismissal of Wilder v. Bernstein, 78 civ. 957 (RJW) (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 01/27/1999)
01/25/1999	328	DECLARATION of Douglas Lasdon. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
02/01/1999	329	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 11/18/98 @10:00am before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 02/08/1999)
02/01/1999	330	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 12/2/98 @9:40am before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 02/09/1999)
02/05/1999	331	ORDER, this Court's Memorandum Decision and Order dated 1/22/99, is vacated and the Wilder Intervenors' motion dated 1/5/99 in 78 civ. 957 is withdrawn (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 02/10/1999)
02/05/1999	332	STIPULATION and ORDER, the Wilder Intervenors are to receive the draft of the Initial Report with respect to the Wilder Obligations referred to in paragraph 11.b of the City Settlement Agreement and the Advisory Panel is to receive and discuss with the Wilder Intervenors any comments the Wilder Intervenors have regarding the draft, as provided for the parties in paragraph 14 of the City Settlement Agreement and as set forth further in this document (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (kw) (Entered: 02/10/1999)

02/17/1999	333	NOTICE OF APPEAL by Joel A., Michael D., Eric R., David S., Maxx R., Ray D. ; from [322-1] order this Court grants Intervenors' motion to intervene and the additional relief stated in this document, conditioned on this Court's approval of the Marisol City Settlement Agreement and dismissal of Wilder v. Bernstein, 78 civ. 957 (RJW) . Copies of notice of appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: David M. Brodsky, Thomas F. Curnin, Karen J. Freedman, Marcia Robinson Lowry, Gail Rubin, Judith Kramer, fee pd. \$105.00, rec # 338033 . (as) (Entered: 02/22/1999)
02/17/1999		Notice of appeal and certified copy of docket to USCA: [333-1] appeal by Ray D., Maxx R., David S., Eric R., Michael D., Joel A. ; Copy of notice of appeal sent to District Judge. (as) (Entered: 02/22/1999)
03/09/1999	334	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 1/22/99 @10:00 before Judge Ward. (lam) (Entered: 03/09/1999)
03/09/1999	335	ORDER, reset answer due for 4/5/99 for Nicholas Scoppetta, for Brian J. Wing, for George E. Pataki, for Marva Livingston Hammons, and for Rudolph W. Giuliani (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 03/11/1999)
03/10/1999		USCA Case Number Re: [333-1] appeal by Ray D., Maxx R., David S., Eric R., Michael D., Joel A. USCA NUMBER: 99-7218. (dt) (Entered: 03/10/1999)
03/18/1999	336	Notice that the record on appeal has been certified and transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals: [333-1] appeal by Ray D., Maxx R., David S., Eric R., Michael D., Joel A. (dt) (Entered: 03/18/1999)
03/26/1999	337	Memo endorsed on motion; plaintiffs' motion, to enter appearance of Marcia Robinson Lowry on behalf of Danielle J., by her next friend, Angela Lloyd; and Richard and Walter S., by their next friends, W.N. and N.N., is granted. No opposition (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 03/29/1999)
03/26/1999	338	ORDER, upon consideration of Plaintiffs' motion to enter appearance of Marcia Robinson Lowry on behalf of Danielle J., by her next friend, Angela Lloyd; and Richard and Walter S., by their next friends, W.N. and N.N., it is hereby ordered that the motion is granted (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 03/29/1999)
03/31/1999	339	OPINION #82124, the Court finds the Marisol settlement agreements and the dismissal of Wilder to be fair, reasonable, and adequate. Accordingly, the Court approves the Marisol Settlement Agreements and grants the motion to dismiss Wilder (Signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 04/01/1999)
03/31/1999	340	ORDER, the settlement agreements, which are attached as exhibit, and each of them are approved by this Court (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 04/01/1999)
