

(MANx),CLOSED,DISCOVERY,MANADR,REOPENED

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT for the CENTRAL DISTRICT OF
CALIFORNIA (Western Division – Los Angeles)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:07-cv-05696-CAS-MAN**

Carolyn Robb Hootkins et al v. Michael Chertoff et al
Assigned to: Judge Christina A. Snyder
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Margaret A. Nagle
Case in other court: 9th CCA, 09-56019
Cause: 05:0701 Maritime Subsidy Board

Date Filed: 08/30/2007
Date Terminated: 04/05/2010
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 540 Mandamus & Other
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

Carolyn Robb Hootkins
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Alan R Diamante**
Alan R Diamante Law Offices
523 W Sixth Street Suite 210
Los Angeles, CA 90014
213-943-4555
Email: diamantelaw@aol.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Brent W Renison
Parrilli Renison
5285 S W Meadows Road, Suite 175
Lake Oswego, OR 97035
503-597-7190
Email: brent@entrylaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Ana Maria Moncayo-Gigax
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Alan R Diamante**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Brent W Renison
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Suzanne Henriette De Mailly
*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sara Cruz Vargas De Fisher
*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Raymond Lockett
*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Elsa Cecilia Brenteson
On behalf of themselves and all others

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)

similarly situated

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Pauline Marie Gobeil

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Dahianna Heard

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 04/30/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Rose Freeda Fishman–Corman

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Khin Thidar Win

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 04/30/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Diana Gejac Engstrom

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 05/05/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Maria Del Carmen Diaz–Ruiz

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 05/05/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Gladys Walsh

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 04/30/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Li Ju Lu

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Yelena Arias Angulo

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 05/05/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Purita Manuel Pointdexter

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 04/30/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Tracy Lee Rudl

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 04/30/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Dieu Ngoc Nguyen

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Agnieszka Bernstein

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 05/05/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sarah Bayor

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 05/05/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Stella Standifer

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Farah Batool

*On behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 05/05/2009*

represented by **Brent W Renison**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Michael Chertoff

*Secretary, US Department of Homeland
Security*

represented by **Elizabeth J Stevens**
United States Department of Justice
Office of Immigration Litigation – Civil
Division
PO Box 878 Ben Franklin Station
Washington, DC 20044
202–616–9752
Fax: 202–305–7000
Email: elizabeth.stevens@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Patricia E Bruckner

US Department of Justice
Office of Immigration Litigation –DCS
450 Fifth Street NW Suite 6028
Washington, DC 20530
202–532–4325
Fax: 202–616–8962
Email: patricia.bruckner@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sheri R Glaser
US Department of Justice
Office of Immigration Litigation – Civil
Division
PO Box 868
Ben Franklin Station
Washington, DC 20044
202-616-1231
Fax: 202-616-8962
Email: sheri.glaser@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 03/18/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John P Devaney
US Dept of Justice – Office of
Immigration Litigation
Ben Franklin Station
P O Box 878
Washington, DC 20044
202-305-4831

Melissa S Leibman
US Department of Justice
Office of Immigration Litigation
Ben Franklin Station
PO Box 868
Washington, DC 20044
202-305-7016
Fax: 202-305-7000
Email: Melissa.Leibman@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 03/13/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Jonathan Scharfen
*Acting Director, US Citizenship and
Immigration Services
Substituted for
Emilio Gonzalez*

represented by **Elizabeth J Stevens**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Patricia E Bruckner
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sheri R Glaser
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/18/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John P Devaney
(See above for address)

Melissa S Leibman
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/13/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Condoleezza Rice
*Secretary of State, US Department of
State
TERMINATED: 03/20/2008*

represented by **Alan R Diamante**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Brent W Renison
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elizabeth J Stevens
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sheri R Glaser
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John P Devaney
 (See above for address)

Melissa S Leibman
 (See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/13/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Maura Harty
Assistant Secretary for Consular Affairs,
US Department of State
TERMINATED: 03/20/2008

represented by **Elizabeth J Stevens**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Patricia E Bruckner
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sheri R Glaser
 (See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/18/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John P Devaney
 (See above for address)

