

CLOSED

**U.S. District Court
Western District of Pennsylvania (Erie)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:04-cv-00004-SJM**

UNITED STATES v. CITY OF ERIE, PA
Assigned to: Judge Sean J. McLaughlin
Demand: \$0
Cause: 42:2000 Civil Rights: Other

Date Filed: 01/08/2004
Date Terminated: 11/20/2006
Jury Demand: Defendant
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government
Plaintiff

Plaintiff

UNITED STATES

represented by **Benjamin Blustein**
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Rights Division (Employment)
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Patrick Henry Building, Room 4908
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-4073
TERMINATED: 03/13/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christine M. Roth
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Rights Division (Employment)
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Patrick Henry Building, Room 4908
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-4073
TERMINATED: 03/13/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jay D. Adelstein
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Rights Division (Employment)
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Patrick Henry Building, Room 4908
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-4073
TERMINATED: 03/13/2006

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Jessica Lieber Smolar
United States Attorney's Office
700 Grant Street
Suite 4000
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 894-7419
Email: jessica.smolar@usdoj.gov

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

John M. Gadzichowski
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Rights Division (Employment)
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Patrick Henry Building, Room 4908
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-4073

*TERMINATED: 04/28/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Mary Beth Buchanan
United States Attorney's Office
700 Grant Street
Suite 400
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 644-3500
Email:

marybeth.buchanan@usdoj.gov
*TERMINATED: 03/02/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Sharon A. Seeley
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Rights Division (Employment)
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Patrick Henry Building, Room 4908
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-4761

*TERMINATED: 09/06/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

Defendant

CITY OF ERIE, PA

represented by **Gerald J. Vilella**
Dailey, Karle & Vilella
900 State Street
Suite 310
Erie, PA 16501
(814) 453-4651
Email: gvillella@ci.erie.pa.us
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kenneth A. Zak
City Solicitor's Office
626 State Street
Room 505, Municipal Building
Erie, PA 16501
814-870-1237
Email: kzak@ci.erie.pa.us
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Larry D. Meredith
1805 Prospect Avenue
Erie, PA 16510
(814) 899-2397
Email: ldm47_936@msn.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Paul F. Curry
City Solicitor's Office
626 State Street
Room 505, Municipal Building
Erie, PA 16501
(814) 870-1230
TERMINATED: 04/28/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Defendant

**PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN
RELATIONS COMMISSION**

represented by **Katherine H. Fein**
Pennsylvania Human Relations
Commission

300 Liberty Avenue
Suite 1100
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
(412) 565-5698
TERMINATED: 02/27/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
01/08/2004	1	COMPLAINT with summons issued (mad) (Entered: 01/09/2004)
02/05/2004	2	RETURN OF SERVICE executed as to CITY OF ERIE, PA 1/23/04 (mad) (Entered: 02/06/2004)
02/11/2004	3	ANSWER to Complaint by CITY OF ERIE, PA (Attorney Paul F. Curry, Larry D. Meredith, Gerald J. Villella) (mad) (Entered: 02/11/2004)
02/12/2004	4	PRELIMINARY SCHEDULING ORDER, set Case Management Conference for 10:00 3/18/04 (signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 2/12/04) CM all parties of record. (mad) (Entered: 02/12/2004)
02/20/2004	5	DEMAND for jury trial by CITY OF ERIE, PA (nk) (Entered: 02/20/2004)
03/15/2004	6	PROPOSED DISCOVERY PLAN pursuant to Rule 26(f) by CITY OF ERIE, PA (nk) (Entered: 03/15/2004)
03/15/2004	7	PROPOSED DISCOVERY PLAN pursuant to Rule 26(f) by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA (nk) (Entered: 03/16/2004)
03/16/2004	8	MOTION by UNITED STATES to Strike [5-1] demand jury by CITY OF ERIE, PA with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 03/17/2004)
03/16/2004	9	BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [8-1] motion to Strike [5-1] demand jury by CITY OF ERIE, PA by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 03/17/2004)
03/18/2004	10	MOTION by PA HUMAN RELATIONS to Intervene as a Pltf under Rule 24 by PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 03/18/2004)
03/18/2004	11	Case Management Conference held 3/18/04 @ 10:00 a.m. before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin [Reporter: Ron Bench] Motion to Strike Response due in 10 days. Court adopts the U.S. Discovery Plan. Clerk to enter dates from Doc. 7 and enter on the docket. (mad) (Entered: 03/18/2004)