03/31/1999	341	FINAL JUDGMENT DISMISSING CLAIMS AND RETAINING JURISDICTION; that the plaintiffs' claims against the City defendants are dismissed with prejudice pursuant to the City Settlement Agreement, except that, pursuant to the City Settlement Agreement consented to by the plaintiffs and the City defendants and approved on this date by this Court, this Court shall retain jurisdiction over the City Settlement Agreement for the purposes set forth therein. The plaintiffs' claims against the State defendants are dismissed with prejudice pursuant to the State Settlement Agreement, except that, pursuant to the State Settlement Agreement consented to by the plaintiffs and the State defendants and approved on this date by this Court, this Court shall retain jurisdiction over the State Settlement Agreement for the purposes set forth therein. The issue of attorneys' fees and costs to be paid to plaintiffs as provided in the Settlement Agreements is reserved. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Mailed copies and notice of right to appeal. Entered on 4/1/99. (kw) (Entered: 04/01/1999)
03/31/1999		Case closed (kw) (Entered: 04/01/1999)
04/20/1999	342	STIPULATION and ORDER, pursuant to FRCP 10(e)(2)(A) that the documents as set forth in this order, which were mistakenly omitted from the Court record of this matter, be certified and forwarded as part of the record on appeal in this action (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). (kw) (Entered: 04/22/1999)

04/28/1999	343	ORDER authorizing payment of expenses to United Way of New York City from CRIS Acct 95cv10533; that the Clerk of the Court is directed to arrange for the transfer of all funds on deposit currently held by the CRIS in acct #95cv10533, to the Registry of this Court; that the Clerk of the Court prepare forthwith a check for all funds on deposit made payable to "United Way of New York City" and advise David Daykin that he may pick it up or make arrangement for the mailing of the check; that this Court retain jurisdiction in connection with any further application or matter which may arise in connection with this action (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed; Remark by Cashiers Office: Received check #500754 dated 4/30/99 in the amount of 144,695.00 payable to United Way. (lam) (Entered: 05/10/1999)
08/13/1999	344	NOTICE OF MOTION by plaintiffs for an order directing compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement as set forth in this document ; Return date 9/3/99. (kw) Modified on 08/17/1999 (Entered: 08/17/1999)
08/13/1999	345	MEMORANDUM by plaintiffs in support of [344-1] motion for an order directing compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement as set forth in this document. (kw) (Entered: 08/17/1999)
09/02/1999	346	AFFIDAVIT of Frederick Levitan on behalf of State defendants in opposition to Re: [344-1] motion for an order directing compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement as set forth in this document. (kw) Modified on 09/07/1999 (Entered: 09/07/1999)
09/02/1999	347	MEMORANDUM by State defendants in opposition to [344-1] motion for an order directing compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement as set forth in this document. (kw) (Entered: 09/07/1999)
09/10/1999	348	REPLY MEMORANDUM by plaintiffs to re: [347-1] opposition memorandum, and [346-1] affidavit. (kw) (Entered: 09/14/1999)
12/27/1999	349	AGREEMENT ON ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS/ORDER, the State Defendants will pay to Plaintiffs' Counsel the amount of \$1,575,000 for the attorneys' fees and costs incurred by Plaintiffs in the Litigation. In addition to the \$1,575,000 referred to in paragraph 1 of this document, the State Defendants agree to pay Plaintiffs' Counsel at a future date for the attorneys' fees and costs incurred by them after 3/31/99 for the monitoring and/or enforcement of the terms and conditions of the Settlement Agreement, up to a maximum amount of \$175,000 (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 12/28/1999)
01/14/2000	350	NOTICE OF MOTION by plaintiffs for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98 ; Return date 1/31/00. (kw) (Entered: 01/18/2000)
01/14/2000	351	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Marisol A. in support of [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98. (kw) (Entered: 01/18/2000)
04/14/2000	352	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by City Defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Brian J. Wing, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to plttfs" [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98 (filed in night deposit on 4/14/00 @9:00pm) (lam) (Entered: 04/17/2000)