Melissa S Leibman
 (See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/13/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/30/2007	1	COMPLAINT against defendants–respondents Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez.(Filing fee \$ 350)Fee paid, filed by plaintiffs–petitioners Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax.(bb) (Entered: 09/07/2007)
08/30/2007		FAX number for Attorney Alan R Diamante, Brent W Renison is 503–726–0730. (bb) (Entered: 09/07/2007)
08/30/2007	2	Notice of Interested Parties filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (bb) (Entered: 09/07/2007)
08/30/2007	<u>3</u>	NOTICE TO PARTIES OF ADR PILOT PROGRAM filed.(bb) (Entered: 09/07/2007)

08/30/2007		60 days Summons Issued re Complaint – (Discovery) 1 as to Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (bb) (Entered: 09/07/2007)
08/30/2007	4	APPLICATION of Non–Resident Attorney Brent W. Renison to appear on behalf of Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins and Maria Moncayo–Gigax. FEE PAID. Lodged Proposed Order. (gk) (Entered: 09/08/2007)
08/30/2007		FAX number for Attorney Alan R Diamante is 213–943–4553. (gk) (Entered: 09/08/2007)
09/04/2007	<u>5</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder granting Application of Non–Resident Attorney Brent W. Renison to appear on behalf of Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins and class plaintiffs 4 , and designating local counsel Alan R. Diamante. (gk) (Entered: 09/11/2007)
09/17/2007	<u>6</u>	NOTICE TO COUNSEL: This case has been assigned to the calendar of udge Christina A. Snyder. This Notice to Counsel shall be to all parties appearing propria persona, and for purposes of this notice, the term "counsel" shall include any person appearing in pro per. Counsel are advised that the Court expects strict compliance with the provisions of the LR and the Fed Rules of Civil Procedure (see document for further details) by Judge Christina A. Snyder,(yl) (Entered: 09/17/2007)
10/09/2007	7	PROOF OF SERVICE Executed by Plaintiffs upon Defendants Michael Chertoff served on 9/13/2007, answer due 11/13/2007; Condoleezza Rice served on 9/13/2007, answer due 11/13/2007; Maura Harty served on 9/13/2007, answer due 11/13/2007; Emilio Gonzalez served on 9/13/2007, answer due 11/13/2007. The Summons and Complaint were served by personal service, by Federal statute. Service accepted by Genoveva Ortega, Legal Clerk on behalf of Leon W. Weidman, Chief U.S. Attorney's Office. Also attached original return receipts addressed to: (1) Condoleezza Rice, Secretary of State, U.S. Dept. of State, acknowledged by Debbie (last name illegible) on 9/24/2007; (2) Alberto Gonzales, U.S. Attorney General, acknowledged by rubber stamp imprint of Ernest L. Parker on 9/21/2007; (3) Maura Harty, Assistant Secretary for Consular Affairs, U.S. Department of State, acknowledged by Debbie (last name illegible) on 9/24/2007; and (4) Emilio Gonzalez, Dir. U.S.C.I.S. without acknowledgment on return receipt, a copy of the U.S. Postal Service Track &Confirm reflects delivery on 9/21/2007. Original Summons not returned. (gk) (Entered: 10/14/2007)
11/13/2007	8	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION to Dismiss filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez, Condoleezza Rice, and Maura Harty; memorandum of points and authorities. Motion set for hearing on 12/10/2007 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (gk) (Entered: 11/19/2007)
11/26/2007	9	CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment as to a matter of law pursuant of FRCP 56(c) filed by Plaintiff–Petitioners and Class Members Condoleezza Rice, Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax.Motion set for hearing on 12/10/2007 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (vh) (Entered: 11/30/2007)
11/26/2007		PLAINTIFFS' MEMORANDUM in Opposition to Motion to Dismiss re 8 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (vh) (Entered: 11/30/2007)
11/28/2007	10	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Class Certification filed by Plaintiffs–Petitioners and Class Members Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax.Motion set for hearing on 1/28/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. Lodged Order. (vh) (Entered: 12/03/2007)
11/28/2007	11	MEMORANDUM of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Class Certification, re 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (vh) (Entered: 12/03/2007)
11/28/2007	12	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) filed by Plaintiffs–Petitioners and Class Members Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax.Motion set for hearing on 1/28/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. Lodged Order. (vh) (Entered: 12/03/2007)