03/18/2004		Deadline updated; set Pretrial Order Deadlines: Discovery cutoff on 8/2/04 ; Initial expert disclosures: 5/1/04; Pretrial Conference set for 45 days before trial date ; Joining of parties amending of pleadings by 3/30/04 ; Motion Filing deadline due 9/15/04 ; File motions to challenge the qualifications and/or substance of any proposed expert witness: 9/15/04; Designate, if appropriate, the case for mediation: After discovery period; Presumptive Trial date set for January 2005 ; Rebuttal Expert reports due 7/15/04 ; Complete expert depositions: 8/1/04 (mad) (Entered: 03/18/2004)
03/24/2004	12	TRANSCRIPT Status Conference before McLaughlin, J. for date of 3/18/04. Court Reporter: Ronald J. Bench. (mad) (Entered: 03/24/2004)
03/29/2004	13	BRIEF IN RESPONSE by CITY OF ERIE, PA to Pltf's Motion to strike jury trial demand (mad) (Entered: 03/29/2004)
03/29/2004	14	BRIEF by PA HUMAN RELATIONS in support of [10-1] motion to Intervene as a Pltf under Rule 24 by PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION by PA HUMAN RELATIONS (mad) (Entered: 03/31/2004)
04/06/2004	15	REPLY BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [8-1] motion to Strike [5-1] demand jury by CITY OF ERIE, PA by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 04/06/2004)
04/06/2004	16	Hearing on Motion held before McLaughlin, J. on 4/6/04 re: GRANTED as set forth on the record-- [8-1] motion to Strike [5-1] demand jury by CITY OF ERIE, PA by UNITED STATES [Reporter: Ron Bench] (mad) (Entered: 04/07/2004)
04/08/2004	17	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance for UNITED STATES by Christine M. Roth, Jessica Lieber Smolar (nk) (Entered: 04/09/2004)
04/08/2004	18	BRIEF by UNITED STATES in opposition to [10-1] motion to Intervene as a Pltf under Rule 24 by PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION by PA HUMAN RELATIONS (nk) (Entered: 04/09/2004)
04/19/2004	19	TRANSCRIPT for Hearing on Pltf U.S's Motion to strike Jury Trial Demand for date of 4/6/04 before McLaughlin, J. Court Reporter: Ronald J. Bench. (mad) (Entered: 04/19/2004)
04/29/2004	20	MOTION by CITY OF ERIE, PA to Amend Case Management Order regarding Expert Witness Report with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 04/29/2004)
04/30/2004		ORDER upon motion granting [20-1] motion to Amend Case Management Order regarding Expert Witness Report to May 10, 2004. (signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 4/30/04) CM all parties of

		record. (mad) (Entered: 04/30/2004)
05/04/2004	21	Hearing on Motion re: [10-1] motion to Intervene as a Pltf under Rule 24 by PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION by PA HUMAN RELATIONS set for 10:30 5/11/04 before McLaughlin, J. (mad) (Entered: 05/04/2004)
05/11/2004	22	Hearing on Motion held 5/11/04 before McLaughlin, J. re: DENIED WITH PREJUDICE w/right to re-assert once a PHRC order is issued. [10-1] motion to Intervene as a Pltf under Rule 24 by PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION by PA HUMAN RELATIONS. PHRC permitted to participate Amicus Curai- (Friend of the Court)- participation limited to filing of briefs, but not discovery. [Reporter: Ron Bench] (mad) (Entered: 05/11/2004)
06/17/2004	23	MOTION by UNITED STATES to exclude validation study as untimely , or, in the alternative to Modify Discovery schedule with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 06/22/2004)
06/17/2004	24	BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [23-1] motion to exclude validation study as untimely by UNITED STATES, [23-2] motion to Modify Discovery schedule by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 06/22/2004)
06/23/2004	25	ORDER, that the City of Erie file a Brief in Opposition set to 7/13/04 for [23-1] motion to exclude validation study as untimely, set to 7/13/04 for [23-2] motion to Modify Discovery schedule (signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 6/23/04) CM all parties of record. (mad) (Entered: 06/23/2004)
06/23/2004	26	REPLY by CITY OF ERIE, PA to [23-1] motion to exclude validation study as untimely by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 06/23/2004)
06/23/2004	27	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance for UNITED STATES by Jessica Lieber Smolar, AUSA and Sharon A. Seeley, US Attorney (mad) (Entered: 06/24/2004)
06/25/2004	28	REPLY BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [23-1] motion to exclude validation study as untimely by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 06/28/2004)
06/30/2004	29	Hearing on Motion held 6/30/04 before McLaughlin, J. re: DENIED IN PART AND GRANTED IN PART [23-1] motion to exclude validation study as untimely by UNITED STATES, [23-2] motion to Modify Discovery schedule by UNITED STATES [Reporter: Ron Bench] Motion to Exclude Validation Study (Doc. No. 23) is DENIED; Motion to Modify Discovery Schedule - GRANTED. Rport due - 7/15/04; Rebuttal Report 9/1/04; Complete Expert Disc. - 9/15/04. (mad) (Entered: 06/30/2004)

