

**U.S. District Court  
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-01076-BAH**

NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE et al v. CARSON et al  
Assigned to: Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell  
Cause: 05:551 Administrative Procedure Act

Date Filed: 05/08/2018  
Date Terminated: 08/17/2018  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING  
ALLIANCE**

represented by **Ajmel A. Quereshi**  
NAACP LEGAL DEFENSE AND  
EDUCATIONAL FUND, INC  
700 14th Street NW  
Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 216-5574  
Fax: (202) 682-1312  
Email: [aquereshi@naacpldf.org](mailto:aquereshi@naacpldf.org)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Allison Marcy Zieve**  
PUBLIC CITIZEN LITIGATION GROUP  
1600 20th Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20009  
(202) 588-1000  
Fax: (202) 588-7795  
Email: [azieve@citizen.org](mailto:azieve@citizen.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Arthur B. Spitzer**  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA  
915 15th Street, NW  
2nd Floor  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 601-4266  
Fax: (202) 457-0805  
Email: [artspitzer@gmail.com](mailto:artspitzer@gmail.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Jon M. Greenbaum**  
LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL  
RIGHTS UNDER LAW  
1500 K Street, NW  
Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 662-8325  
Email: [jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org](mailto:jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Michael Gerhart Allen**  
RELMAN, DANE & COLFAX PLLC  
1225 19th Street, NW  
Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 728-1888 ext. 603  
Fax: (202) 728-0848

Email: [mallen@relmanlaw.com](mailto:mallen@relmanlaw.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Morgan Whitney Williams**  
NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING  
ALLIANCE  
1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 650  
Washington, DC 20004  
(202) 898-1661  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sara K. Pratt**  
RELMAN, DANE & COLFAX PLLC  
1225 19th Street, NW  
Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 728-1888  
Fax: (202) 728-0848  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thomas Silverstein**  
LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL  
RIGHTS UNDER LAW  
1401 New York Avenue, NW  
Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 662-8316  
Email: [tsilverstein@lawyerscommittee.org](mailto:tsilverstein@lawyerscommittee.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sasha Samberg-Champion**  
RELMAN, DANE & COLFAX PLLC  
1225 19th Street, NW  
Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 728-1888  
Fax: (202) 728-0848  
Email: [ssamberg-champion@relmanlaw.com](mailto:ssamberg-champion@relmanlaw.com)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING  
INFORMATION SERVICE**

represented by **Ajmel A. Quereshi**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sara K. Pratt**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Allison Marcy Zieve**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Arthur B. Spitzer**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jon M. Greenbaum**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Michael Gerhart Allen**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Morgan Whitney Williams**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thomas Silverstein**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sasha Samberg–Champion**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**TEXAS APPLESEED**

represented by **Ajmel A. Quereshi**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sara K. Pratt**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Allison Marcy Zieve**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Arthur B. Spitzer**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jon M. Greenbaum**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Melissa Madison Sloan**  
TEXAS APPLESEED  
1609 Shoal Creek Boulevard  
Suite 201  
Austin, TX 78701  
(512) 473–2800  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Michael Gerhart Allen**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Morgan Whitney Williams**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thomas Silverstein**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sasha Samberg–Champion**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**BENJAMIN S. CARSON, SR.**  
*in his official capacity as Secretary of the  
U.S. Department of Housing and Urban  
Development*

represented by **Daniel J. Halainen**  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
1100 L Street, NW  
Room 12304  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 616–8101  
Fax: (202) 616–8470  
Email: [daniel.j.halainen@usdoj.gov](mailto:daniel.j.halainen@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING  
AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT**

represented by **Daniel J. Halainen**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Movant**

**STATE OF NEW YORK**

represented by **Lilia Isobel Toson**  
NEW YORK STATE OFFICE OF THE  
ATTORNEY GENERAL  
Civil Rights Bureau  
28 Liberty Street  
19th Street  
New York, NY 10005  
(212) 416–6365  
Email: [Lilia.Toson@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Lilia.Toson@ag.ny.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Matthew Colangelo**  
NEW YORK STATE OFFICE OF THE  
ATTORNEY GENERAL  
28 Liberty Street  
19th Floor  
New York, NY 10005  
(212) 416–6057  
Email: [Matthew.Colangelo@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Matthew.Colangelo@ag.ny.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Amicus**