04/14/2000	353	DECLARATION of Gail Rubin, Asst Corp Counsel, for City Defts Rudolph W. Giuliani, Brian J. Wing, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to plttfs' [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98. (filed in night deposit on 4/14/00 @9:00pm) (lam) (Entered: 04/17/2000)
04/14/2000	354	DECLARATION of Grace Goodman, affidavit of Nicholas Scoppetta, declaration of Suzanne M. Halbardier in opposition to plttfs' [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98. Filed by City Defts. (filed in night deposit on 4/14/00 @9:01pm) (lam) (Entered: 04/17/2000)
04/17/2000	355	CORRECTED COPY OF MEMORANDUM OF LAW by City Defts, Rudolph W. Giuliani, Brian J. Wing, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to [350-1] motion for an

		order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98 (lam) (Entered: 04/19/2000)
06/01/2000	356	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. by Shirim Nothenberg (lf) (Entered: 06/05/2000)
06/05/2000	357	REPLY MEMORANDUM by plaintiffs in support re: [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98 (lf) (Entered: 06/06/2000)
06/26/2000	358	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing, Nicholas Scoppetta re: [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98. Received in night deposit on 6/26/00 at 6:58 p.m. (jp) (Entered: 06/29/2000)
06/26/2000	359	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Gail Rubin by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, George E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing, Nicholas Scoppetta in opposition to: [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98. Received in night deposit on 6/26/00 at 6:58 p.m. (jp) (Entered: 06/29/2000)
07/26/2000		Oral argument held before Judge Robert J. Ward re: plttfs' motion with reference to state defts directing complainece with certain provisions of Settlement Agreement; Judge's decision: motion disposed of as set forth on the record in open court. (lam) (Entered: 07/27/2000)
07/26/2000		Memo endorsed on motion doc. #344; the within motion is disposed of as set forth on the record in open court . (Signed by Judge Robert J. Ward). Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 07/27/2000)
08/08/2000	360	MANDATE OF USCA (certified copy) Re: Affirm [333-1] appeal by Ray D., Maxx R., David S., Eric R., Michael D., Joel A. 00-7898, Roseann B. MAckechnie, Clerk (sl) (Entered: 08/14/2000)
08/11/2000	361	NOTICE OF MOTION by counsel for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. for Shirim Nothenberg to withdraw as attorney . Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 08/15/2000)
08/11/2000	362	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J. in support of [361-1] motion for Shirim Nothenberg to withdraw as attorney . (lam) (Entered: 08/15/2000)
08/16/2000	363	ORDER granting [361-1] motion for Shirim Nothenberg to withdraw as attorney (Terminated attorney Shirim Nothenberg for Danielle J., attorney Shirim Nothenberg for Richard S., attorney Shirim Nothenberg for Walter S., attorney Shirim Nothenberg for Stephen I., attorney Shirim Nothenberg for Brandon H., attorney Shirim Nothenberg for Victoria G., attorney Shirim Nothenberg for Bill G. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (cd) (Entered: 08/17/2000)
08/30/2000		Memo endorsed on motion; granting in accordance with Opinion filed herewith: [350-1] motion for an order granting attorney fees against the City Defendants in the amount of \$9,361,098.02, for all activities rendered in this case up to 12/2/98. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (jp) (Entered: 08/31/2000)
08/30/2000	364	OPINION #84456, plaintiffs' motion for an award of attorneys' fees and expenses is granted. Defendants are directed to reimburse plaintiffs in the amount of \$5,835,116.78 for attorneys' fees and expenses . (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 09/01/2000)
09/06/2000	365	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Robert J. Ward for the date(s) of 7/26/00 @11:05am. (lam) (Entered: 09/06/2000)

09/29/2000	366	NOTICE OF APPEAL by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, seorge E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing, Nicholas Scoppetta ; from [364-1] order plaintiffs' motion for an award of attorneys' fees and expenses is granted. Defendants are directed to reimburse plaintiffs in the amount of \$5,835,116.78 for attorneys' fees and expenses . Copies of notice of appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: Marcia Robinson Lowry, Susan Lambiase, Kim E. Murdock, Jeffrey K. Powell, Karen J. Freedman, Esq. and Jess A. Velona, Esq. \$105.00 Appeal filing fee paid 9/29/00 on receipt # E 385619. (dt) (Entered: 10/02/2000)