08/05/2004	30	MOTION by UNITED STATES for Summary Judgment with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 08/06/2004)
08/05/2004	31	BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [30-1] motion for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 08/06/2004)
08/05/2004	32	CONCISE STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 08/06/2004)
08/05/2004	33	APPENDIX to [32-1] by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 08/06/2004)
08/11/2004	34	JOINT MOTION by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA to Extend Time and modified discovery schedule with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 08/13/2004)
08/11/2004	35	BRIEF by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA in support of [34-1] joint motion to Extend Time and modified discovery schedule by CITY OF ERIE, PA, UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 08/13/2004)
08/13/2004		ORDER upon motion granting [34-1] joint motion to Extend Time and modified discovery schedule, City of Erie shall Response to Motion set to 8/27/04 for [30-1] motion for Summary Judgment , United States may file a Reply Brief in Support set to 9/3/04 for [30-1] motion for Summary Judgment , Court will hear oral argument Motion Hearing set for 10:00 10/8/04 for [30-1] motion for Summary Judgment (signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 8/13/04) CM all parties of record. (mad) (Entered: 08/13/2004)
08/26/2004	36	BRIEF by CITY OF ERIE, PA in opposition to [30-1] motion for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES (nk) (Entered: 08/26/2004)
08/26/2004	37	APPENDIX to [36-1] brief in opposition by CITY OF ERIE, PA (nk) (Entered: 08/26/2004)
09/03/2004	38	REPLY BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [30-1] motion for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 09/09/2004)
10/08/2004	39	AFFIDAVIT by Paul O. Davis PH.D. (nk) (Entered: 10/08/2004)
10/14/2004	40	Hearing on Motion held 10/8/04 10:00 a.m. before McLaughlin, J. re: DENIED for reasons set forth on the record [30-1] motion for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES [Reporter: Ferguson & Holdnack] (mad) (Entered: 10/15/2004)
10/22/2004	41	TRANSCRIPT of Hearing for date of 10/8/04 before McLaughlin, J. Court Reporter: Sondra A. Black. (mad) (Entered: 10/25/2004)
10/25/2004	42	RESPONSE by CITY OF ERIE, PA to Pltf's Motion to Compel or

		Strike Expert Testimony regarding New York Police Study (mad) (Entered: 10/25/2004)
10/25/2004	43	MOTION by UNITED STATES to Compel , to Strike Testimony Regarding The New York City Police Department Study with Proposed Order. (mad) Modified on 10/26/2004 (Entered: 10/26/2004)
10/26/2004	44	BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [43-1] motion to Compel by UNITED STATES, [43-2] motion to Strike Testimony Regarding The New York City Police Department Study by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 10/26/2004)
10/26/2004	45	Hearing on Motion held 10/26/04 @ 1:35 p.m. before McLaughlin, J. re: [43-1] GRANTED--- motion to Compel by UNITED STATES [Reporter: R. Bench] Non-Jury Trial set for 2/28/05 at 9:00 a.m. Proposed Findings of fact and Conclusions of due 2/21/05 (mad) (Entered: 10/26/2004)
10/26/2004		Deadline updated; set Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law deadline for 2/23/04 , set Non-Jury Trial for 9:00 2/28/05 (mad) (Entered: 10/26/2004)
10/26/2004	46	NOTICE Non-Jury Trial set for 9:00 2/28/05 before McLaughlin, J. (mad) (Entered: 10/27/2004)
11/01/2004	47	TRANSCRIPT of MOTION TO COMPEL for date of 10/26/04. Court Reporter: Ron Bench. (nk) (Entered: 11/01/2004)
11/03/2004	48	MOTION by CITY OF ERIE, PA for Protective Order regarding RAW DATA of New York City Police Study with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 11/03/2004)
11/03/2004	49	BRIEF by CITY OF ERIE, PA in support of [48-1] motion for Protective Order regarding RAW DATA of New York City Police Study by CITY OF ERIE, PA (mad) (Entered: 11/03/2004)
11/09/2004	50	RESPONSE by UNITED STATES in opposition to [48-1] motion for Protective Order regarding RAW DATA of New York City Police Study by CITY OF ERIE, PA (mad) (Entered: 11/09/2004)
11/09/2004	51	Hearing on Motion held 11/9/04 @ 11:45 a.m. before McLaughlin, J. re: [48-1] DENIED (for reasons stated on the record.) motion for Protective Order regarding RAW DATA of New York City Police Study by CITY OF ERIE, PA [Reporter: Ron Bench] Any reference to New York Study will be excised from Deft's Expert's Report. (mad) (Entered: 11/10/2004)
11/10/2004	52	DECLARATION by UNITED STATES Bernard R. Siskin, Ph.D and Leonard A. Cupingood, Ph.D, Expert Witnesses, in support of the Re: [50-1] opposition response by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 11/10/2004)