11/28/2007	<u>13</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a), 12 filed by Plaintiffs–Petitioners and Class Members Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (vh) (Entered: 12/03/2007)
12/05/2007	<u>14</u>	STIPULATION FOR CONTINUANCE OF 12/10/2007 HEARING, JOINT BRIEFING SCHEDULE, AND REQUEST TO FILE BRIEFS IN EXCESS OF PAGE LIMITATIONS AND ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder continuing hearing as to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss 8 and Motion for Summary Judgment [9] to 1/28/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder, a date already agreed upon for hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification 10 and Motion for a Preliminary Injunction 12 . On or before 12/15/2007, Plaintiffs will file their Statement of Uncontroverted Facts and Conclusions of Law and their proposed judgment. Defendants' Reply Memorandum, Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment, Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification, and Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for a Preliminary Injunction due by 1/7/2008. Plaintiffs to file Reply Memoranda, if any, by 1/18/2008. Parties have leave to file briefs up to 35 pages in length. (gk) (Entered: 12/06/2007)
01/07/2008	<u>16</u>	NOTICE OF DISCREPANCY AND ORDER: by Judge Christina A. Snyder, ORDERING Notice of change of address information submitted by Defendant Emilio Gonzalez received on 1/4/08 is not to be filed but instead rejected. Denial based on: LR 11–3.8, LR 11–4.1, FRCiv Rule 5(d), Pursuant to GO 07–08, case is designated for electronic filing. (yl) (Entered: 01/08/2008)
01/08/2008	<u>15</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) 12 filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 and 2# <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/08/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>17</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Sheri R Glaser counsel for Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. Adding Sheri R. Glaser as attorney as counsel of record for Defendants for the reason indicated in the G–06 Notice. Filed by Attorney for Defendants Defendants (Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/15/2008	<u>18</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Request for Evidence# <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Leibman, Melissa) (Entered: 01/15/2008)
01/15/2008	<u>19</u>	REPLY in support of motion to dismiss and opposition to motion for cross summary judgment MOTION for Summary Judgment as to as a matter of law pursuant of FRCP 56(c) MOTION for Summary Judgment as to as a matter of law pursuant of FRCP 56(c) 9 , MOTION to Dismiss Case 8 filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Attachment A)(Leibman, Melissa) (Entered: 01/15/2008)
01/15/2008	<u>20</u>	STATEMENT of Genuine Issues filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez (Leibman, Melissa) (Entered: 01/15/2008)
01/16/2008	<u>21</u>	REPLY in support MOTION for Summary Judgment as to as a matter of law pursuant of FRCP 56(c) MOTION for Summary Judgment as to as a matter of law pursuant of FRCP 56(c) 9 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Attachment A – Matter of O –)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 01/16/2008)
01/16/2008	<u>22</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 01/16/2008)
01/16/2008	<u>23</u>	AMENDED DOCUMENT filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. Amendment to Response in Opposition to Motion <u>18</u> Amended Certificate of Service (Leibman, Melissa) (Entered: 01/16/2008)