10/02/2000		Notice of appeal and certified copy of docket to USCA: [366-1] appeal by Nicholas Scoppetta, Brian J. Wing, seorge E. Pataki, Marva Livingston Hammons, Rudolph W. Giuliani ; Copy of notice of appeal sent to District Judge. (dt) (Entered: 10/02/2000)
11/02/2000	367	MANDATE OF USCA WITHDRAWING APPEAL (certified copy) Re: withdrawing [366-1] appeal by Nicholas Scoppetta, Brian J. Wing, seorge E. Pataki, Marva Livingston Hammons, Rudolph W. Giuliani. 00-9256, Roseann B. Mackehcnie, Clerk. (sl) (Entered: 11/03/2000)
01/08/2001	368	NOTICE OF MOTION by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., Joel A., Michael D., Eric R., David S., Maxx R., Ray D. to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement . Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 01/08/2001)
01/08/2001	369	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Walter S., Richard S., Danielle J., Joel A., Michael D., Eric R., David S., Maxx R., Ray D. in support of [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement . (lam) (Entered: 01/08/2001)
01/31/2001	370	AFFIDAVIT of Larry Brown by State Defendants in opposition to [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement. (kw) (Entered: 02/01/2001)
01/31/2001	371	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by State Defendants in opposition to [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement. (kw) (Entered: 02/01/2001)
02/06/2001	372	NOTICE of change of address for counsel Schulte Roth & Zabel for Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Shauna D., Ozzie E., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I. . (lam) (Entered: 02/08/2001)
02/26/2001	373	REPLY MEMORANDUM by plaintiffs in support of re: [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement. (kw) (Entered: 02/27/2001)
03/09/2001	374	AFFIDAVIT of Melvin I. Rosenblat by Rudolph W. Giuliani, Marva Livingston Hammons, seorge E. Pataki, Brian J. Wing, Nicholas Scoppetta Re: personal knowledge; and AFFIDAVIT of Larry G. Brown re in opposition to the plttf's motion for an order directing complaince and to supplement his affdvt of 1/29/01 (lf) (Entered: 03/12/2001)
08/06/2001		Terminated document 368-1 pursuant to instructions of Magistrate Judge Eaton. (rag) (Entered: 08/06/2001)
08/09/2001		Motion Hearing begun before Judge Robert J. Ward Re: [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement. (kw) (Entered: 08/23/2001)
08/10/2001		Motion Hearing continued before Judge Robert J. Ward Re: [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement. (kw) (Entered: 08/23/2001)
08/13/2001		Motion Hearing continued before Judge Robert J. Ward Re: [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement. Plaintiff withdraw their claims as to paragraph #9 of the State Settlement agreement. Motion withdraw as to paragraph #9. (kw) Modified on 08/23/2001 (Entered: 08/23/2001)

08/22/2001		Motion Hearing continued and concluded before Judge Robert J. Ward Re: [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement. Decision reserved. Total hearing days: 4. (kw) (Entered: 08/23/2001)
08/29/2001		Memo endorsed on motion; granting in part, denying in part [368-1] motion to direct compliance with certain provisions of the Marisol State Settlement Agreement in accordance with opinion filed herewith. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (pl) (Entered: 08/30/2001)
08/29/2001	375	Vacated as per Judges Order dated 08/06/2018, Doc. #388 OPINION AND ORDER #86038; for the reasons stated herein, plttfs' motion for an order directing compliance with paragraphs 14 and 21 of the State Settlement Agreement is denied. Plttfs' motion for an order directing compliance with paragraph 22 of the State Settlement Agreement is granted to the extent that the Court will continue its jurisdiction over par. 22 until the Court determines that defts have complied with that paragraph . The Office of Children and Family Services is directed to furnish semi-annual reports to the Court with copies to plttfs' attorneys. The first report shall be furnished on 1/2/02 and the last report shall be furnished when the Court determines that OCFS has complied with #22 of the State Settlement Agreement. . (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward); Copies mailed. (correction made to page 21 on 10/09/01 by Judge Ward, copies mailed and opinion re-microfilmed as of that date) (sn) Modified on 10/09/2001 Modified on 8/6/2018 (yv). (Entered: 08/30/2001)