		11/12/2004)
12/02/2004	53	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance for CITY OF ERIE, PA by Kenneth A. Zak (mad) (Entered: 12/02/2004)
12/09/2004	54	JOINT MOTION by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA to Extend Time to file expert Rebuttal Reports with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 12/10/2004)
12/13/2004		ORDER upon motion granting [54-1] joint motion to Extend Time to file expert Rebuttal Reports to 12/30/04. (signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 12/13/04) CM all parties of record. (mad) (Entered: 12/14/2004)
01/31/2005	56	JOINT MOTION by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA for Pretrial Schedule with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 02/01/2005)
01/31/2005	57	BRIEF by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA in support of [56-1] joint motion for Pretrial Schedule by CITY OF ERIE, PA, UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/01/2005)
02/01/2005	55	PRETRIAL STATEMENT by CITY OF ERIE, PA (sdp) (Entered: 02/01/2005)
02/01/2005	58	MOTION by UNITED STATES to exclude Testimony Pursuant to F.R.Evid. 702 with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 02/02/2005)
02/01/2005	59	BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [58-1] motion to exclude Testimony Pursuant to F.R.Evid. 702 by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/02/2005)
02/02/2005		ORDER upon motion granting [56-1] joint motion for Pretrial Schedule, set Pretrial Order Deadlines: Pretrial Statements for (as functional Plaintiffs) City of Erie due 1/31/05 ; Pretrial Statements for (as functional Defendants) United States due 2/14/05 ; Pretrial Conference set for 9:00 2/25/05 ; Motion Filing deadline due 2/14/05 ; Response to motions due 2/23/05 ; (signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 2/2/05) CM all parties of record. (mad) (Entered: 02/03/2005)
02/07/2005	60	Status Conference held 2/4/05 @ 11:35 a.m. before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin [Reporter: Ron Bench] City to respond to USA's Dauberl motion w/in 10 days Trial moved to March 7, 2005. Pretrial conference remains scheduled for 2/25/05 @ 9:00 a.m. Pretrial Memorand & proposed finding of fact and conclusinons of law may be filed by 2/23/05. (mad) (Entered: 02/07/2005)
02/10/2005	61	Stipulation by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA with proposed order. (mad) (Entered: 02/10/2005)

02/12/2005	62	Status Conference held 2/11/05 before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin [Reporter: Ron Bench] (mad) (Entered: 02/12/2005)
02/14/2005	63	RESPONSE by CITY OF ERIE, PA to [58-1] motion to exclude Testimony Pursuant to F.R.Evid. 702 by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/14/2005)
02/14/2005	64	PRETRIAL STATEMENT by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/15/2005)
02/14/2005	65	MOTION by UNITED STATES in Limine with Proposed Order. (mad) (Entered: 02/15/2005)
02/14/2005	66	BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [65-1] motion in Limine by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/15/2005)
02/15/2005	67	EXPERT REPORT by UNITED STATES (sdp) (Entered: 02/16/2005)
02/23/2005	68	Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law by CITY OF ERIE, PA (mad) (Entered: 02/23/2005)
02/23/2005	69	TRIAL BRIEF by CITY OF ERIE, PA (mad) (Entered: 02/23/2005)
02/23/2005	70	REPLY BRIEF by UNITED STATES in support of [58-1] motion to exclude Testimony Pursuant to F.R.Evid. 702 by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/24/2005)
02/23/2005	71	OBJECTIONS to Deft, CITY OF ERIE'S Proposed Trial Exhibits and Witnesses by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/24/2005)
02/23/2005	72	TRIAL BRIEF by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/24/2005)
02/23/2005	73	Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law by UNITED STATES (mad) (Entered: 02/24/2005)
02/28/2005	74	Pre-Trial Conference held 2/25/05 before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin [Reporter: Ron Bench] Pltf's Motion (Doc. 58-1) to exclude testimony Pursuant to F.R.Evid. 702 is DENIED w/o Prejudice and Pltf's Motion (Doc. 65-1) in limine is DENIED w/o prjudice as set forth on the record. (mad) (Entered: 02/28/2005)
03/01/2005	75	DEPOSITION of Barber, Benge, Bowers, Dahlstrand, Davis DeDionisio, Emerick, Fetterman, Filippi, Ford, Haller, Hines, Kemling, Kovacs, Kress, Kuhn, Mangan, Nowkeji, Putnam, Raszkowski, Szocki, Szoszorek, Tempestini (mad) (Entered: 03/01/2005)
03/02/2005	76	TRANSCRIPT PRETRIAL MOTIONS & PRETRIAL CONFERENCE for date of 2/25/05 before McLaughlin, J. Court Reporter: Ronald J. Bench. (mad) (Entered: 03/02/2005)
03/07/2005		Non-Jury Trial begins 3/7/05. Continued to 3/8/05 before Judge Sean J.