**POLICYLINK**

represented by **Stanley Joseph Brown**  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
390 Madison Ave  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 918–3692  
Fax: (212) 918–3100  
Email: [stanley.brown@hoganlovells.com](mailto:stanley.brown@hoganlovells.com)

*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Adrienne Gittens**  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
1735 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
(267) 675-4657  
Fax: (267) 675-4601  
Email: [adrienne.gittens@hoganlovells.com](mailto:adrienne.gittens@hoganlovells.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Amicus**

**NATIONAL HOUSING LAW  
PROJECT**

represented by **Shaylyn Capri Cochran**  
COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL  
PLLC  
1100 New York Avenue, NW  
Suite 500 East Tower  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 408-3614  
Fax: (202) 408-4699  
Email: [scochran@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:scochran@cohenmilstein.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Amicus**

**STATE OF MARYLAND**

represented by **John Robert Grimm**  
MARYLAND OFFICE OF THE  
ATTORNEY GENERAL  
Civil Litigation Division  
200 St. Paul Place  
Baltimore, MD 21202  
(410) 576-6339  
Fax: (410) 576-6955  
Email: [jgrimm@oag.state.md.us](mailto:jgrimm@oag.state.md.us)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Amicus**

**STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

**Amicus**

**COMMONWEALTH OF  
MASSACHUSETTS**

**Amicus**

**COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA**

**Amicus**

**STATE OF WASHINGTON**

**Amicus**

**DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

**Amicus**

**CITY OF AUSTIN, TEXAS**

**Amicus**

**CITY OF NEW ORLEANS**

Amicus

CITY OF OAKLAND

Amicus

CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON

Amicus

CITY OF SEATTLE, THE

Amicus

CITY OF TOLEDO

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/08/2018	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT ( Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0090-5467308) filed by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>2</u> Summons Ben Carson, # <u>3</u> Summons HUD)(Samberg-Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Maxwell Ciardullo, # <u>3</u> Declaration of Janet Hostetler, # <u>4</u> Declaration of Justin Steil, # <u>5</u> Declaration of Madison Sloan, # <u>6</u> Declaration of Deborah Goldberg, # <u>7</u> Declaration of John Henneberger, # <u>8</u> Declaration of Lisa Rice, # <u>9</u> Declaration of Daniel Urevick-Ackelsberg, # <u>10</u> Memorandum in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Summary Judgment)(Samberg-Champion, Sasha). Added MOTION for Summary Judgment on 5/18/2018 (zrdj). (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>3</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Allison Marcy Zieve on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Zieve, Allison) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Ajmel A. Quereshi on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Quereshi, Ajmel) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018		Case Assigned to Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell. (zmd) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>5</u>	SUMMONS (4) Issued Electronically as to BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice and Consent) (zmd) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Thomas Silverstein on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Silverstein, Thomas) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>7</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Arthur B. Spitzer on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>8</u>	STANDING ORDER. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on May 8, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>9</u>	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed as to the United States Attorney. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney on 5/8/2018. Answer due for ALL FEDERAL DEFENDANTS by 7/7/2018. (Samberg-Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/09/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) ISSUING the following SCHEDULING ORDER to control the timing of proceedings in this matter: (1) by May 15, 2018, the defendants shall file any Opposition to the plaintiffs' <u>2</u> Motion For A Preliminary Injunction And For Expedited Summary Judgment, <i>see</i> LCvR 65.1(c); and (2) by May 22, 2018, the plaintiffs shall file any Reply to the defendants' Opposition. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on May 9, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 05/09/2018)