09/26/2001	376	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Robert J. Ward on 8/10/01. (kw) (Entered: 09/26/2001)
09/26/2001	377	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Robert J. Ward on 8/9/01. (kw) (Entered: 09/26/2001)
09/26/2001	378	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Robert J. Ward on 8/13/01. (kw) (Entered: 09/26/2001)
01/21/2003	379	Ex Parte Order filed. Brian Lopez be permitted, with the consent of Jennie Casciano, to withdraw the sum of \$3000.00 from the Account, being Citibank custodian account number 25867938, and that Citibank pay said sum to Mr. Lopez from said account as soon as possible upon demand by Mr. Lopez and Ms. Casciano in compliance with the procedures of the bank. (signed by Judge Robert J. Ward) (tp) (Entered: 01/23/2003)
08/26/2003	380	Notice of Case Reassignment to Judge Kevin T. Duffy . Copy of notice and judge's rules mailed to Attorney(s) of record: Marc Christopher Falcone, Shirim Nothenberg, Marcia Robinson Lowry, Mark G. Peters, Grace Goodman, Floyd Abrams, Michael S. Popkin, David M. Brodsky, Rose E. Firestein, Carol A. Marcus, Thomas F. Curnin, Karen J. Freedman . (jjm) (Entered: 08/28/2003)
07/01/2008	381	July 2008 Report by New York State Office of Children and Family Services. (pl) (Entered: 07/02/2008)
06/22/2017		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge George B. Daniels. Judge Kevin Thomas Duffy is no longer assigned to the case. (bcu) (Entered: 06/22/2017)
06/22/2017		Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker is so redesignated. (ad) (Entered: 06/22/2017)
10/06/2017	<u>382</u>	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial (includes scheduling, discovery, non-dispositive pretrial motions, and settlement): OCFS's semi-annual report and Settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker. (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 10/6/2017) (mro) Modified on 11/15/2017 (mro). (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/12/2017	<u>383</u>	JANUARY 2017 REPORT (from New York State Office of Children & Family Services). (sc) (Entered: 10/16/2017)
07/17/2018	<u>384</u>	ORDER SCHEDULING TELEPHONE CONFERENCE: A telephone conference in this matter is scheduled for Thursday, July 26, 2018 at 12:30 p.m. Counsel for the parties are directed to call Judge Parker's Chambers at 12:30 p.m. on Thursday, July 26, 2018 with counsel for all parties on the line. Please dial 212-805-0234. (Telephone Conference set for 7/26/2018 at 12:30 PM before Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker.) (Signed by Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker on 7/17/2018)

		(cf) (Entered: 07/17/2018)
07/19/2018	<u>385</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Samantha Leigh Buchalter on behalf of SHEILA J. POOLE. (Buchalter, Samantha) (Entered: 07/19/2018)
07/26/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker: Telephone Conference held on 7/26/2018. (ca) (Entered: 07/26/2018)
08/03/2018	<u>386</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Betsy Kramer on behalf of Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Courtroom Television Network, Shauna D., David S., Ozzie E., Eric R., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G.. (Kramer, Betsy) (Entered: 08/03/2018)
08/03/2018	<u>387</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge George B. Daniels from Karen Freedman and Samantha L. Buchalter dated August 3, 2018 re: Telephone conference with Judge Parker on July 26, 2018. Document filed by Marisol A., Lawrence B., Thomas C., Courtroom Television Network, Shauna D., David S., Ozzie E., Eric R., Darren F., David F., Bill G., Victoria G., Brandon H., Stephen I., Danielle J., Joel A., Maxx R., Michael D., SHEILA J. POOLE, Ray D., Richard S., Walter S..(Kramer, Betsy) (Entered: 08/03/2018)
08/06/2018	<u>388</u>	ORDER. This Court's August 29, 2001 Order, ECF Docket No. 375, is vacated insofar as it retained jurisdiction of paragraph 22 of the State Settlement Agreement. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker on 8/6/18) (yv) (Entered: 08/06/2018)
08/06/2018	<u>389</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>387</u> Letter. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 8/6/2018) (jwh) (Entered: 08/06/2018)