		McLaughlin (mad) (Entered: 03/14/2005)
03/08/2005		Non-Jury Trial continued to 3/9/05 before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin (mad) (Entered: 03/14/2005)
03/09/2005		Non-Jury Trial continued to 3/10/05 before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin (mad) (Entered: 03/14/2005)
03/10/2005	77	Non-Jury Trial before McLaughlin concluded 3/10/05 . Court Reporter: Ron Bench. Upon receipt of the trial transcript, Deft has 20 days in which to submit supplemental Proposed Findings of Fact & Conclusions of Law. Pltf has 20 days thereafter in which to submit its own supplemental proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law. (mad) (Entered: 03/14/2005)
05/24/2005	78	TRANSCRIPT of Non-Jury Day No. 1 before McLaughlin, J. for date of 3/7/05. Court Reporter: Ronald J. Bench. (mad) (Entered: 05/24/2005)
05/24/2005	79	TRANSCRIPT of Non-Jury Trial - Day No. 2 for date of 3/8/05 before McLaughlin, J. Court Reporter: Ronald J. Bench. (mad) (Entered: 05/24/2005)
05/24/2005	80	TRANSCRIPT of Non-Jury Trial - Day No. 3 for date of 3/9/05 before McLaughlin, J. Court Reporter: Ronald J. Bench. (mad) (Entered: 05/24/2005)
05/24/2005	81	TRANSCRIPT of Non - Jury Trial - Day No. 4 for date of 3/10/05 before McLaughlin, J. Court Reporter: Ronald J. Bench. (mad) (Entered: 05/24/2005)
06/10/2005	82	POST-TRIAL BRIEF by CITY OF ERIE, PA (mad) (Entered: 06/13/2005)
06/30/2005	83	Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law by UNITED STATES. (mad) (Entered: 07/01/2005)
06/30/2005	84	Witness and Exhibit List by UNITED STATES.. (mad) (Entered: 07/01/2005)
06/30/2005	85	PROPOSED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW (mad) (Entered: 07/01/2005)
12/13/2005	86	FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 12/13/05. (kas) (Entered: 12/13/2005)
12/13/2005	87	PARTIAL JUDGMENT in favor of Plaintiff against Defendant on the issue of liability. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 12/13/05. (kas) (Entered: 12/13/2005)
12/15/2005	88	NOTICE of Hearing: Status Conference set for 1/6/2006 at 1:30 PM in Courtroom C before the Honorable Sean J. McLaughlin. (nk) (Entered: 12/15/2005)

		12/15/2005)
01/06/2006		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin : Status Conference held on 1/6/2006. A proposed settlement conference is scheduled for 1/27/06 at 9:00 a.m. Within 10 days Plaintiff will notify Defendant of Settlement proposal. This is a text only entry; no PDF document attached; this is an official Court entry. (Court Reporter Ron Bench.) (nk) (Entered: 01/06/2006)
01/09/2006	89	TRANSCRIPT of Status Conference Proceedings held on 1/6/06 before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin. Court Reporter: Ron Bench. Request for Redaction of specific personal identifiers 1/24/2006. (sdp) (Entered: 01/09/2006)
01/10/2006		TEXT NOTICE of Hearing: Settlement Conference set for 1/27/2006 at 9:00 AM in Courtroom C before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin. This is a text-only notice; no PDF document attached; this is an Official Court Notice.(nk) (Entered: 01/10/2006)
01/27/2006		TEXT NOTICE of Hearing: Settlement Conference set for 2/10/2006 at 9:00 AM in Courtroom C before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin. This is a text-only Notice; no PDF Document attached; this is an Official Court Notice. (nk) (Entered: 01/27/2006)
01/27/2006	90	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin: Settlement Conference held on 1/27/2006. (Court Reporter Janice Ferguson.) (nk) (Entered: 01/27/2006)
02/10/2006		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin : Settlement conference held on 2/10/2006. This is a text-only Minute Entry; no PDF document attached; this is an Official Court Minute Entry. (nk) Modified on 2/10/2006 (nk). (Entered: 02/10/2006)
02/10/2006		Errata re Scheduling Conference Reason for Correction: Wrong event selected. (nk) (Entered: 02/10/2006)
02/27/2006	91	MOTION to Withdraw as Attorney by PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION. (sdp) (Entered: 02/27/2006)
02/27/2006		TEXT ORDER granting 91 Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. Attorney Katherine H. Fein terminated. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 2/27/06. This is a text-only Order; no PDF document attached; this is an Official Court Order. (nk) (Entered: 02/27/2006)
03/07/2006	92	PROPOSED CONSENT DECREE by CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Villella, Gerald) (Entered: 03/07/2006)
03/10/2006		TEXT ORDER re 92 Consent Decree filed by CITY OF ERIE, PA.,. Consent Decree is PROVISIONALLY APPROVED subject to teh fairness hearing. This is a text only Order; no PDF document attached;