01/16/2008	<u>24</u>	AMENDED DOCUMENT filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. Amendment to Statement <u>20</u> <i>Amended Certificate of Service</i> (Leibman, Melissa) (Entered: 01/16/2008)
01/16/2008	<u>25</u>	AMENDED DOCUMENT filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. Amendment to Reply (Motion related), Reply (Motion related) <u>19</u> <i>Amended Certificate of Service</i> (Leibman, Melissa) (Entered: 01/16/2008)
01/18/2008	<u>26</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) 12 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Attachment A# <u>2</u> Appendix Attachment B# <u>3</u> Appendix Attachment C)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 01/18/2008)
01/28/2008	<u>27</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing held before Judge Christina A. Snyder: The Court continues defendants' Motion to Dismiss 8 to 3/3/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder, and orders further briefing as follows: defendant's opening shall be filed on or before 1/11/2008; plaintiffs' opposition shall be filed on or before 2/19/2008; and defendants' reply shall be filed on or before 2/25/2008. The Court DENIES plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment as to a Matter of Law Pursuant to FRCP 56 (c) 9 without prejudice subject to being renewed. The Court stays plaintiffs Motion for Class Certification 10 to be addressed at the 3/3/2008 hearing on defendants motion to dismiss. The Court continues Plaintiffs Motion for Preliminary Injunction 12 to 3/31/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (gk) (Entered: 01/31/2008)
02/02/2008	<u>28</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following deficiency was found: Incorrect event selected. Correct event is Proof of Service (subsequent document). Title page is missing: RE Amended Certificate of Service filed 1/16/2008 <u>23</u> . (gk) (Entered: 02/03/2008)
02/02/2008	<u>29</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following deficiency was found: Incorrect event selected. Correct event is Proof of Service (subsequent document). Title page is missing: RE Amended Certificate of Service filed 1/16/2008 <u>24</u> . (gk) (Entered: 02/03/2008)
02/02/2008	<u>30</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following deficiency was found: Incorrect event selected. Correct event is Proof of Service (subsequent document). Title page is missing: RE Amended Certificate of Service filed 1/16/2008 <u>25</u> . (gk) (Entered: 02/03/2008)
02/07/2008	<u>31</u>	STIPULATION to Continue Hearing on Motion for Preliminary Injunction from March 31, 2008 at 10:00 a.m. to April 7, 2008 at 10:00 a.m. Re: Motion Hearing,,,, Link Motions to Minutes,,,, Set Motion and RRDeadlines,,,, <u>27</u> filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 02/07/2008)
02/11/2008	<u>32</u>	SUPPLEMENT to MOTION to Dismiss Case 8 <i>Supplemental Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion to Dismiss</i> filed by Defendants Condoleezza Rice, Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 02/11/2008)
02/15/2008	<u>33</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION to Dismiss Case 8 <i>Response in Opposition to Defendants' Supplemental Memorandum of Law</i> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Appendix Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Appendix Exhibit C)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 02/15/2008)
02/19/2008	<u>34</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder, re: Stipulation to Continue <u>31</u> . IT IS HEREBY ORDERED: The Court continues Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction to 4/7/2008 at 10:00 a.m. IT IS SO ORDERED. (mmu) (Entered: 02/20/2008)
03/03/2008	<u>35</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing held before Judge Christina A. Snyder: The Court takes defendants' motion under submission. The Court will issue a final order. Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (mmu) (Entered: 03/07/2008)

03/17/2008	<u>36</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder re MOTION to Dismiss Case 8 Granting in part and denying in part (see Order for complete details) (kd) (Entered: 03/17/2008)
03/20/2008	<u>37</u>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT against defendants Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez; Party Condoleezza Rice terminated amending Complaint – (Discovery) <i>1 Party Maura Harty terminated</i> , filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/20/2008)
03/25/2008	<u>38</u>	STIPULATION to Clarify This Court's February 19, 2008 order filed by Attorney for Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 03/25/2008)
03/25/2008	<u>39</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following deficiency was found document title does not match docket entry: RE Stipulation to Clarify <u>38</u> (mmo) (Entered: 04/01/2008)
04/02/2008	<u>40</u>	DECLARATION of David Asser, Esq. in support of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) 12 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/02/2008)
04/02/2008	<u>41</u>	DECLARATION of Yelena Arias Angulo in support of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) 12 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/02/2008)
04/02/2008	<u>42</u>	DECLARATION of Maria Paula Robledo in support of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) 12 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/02/2008)
04/02/2008	<u>43</u>	DECLARATION of Maria Raquel Pascoal Williams in support of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) MOTION for Preliminary Injunction re: pursuant to FRCP 65(a) 12 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo–Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/02/2008)
04/07/2008	<u>44</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing held before Judge Christina A. Snyder Re: Plaintiffs' Motion for a Preliminary Injunction 12 . The Court DENIES plaintiffs motion for a classwide preliminary injunction. The Court further DENIES plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction prohibiting defendants from withholding Employment Authorization Documents and Advance Parole Travel Documents. The Court reserves for further consideration, plaintiffs' request for a preliminary injunction prohibiting defendants from commencing removal proceedings against plaintiffs. However, the Court orders that no further adverse action be taken against the named plaintiffs until further order of the Court. Further, the Court hereby orders supplemental briefing of no more than 15 pages in length to be filed as follows: On or by 4/28/2008, Plaintiffs' supplemental brief in support of their motion for class certification. On or by 5/1/2008, Defendants' brief explaining the reasons for having commenced removal proceedings against any of the named plaintiffs. On or by 5/12/2008, Defendants' reply to plaintiffs' supplemental brief in support of plaintiffs' motion for class certification. Court schedules a hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification 10 on 6/9/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (gk) (Entered: 04/10/2008)
04/11/2008	<u>45</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint, <u>37</u> <i>Defendants' Answer to Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint For Declaratory and Injunctive Relief and Petition for Writ of Mandamus</i> filed by Counsel for Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez.(Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 04/11/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>46</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Title page lacks counsel's name, California bar number, office address, telephone and facsimile numbers and e–mail address, commencing with line 1 at the left margin, pursuant to Local Rule 11–3.8(a) RE: Declaration of David Asser filed 4/2/2008 <u>40</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (gk) (Entered: 04/28/2008)