05/10/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Opposition to <u>2</u> Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment due by 5/15/2018; Reply due by 5/22/2018. (tg) (Entered: 05/10/2018)
05/10/2018	<u>10</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Michael Gerhart Allen on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Allen, Michael) (Entered: 05/10/2018)
05/10/2018	<u>11</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Daniel J. Halainen on behalf of All Defendants (Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 05/10/2018)
05/10/2018	<u>12</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>2</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 05/10/2018)
05/10/2018		VACATED PURSUANT TO MINUTE ORDER DATED 5/23/2018.....MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the defendants' <u>12</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time, and ISSUING the following SCHEDULING ORDER to control the timing of proceedings in this matter: (1) the defendants shall file, by May 29, 2018, any response to the plaintiffs' <u>2</u> Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment; and (2) the plaintiffs shall file, by June 8, 2018, any reply to the defendants' response. It is further ORDERED that any <i>amicus</i> briefs shall be filed by May 22, 2018. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on May 10, 2018. (lcbah2) Modified on 5/25/2018 (zrdj). (Entered: 05/10/2018)
05/11/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Amicus briefs due by 5/22/2018; defendants' response to the <u>2</u> motion for preliminary injunction and for expedited summary judgment due by 5/29/2018; plaintiffs' reply due by 6/8/2018. (tg) (Entered: 05/11/2018)
05/14/2018	<u>13</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name– Melissa Madison Sloan, :Firm– Texas Appleseed, :Address– 1609 Shoal Creek Blvd, Suite 201, Austin, Texas 78701. Phone No. – (512) 473–2800. Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090–5480311. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Declaration of Melissa Madison Sloan)(Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 05/14/2018)
05/14/2018	<u>14</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name– Sara K. Pratt, :Firm– Relman, Dane & Colfax PLLC, :Address– 1225 19th Street NW, Suite 600, Washington, DC 20036. Phone No. – 202–728–1888. Fax No. – 202–728–0848 Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090–5480444. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Sara K. Pratt)(Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 05/14/2018)
05/15/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the plaintiffs' <u>13</u> Motion for Admission of Attorney <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Melissa Madison Sloan. Melissa Madison Sloan may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing the plaintiff Texas Appleseed in this action. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on May 15, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 05/15/2018)
05/15/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the plaintiffs' <u>14</u> Motion for Admission of Attorney <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Sara K. Pratt. Sara K. Pratt may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing the plaintiffs in this action. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on May 15, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 05/15/2018)
05/18/2018	<u>15</u>	NOTICE by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3)(Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 05/18/2018)
05/22/2018	<u>16</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT <i>and Motion to Set Briefing Schedule</i> by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 05/22/2018)
05/22/2018	<u>17</u>	MOTION for Briefing Schedule by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT (See docket entry <u>16</u> to view document)(zrdj) (Entered: 05/22/2018)

05/23/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING, upon consideration of the parties' <u>16</u> Joint Status Report and Motion to Set Briefing Schedule, the parties' <u>17</u> Motion for Briefing Schedule. Accordingly, this Court VACATES the Minute Order, dated May 10, 2018, and ISSUES the following SCHEDULING ORDER to control the timing of proceedings in this matter: (1) the plaintiffs shall file, by May 29, 2018, their Amended Complaint and Renewed Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment; (2) the defendants shall file, by June 12, 2018, any response to the plaintiffs' Renewed Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment; and (3) the plaintiffs shall file, by June 26, 2018, any reply to the defendants' response. It is further ORDERED that any amicus briefs shall be filed by June 5, 2018. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on May 23, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 05/23/2018)
05/23/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Plaintiff's Amended Complaint, Renewed Motion for Preliminary Injunction, and Expedited Summary Judgment due by 5/29/2018. Defendants' response to Plaintiff's Renewed Motion for Preliminary Injunction and Expedited Summary Judgment Motion due by 6/12/2018. Plaintiff's reply in support of its Renewed Motion for Preliminary Injunction and Expedited Summary Judgment due by 6/26/2018. Any amicus briefs due by 6/5/2018. (hmc) (Entered: 05/23/2018)
05/29/2018	<u>18</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against All Defendants filed by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE.(Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 05/29/2018)
05/29/2018	<u>19</u>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , MOTION for Summary Judgment by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Daniel Urevick–Ackelsberg, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Deborah Goldberg, # <u>3</u> Declaration of Franklin A. Lenk, # <u>4</u> Declaration of Maxwell Ciardullo, # <u>5</u> Declaration of Janet Hostetler, # <u>6</u> Declaration of John Henneberger, # <u>7</u> Declaration of Madison Sloan, # <u>8</u> Declaration of Justin Steil, # <u>9</u> Declaration of Lisa Rice, # <u>10</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>11</u> Memorandum in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction and Summary Judgment)(Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 05/29/2018)
05/31/2018	<u>20</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Stanley Joseph Brown on behalf of PolicyLink (Brown, Stanley) (Entered: 05/31/2018)
05/31/2018	<u>21</u>	Consent MOTION for Leave to File <i>Amicus Curiae</i> by PolicyLink (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Brown, Stanley) (Entered: 05/31/2018)
05/31/2018	<u>22</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name– Morgan Whitney Williams, :Firm– National Fair Housing Alliance, :Address– 1101 Vermont Ave NW, Suite 710, Washington DC, 20005. Phone No. – (202) 898–1661. Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090–5510235. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Morgan Whitney Williams)(Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 05/31/2018)
06/01/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING PolicyLink's <u>21</u> Consent Motion of <i>Amicus Curiae</i> PolicyLink for Leave. Accordingly, PolicyLink may file, by June 5, 2018, an amicus brief in support of the plaintiff's Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on June 1, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 06/01/2018)
06/01/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the plaintiffs' <u>22</u> Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Morgan Whitney Williams. Morgan Whitney Williams may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing the plaintiffs in this action. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on June 1, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 06/01/2018)
06/05/2018	<u>23</u>	MOTION for Leave to File <i>Brief of Amici Curiae</i> by NATIONAL HOUSING LAW PROJECT (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supplement Amicus Brief, # <u>2</u> Appendix, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Cochran, Shaylyn) (Entered: 06/05/2018)
06/05/2018	<u>24</u>	MOTION to Intervene <i>as Plaintiff</i> by State of New York (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Complaint in Intervention, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Colangelo, Matthew) (Entered: 06/05/2018)