		this is an Official Court Order. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 3/10/06. (nk) (Entered: 03/10/2006)
03/10/2006	93	ORDER re: Consent Decree, Fairness Hearing set for 6/15/2006 at 9:30 AM in Courtroom C before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 3/10/06. (nk) (Entered: 03/10/2006)
04/13/2006	94	OBJECTIONS to Entry of the Consent Decree by THOMAS EDWARD BORRELLI. (sdp) (Entered: 04/13/2006)
04/26/2006	95	OBJECTIONS to PROPOSED CONSENT DECREE by MARK SANDERS. (sdp) (Entered: 04/26/2006)
05/02/2006	96	OBJECTIONS to the Entry of the Consent Decree by ZABRINA THOMPSON. (sdp) (Entered: 05/02/2006)
05/04/2006	97	OBJECTIONS to <i>the Entry of the Consent Decree</i> by Police Relief and Pension Association of Erie, Pennsylvania. (Spero, Joseph) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	98	OBJECTIONS to THE ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by LINDA A. WOLCOTT. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	99	OBJECTIONS to THE ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by GREGORY L. BANEY. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	100	OBJECTIONS to THE ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by JOHN M. BARBER. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	101	OBJECTIONS to THE ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by PAMELA A. BARBER. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	102	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by ROBERT K. BORLAND. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	103	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by MICHAEL F. BRADY. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	104	OBJECTIONS to THE ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by MICHAEL BURROWS. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	105	OBJECTIONS to THE ENTRY OF THE CONSENT DECREE by JEFF DAHLSTRAND. (sdp) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006	106	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ANTHONY J. DEBACCO. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	107	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by STEVEN DELUCA. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	108	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ADAM

		DIGILARMO. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	109	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by DOMINIC DILULLO. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	110	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by PATRICK DURKIN. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	111	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ERIE FOP #7. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	112	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by THOMAS J. FALCONER. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	113	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by LES FETTERMAN. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	114	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by KEVIN C. FRIES. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	115	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by CHARLES R. FUHRMAN. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	116	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by DONALD J. FUHRMANN, JR. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	117	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by DAMYAN GRAVES. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	118	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by MATTHEW GUSTAFSON. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	119	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ROBERT W. HILL. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	120	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JOHN B. HOLMES, JR. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	121	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by DAVID F. HUDSON. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	122	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JAMES C. HUNTER. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	123	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JULIE A. KEMLING. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	124	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by KENNETH KENSILL. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	125	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by SCOTT A. KORNETZ. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)

05/04/2006	126	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by BRUCE E. KOSKO. (jd) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
05/04/2006	127	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by CHRIS LAWRENCE. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	128	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by BRYAN C. LECHNER. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	129	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JACOB LETKIEWICZ. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	130	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by MICHAEL R. MANCUSO. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	131	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by WILLIAM MARUCCI, II. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	132	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by EARL MATSON. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	133	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ROBERT H. MCDONALD, JR. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	134	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JAMES D. MCLELLAN. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	135	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by RYAN ONDERKO. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	136	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by DENNIS F. OBORSKI. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	137	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE #1 by JAMES PIETRAS. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	138	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE #2 by JAMES PIETRAS. (jd) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/04/2006	139	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by GLENN A. ROGERS. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	140	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JAMIE RUSSO. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	141	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by MARK J. SENNETT. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	142	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by DANIEL SPIZARNY. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	143	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by NICK

		STADLER. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	144	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by J. TRIANA. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	145	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by SALVADOR VELEZ. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	146	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by DAVID P. WALKER. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	148	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by LUKE J. YATES. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	149	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by MICHAEL A. WOLF. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	150	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by THEODORE F. WISNIEWSKI. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	151	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JAY E. WHITE. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/04/2006	152	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ROBERT WIERBINSKI. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/05/2006	147	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ROBERT E. WILLIAMS. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/08/2006	153	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by MELANIE SZOSZOREK. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/08/2006	154	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by ETHEL L. EASTER. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
05/08/2006	155	OBJECTIONS to ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE by JUDITH GARCIA. (jd) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
06/01/2006	156	RESPONSE TO OBJECTIONS TO CONSENT DECREE to 145 Objections To, 134 Objections To, 94 Objections To, 119 Objections To, 99 Objections To, 155 Objections To, 150 Objections To, 97 Objections To, 117 Objections To, 110 Objections To, 151 Objections To, 154 Objections To, 136 Objections To, 127 Objections To, 148 Objections To, 153 Objections To, 142 Objections To, 133 Objections To, 109 Objections To, 107 Objections To, 130 Objections To, 122 Objections To, 98 Objections To, 113 Objections To, 138 Objections To, 106 Objections To, 128 Objections To, 135 Objections To, 141 Objections To, 124 Objections To, 137 Objections To, 112 Objections To, 95 Objections To, 152 Objections To, 120 Objections To, 104 Objections To, 101 Objections To, 139 Objections To, 114 Objections

		To, 118 Objections To, 132 Objections To, 129 Objections To, 103 Objections To, 121 Objections To, 126 Objections To, 147 Objections To, 140 Objections To, 115 Objections To, 149 Objections To, 146 Objections To, 116 Objections To, 96 Objections To, 131 Objections To, 125 Objections To, 123 Objections To, 105 Objections To, 111 Objections To, 144 Objections To, 143 Objections To, 108 Objections To, 100 Objections To, 102 Objections To filed by CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Villella, Gerald) (Entered: 06/01/2006)
06/06/2006	157	MEMORANDUM RESPONSE <i>To Objections and In Support of Final Entry of Consent Decree</i> to 145 Objections To, 94 Objections To, 119 Objections To, 155 Objections To, 97 Objections To, 151 Objections To, 154 Objections To, 148 Objections To, 142 Objections To, 133 Objections To, 109 Objections To, 107 Objections To, 122 Objections To, 113 Objections To, 135 Objections To, 141 Objections To, 137 Objections To, 112 Objections To, 95 Objections To, 152 Objections To, 120 Objections To, 101 Objections To, 132 Objections To, 140 Objections To, 115 Objections To, 149 Objections To, 146 Objections To, 116 Objections To, 96 Objections To, 123 Objections To, 111 Objections To, 144 Objections To, 143 Objections To, 108 Objections To, 100 Objections To, 134 Objections To, 99 Objections To, 150 Objections To, 117 Objections To, 110 Objections To, 136 Objections To, 127 Objections To, 153 Objections To, 130 Objections To, 98 Objections To, 106 Objections To, 138 Objections To, 128 Objections To, 124 Objections To, 104 Objections To, 139 Objections To, 114 Objections To, 118 Objections To, 129 Objections To, 103 Objections To, 121 Objections To, 126 Objections To, 147 Objections To, 125 Objections To, 131 Objections To, 105 Objections To, 102 Objections To filed by UNITED STATES. (Attachments: # 1 Appendix Part I# 2 Appendix Part II)(Smolar, Jessica) (Entered: 06/06/2006)
06/15/2006	158	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin : Evidentiary Hearing held on 6/15/2006. (Court Reporter Sonya Hoffman.) (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit and Witness List# 2 Exhibit 1-Easter Exhibit# 3 Exhibit 1-FOP) (nk) Modified on 6/16/2006 (sdp,). (Entered: 06/15/2006)
06/15/2006		TEXT ORDER re 92 Consent Decree filed by CITY OF ERIE, PA, Approved subject to Amendments to Appendix A as set forth on the Record. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 6/15/06. This is a text only Order; no PDF document attached; this is an Official Court Order. (nk) (Entered: 06/15/2006)
06/19/2006	159	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings held on June 15, 2006 before Judge McLaughlin. Court Reporter: Sonya Hoffman. The parties have five (5) business days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript

		may be made remotely, electronically available to the public without redaction. Any party needing a copy of the transcript to review for redaction purposes may purchase a copy from the court or the court reporter/transcriber. Notice of Intent for Redaction of Personal Data Identifiers due by 7/3/2006. (dm) (Entered: 06/19/2006)
06/26/2006	160	OBJECTIONS to the Entry of the Consent Decree by FRANCES BOOTH. (sdp) (Entered: 06/26/2006)
09/08/2006	161	MOTION for Hearing (<i>Request for Scheduling of Fairness Hearing on Individual Relief and Submission of Relief Awards List</i>) by UNITED STATES. (Attachments: # 1 Relief Awards List# 2 Attachment 1# 3 Attachment 2# 4 Proposed Order)(Smolar, Jessica) (Entered: 09/08/2006)
09/08/2006	162	ORDER granting 161 Motion for Hearing (Request for Scheduling of Fairness Hearing on Individual Relief and Submission of Relief Awards List) filed by UNITED STATES, Fairness Hearing set for 11/20/2006 at 9:00 AM in Courtroom C before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 9/8/06. (nk) (Entered: 09/08/2006)
10/02/2006	163	RESPONSE <i>Defendant's First Set of Objections to Relief Awards List</i> to 161 Motion for Hearing, filed by CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Attachments: # 1 # 2 # 3)(Vilella, Gerald) (Entered: 10/02/2006)
10/02/2006		TEXT NOTICE of TELEPHONIC Status Conference set for 10/5/2006 at 10:30 AM before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin re: Defendant's first set of objections to relief awards list. Attorney Karle will initiate the call with all counsel on the line and call the conference line at 814-464-9615. Text-only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text-only entry constitutes the Court's order or notice on the matter.(nk) Modified on 10/5/2006 (nk). (Entered: 10/02/2006)
10/05/2006		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin : Status Conference held on 10/5/2006. City of Erie to File a Motion to Compel with supporting brief on or before 10/16/06; Brief in Opposition due 7 days upon receipt. Text-only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text-only entry constitutes the Court's order or notice on the matter. (Court Reporter Ron Bench.) (nk) (Entered: 10/05/2006)
10/16/2006	164	MOTION to Compel Production of Documents by CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Attachments: # 1)(Vilella, Gerald) (Entered: 10/16/2006)
10/16/2006	165	BRIEF in Support re 164 MOTION to Compel Production of Documents filed by CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Vilella, Gerald) (Entered: 10/16/2006)

10/16/2006	166	OBJECTIONS to 92 Consent Decree by ZABRINA THOMPSON. (sdp) (Entered: 10/16/2006)
10/20/2006	167	OBJECTIONS to <i>Individual Relief Awards--Detailed</i> 161 Motion for Hearing, by CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Villella, Gerald) (Entered: 10/20/2006)
10/23/2006	168	RESPONSE to Motion re 164 MOTION to Compel Production of Documents filed by UNITED STATES. (Attachments: # 1 Attachment 1)(Smolar, Jessica) (Entered: 10/23/2006)
10/23/2006	169	OBJECTIONS to U.S. Determination Regarding Individual Relief to be awarded under the Consent Decree by FATINA GIBBS. (sdp) (Entered: 10/23/2006)
10/23/2006	170	OBJECTIONS to U.S. Determination Regarding Individual Relief to be awarded under the Consent Decree by TRELANE BATTLES SHERROD. (sdp) (Entered: 10/23/2006)
11/07/2006	171	Unopposed MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Relief Awards List</i> by UNITED STATES. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order # 2 Corrected Relief Awards List)(Smolar, Jessica) (Entered: 11/07/2006)
11/08/2006	172	STIPULATION by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Attachments: # 1 Attachment 1# 2 Attachment 2# 3 Attachment 3# 4 Attachment 4# 5 Attachment 5# 6 Attachment 6# 7 Attachment 7# 8 Attachment 8# 9 Attachment 9)(Smolar, Jessica) (Entered: 11/08/2006)
11/09/2006	173	RESPONSE to 170 Objections To, 167 Objections To, 169 Objections To filed by UNITED STATES. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1# 2 Exhibit 2# 3 Exhibit 3)(Smolar, Jessica) (Entered: 11/09/2006)
11/13/2006	174	ORDER granting 171 Motion to Amend/Correct. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 11/13/06. (nk) (Entered: 11/13/2006)
11/14/2006	175	STIPULATION (<i>Second Set of Relief Phase Stipulations</i>) by UNITED STATES, CITY OF ERIE, PA. (Smolar, Jessica) (Entered: 11/14/2006)
11/17/2006	176	MEMORANDUM ORDER denying 164 Motion to Compel Production of Documents Regarding Proposed Relief Awards. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 11/17/06. (kas) (Entered: 11/17/2006)
11/20/2006	177	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin : Fairness Hearing held on 11/20/2006. Plaintiff's Oral Motion in Limine to exclude evidence as to various written civil service exams is GRANTED. Objections to Plaintiff's relief determinations are overruled and the relief determinations, as amended will be upheld. Judgment order to follow. (Court Reporter Ron Bench.) (nk) Modified on 11/20/2006 (nk). (Entered: 11/20/2006)

11/20/2006	178	JUDGMENT in favor of Claimants and against City of Erie in the total amount of \$170,000.00 see attached exhibit 1. Signed by Judge Sean J. McLaughlin on 11/20/06. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit- Relief Awards List)(nk) (Entered: 11/20/2006)
11/24/2006	179	TRANSCRIPT of Fairness Hearing Proceedings held on 11-20-06 before Judge Sean J. McLaughlin. Court Reporter: Ron Bench. The parties have five (5) business days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely, electronically available to the public without redaction. Any party needing a copy of the transcript to review for redaction purposes may purchase a copy from the court or the court reporter/transcriber. Notice of Intent for Redaction of Personal Data Identifiers due by 12/8/2006. (sdp,) (Entered: 11/24/2006)