06/05/2018	<u>25</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Matthew Colangelo on behalf of State of New York (Colangelo, Matthew) (Entered: 06/05/2018)
06/05/2018	<u>26</u>	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM to re <u>19</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by State of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Declaration of RuthAnne Visnauskas, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Declaration of Adam Salgado, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Declaration of Matt Murphy, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Unpublished Order, NRDC v. National Highway Traffic Safety Admin., Nos. 17-2780, 17-2806 (2d Cir. Apr. 23, 2018))(Colangelo, Matthew) (Entered: 06/05/2018)
06/05/2018	<u>27</u>	AMICUS BRIEF by STATE OF MARYLAND, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS, COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA, STATE OF WASHINGTON, DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, CITY OF AUSTIN, TEXAS, CITY OF NEW ORLEANS, CITY OF OAKLAND, CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON, CITY OF SEATTLE, THE, CITY OF TOLEDO re <u>19</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction MOTION for Summary Judgment (Grimm, John) Modified on 6/11/2018 to edit event (zrdj). (Entered: 06/05/2018)
06/05/2018	<u>28</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by John Robert Grimm on behalf of STATE OF MARYLAND (Grimm, John) (Entered: 06/05/2018)
06/05/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING National Housing Law Project and other housing, consumer, anti-homelessness, and anti-poverty advocates' <u>23</u> Motion by Housing, Consumer, Anti-Homelessness, and Anti-Poverty Advocates for Leave to File Brief of Amici Curiae. The Brief of Amici Curiae attached to the Motion, ECF No. 23-1, is hereby accepted. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on June 5, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 06/05/2018)
06/05/2018	<u>29</u>	AMICUS BRIEF by POLICYLINK re <u>19</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction MOTION for Summary Judgment (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Kalima S. Rose, # <u>2</u> Rose Exhibit 1, # <u>3</u> Rose Exhibit 2, # <u>4</u> Rose Exhibit 3, # <u>5</u> Rose Exhibit 4, # <u>6</u> Rose Exhibit 5, # <u>7</u> Declaration of Stanley J. Brown)(Brown, Stanley) Modified on 6/11/2018 to edit event (zrdj). (Entered: 06/05/2018)
06/05/2018	<u>30</u>	AMICUS BRIEF by NATIONAL HOUSING LAW PROJECT. (zrdj) (Entered: 06/06/2018)
06/06/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) DIRECTING, upon consideration of State of New York's <u>24</u> Motion to Intervene in Support of Plaintiffs that (1) the parties file, by June 19, 2018, any opposition to State of New York's <u>24</u> Motion, and (2) State of New York file, by June 26, 2018, any reply in support of its <u>24</u> Motion. In the meantime, the portion of State of New York's <u>24</u> Motion requesting that its <u>26</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Renewed Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Summary Judgment be considered as an amicus submission in support of the plaintiffs' <u>19</u> Motion is GRANTED. Accordingly, State of New York's <u>26</u> Memorandum of Law is hereby accepted and considered filed as of June 5, 2018. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on June 6, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 06/06/2018)
06/06/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Oppositions to the State of New York's <u>24</u> Motion, if any, due by 6/19/2018; State of New York's reply due by 6/26/2018. (tg) (Entered: 06/06/2018)
06/06/2018	<u>31</u>	NOTICE of Corrected Declaration of Kalima K. Rose by POLICYLINK re <u>29</u> Notice (Other), <u>19</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction MOTION for Summary Judgment (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Rose Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Rose Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Rose Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Rose Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Rose Exhibit 5)(Brown, Stanley) (Entered: 06/06/2018)
06/07/2018	<u>32</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Adrienne Gittens on behalf of POLICYLINK (Gittens, Adrienne) (Entered: 06/07/2018)
06/12/2018	<u>33</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>19</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Krista Mills, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Index, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 13)(Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 06/12/2018)
06/14/2018	<u>34</u>	NOTICE (Joint) of Availability by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT (Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 06/14/2018)

		06/14/2018)
06/15/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) SCHEDULING, upon consideration of the parties' <u>34</u> Joint Notice of Counsel's Availability, a hearing on the plaintiffs' <u>19</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment for July 18, 2018, at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 22A before Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on June 15, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 06/15/2018)
06/15/2018		Set/Reset Hearings: Preliminary Injunction Hearing scheduled for 7/18/2018, at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 22A before Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell. (tg) Modified hearing date on 6/15/2018 (tg). (Entered: 06/15/2018)
06/18/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) DENYING AS MOOT, upon consideration of the plaintiffs' <u>19</u> Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment, the plaintiffs' <u>2</u> Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on June 18, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 06/18/2018)
06/19/2018	<u>35</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>24</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>as Plaintiff</i> filed by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT. (Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 06/19/2018)
06/26/2018	<u>36</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>24</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>as Plaintiff</i> filed by STATE OF NEW YORK. (Colangelo, Matthew) (Entered: 06/26/2018)
06/26/2018	<u>37</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>19</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Justin Steil, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Deborah Goldberg)(Samberg-Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 06/26/2018)
07/09/2018		NOTICE that oral argument scheduled for July 18, 2018, at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 22A before Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell will be held on both the plaintiffs' <u>19</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment, as well as the State of New York's <u>24</u> Motion to Intervene in Support of Plaintiffs. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on July 9, 2018. (lcbah2) Modified title on 7/9/2018 (tg). (Entered: 07/09/2018)
07/09/2018	<u>38</u>	MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 07/09/2018)
07/11/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) POSTPONING the hearing scheduled for July 18, 2018, and DIRECTING the parties, in light of the defendants' <u>38</u> Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint, and to facilitate efficient review of all pending motions, to confer and advise the Court, by July 12, 2018, of dates between August 3 and 10, 2018, when counsel are available for a hearing to consider the plaintiffs' <u>19</u> Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment, the State of New York's <u>24</u> Motion to Intervene in Support of Plaintiffs, and the defendants' <u>38</u> Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on July 11, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 07/11/2018)
07/11/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Response to Order of the Court due by 7/12/2018. (tg) (Entered: 07/11/2018)
07/11/2018	<u>39</u>	NOTICE ( <i>Joint</i> ) of Counsel's Availability by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT re Order,, (Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 07/11/2018)
07/12/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) SCHEDULING, upon consideration of the parties' <u>39</u> Joint Notice of Counsel's Availability, a hearing on August 9, 2018, at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 22A before Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on all pending motions. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on July 12, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 07/12/2018)
07/12/2018		Set/Reset Hearings: Motions Hearing scheduled for 8/9/2018, at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 22A before Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell. (tg) (Entered: 07/12/2018)

07/23/2018	<u>40</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction filed by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE. (Samberg-Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 07/23/2018)
07/30/2018	<u>41</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction filed by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT. (Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 07/30/2018)
08/01/2018	<u>42</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Lilia Isobel Toson on behalf of STATE OF NEW YORK (Toson, Lilia) (Entered: 08/01/2018)
08/07/2018	<u>43</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Jon M. Greenbaum on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Greenbaum, Jon) (Entered: 08/07/2018)
08/09/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell: Motion Hearing held on 8/9/2018, regarding <u>19</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction; MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by TEXAS APPLESEED, NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE; <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction filed by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT; <u>24</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>as Plaintiff</i> filed by STATE OF NEW YORK. The Court, after hearing argument, reserved its decision. (Court Reporter Elizabeth Saint-Loth.) (tg) (Entered: 08/09/2018)
08/14/2018	<u>44</u>	<p>TRANSCRIPT OF HEARING before Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell, held on 8-9-2018; Page Numbers: 1 – 106. Date of Issuance: 08-14-2018. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Elizabeth SaintLoth, Telephone number 202-354-3242, Transcripts may be ordered by submitting the <a href="#">Transcript Order Form</a></p> <p>For the first 90 days after this filing date, the transcript may be viewed at the courthouse at a public terminal or purchased from the court reporter refer enced above. After 90 days, the transcript may be accessed via PACER. Other transcript formats, (multi-page, condensed, CD or ASCII) may be purchased from the court reporter.</p> <p><b>NOTICE RE REDACTION OF TRANSCRIPTS:</b> The parties have twenty-one days to file with the court and the court reporter any request to redact personal identifiers from this transcript. If no such requests are filed, the transcript will be made available to the public via PACER without redaction after 90 days. The policy, which includes the five personal identifiers specifically covered, is located on our website at <a href="http://www.dcd.uscourts.gov">www.dcd.uscourts.gov</a>.</p> <p>Redaction Request due 9/4/2018. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/14/2018. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/12/2018.(Saint-Loth, Elizabeth) (Entered: 08/14/2018)</p>
08/16/2018	<u>45</u>	NOTICE of Post-Hearing Development by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking)(Samberg-Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 08/16/2018)
08/17/2018	<u>46</u>	ORDER DENYING the plaintiffs' <u>19</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment, DENYING New York State's <u>24</u> Motion to Intervene in Support of the Plaintiffs, and GRANTING the defendants' <u>38</u> Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint. See Order for further details. The Clerk of the Court is directed to close this case. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on August 17, 2018. (lcbah4) (Entered: 08/17/2018)
08/17/2018	<u>47</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION regarding the plaintiffs' <u>19</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction and for Expedited Summary Judgment, New York State's <u>24</u> Motion to Intervene in Support of Plaintiffs, and the defendants' <u>38</u> Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on August 17, 2018. (lcbah4) (Entered: 08/17/2018)
09/14/2018	<u>48</u>	MOTION to Alter Judgment by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Second Amended Complaint, # <u>2</u> Proposed Second

		Amended Complaint Redline, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Samberg–Champion, Sasha). Added MOTION to Amend/Correct on 9/17/2018 (zrdj). (Entered: 09/14/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>49</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>48</u> MOTION to Alter Judgment MOTION to Amend/Correct filed by BEN CARSON, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT. (Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
10/01/2018	<u>50</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>48</u> MOTION to Alter Judgment MOTION to Amend/Correct by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 10/01/2018)
10/02/2018		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the plaintiffs' <u>50</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time to File Reply Brief in Further Support of Motion to Amend the Judgement and for Leave to Amend the Complaint, and DIRECTING the plaintiffs to file their reply by October 9, 2018. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on October 2, 2018. (lcbah2) (Entered: 10/02/2018)
10/02/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Plaintiffs' reply in support of <u>48</u> motion due by 10/9/2018. (tg) (Entered: 10/02/2018)
10/09/2018	<u>51</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>48</u> MOTION to Alter Judgment MOTION to Amend/Correct filed by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE. (Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 10/09/2018)
10/16/2018	<u>52</u>	NOTICE of Change of Address by Daniel J. Halainen (Halainen, Daniel) (Entered: 10/16/2018)
03/11/2019	<u>53</u>	NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY by NATIONAL FAIR HOUSING ALLIANCE, TEXAS APPLESEED, TEXAS LOW INCOME HOUSING INFORMATION SERVICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1)(Samberg–Champion, Sasha) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
08/26/2019	<u>54</u>	ORDER DENYING the <u>48</u> Plaintiffs' Motion to Amend the Judgment and for Leave to Amend the Complaint. See Order for further details. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on August 26, 2019. (lcbah1) (Entered: 08/26/2019)
08/26/2019	<u>55</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION regarding the <u>48</u> Plaintiffs' Motion to Amend the Judgment and for Leave to Amend the Complaint. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on August 26, 2019. (lcbah1) (Entered: 08/26/2019)