		04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>47</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Title page lacks counsel's name, California bar number, office address, telephone and facsimile numbers and e-mail address, commencing with line 1 at the left margin, pursuant to Local Rule 11-3.8(a) RE: Declaration of Yelena Arias Angulo filed 4/2/2008 <u>41</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (gk) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>48</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Title page lacks counsel's name, California bar number, office address, telephone and facsimile numbers and e-mail address, commencing with line 1 at the left margin, pursuant to Local Rule 11-3.8(a) RE: Declaration of Maria Paula Robledo filed 4/2/2008 <u>42</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (gk) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>49</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Title page lacks counsel's name, California bar number, office address, telephone and facsimile numbers and e-mail address, commencing with line 1 at the left margin, pursuant to Local Rule 11-3.8(a) RE: Declaration of Maria Raquel Pascoal Williams filed 4/2/2008 <u>43</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (gk) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>50</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 <i>Supplemental Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion for Class Certification</i> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>51</u>	DECLARATION of Yelena Arias Angulo in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>52</u>	DECLARATION of Farah Batool in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>53</u>	DECLARATION of Sarah Bayor in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>54</u>	DECLARATION of Agnieszka Bernstein in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>55</u>	DECLARATION of Dodzener Naomi Clarke Blackstock in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>56</u>	DECLARATION of Elsa Brenteson in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>57</u>	DECLARATION of Xiuru Chen in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>58</u>	DECLARATION of Suzanne De Mailly in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>59</u>	DECLARATION of Maria Diaz Ruiz in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison,

		Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>60</u>	DECLARATION of Diana Engstrom in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>61</u>	DECLARATION of Rose Fishman Corman in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>62</u>	DECLARATION of Pauline Marie Gobeil in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>63</u>	DECLARATION of Zainab M. Hassan in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>64</u>	DECLARATION of Carolyn Pera Robb Hootkins in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>65</u>	DECLARATION of Philip Hornik in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>66</u>	DECLARATION of Raymond W. Lockett in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>67</u>	DECLARATION of Ana Maria Moncayo Gigax in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>68</u>	DECLARATION of Monika Monroe in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>69</u>	DECLARATION of Ngoc Dieu Nguyen in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>70</u>	DECLARATION of Purita Manuel Poindexter in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>71</u>	DECLARATION of Elaine Nodado Pulley in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>72</u>	DECLARATION of Brent W. Renison in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>73</u>	DECLARATION of Markku Tapio Ripatti in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>74</u>	DECLARATION of Maria Jasmin Algo Simpson in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>75</u>	DECLARATION of Stella Standifer in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>76</u>	DECLARATION of Juntanee Tamborello in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)

04/28/2008	<u>77</u>	DECLARATION of Gladys Walsh in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>78</u>	DECLARATION of Maria Raquel Pascoal Williams in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>79</u>	DECLARATION of Khin Win in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>80</u>	DECLARATION of Ju-Hui Yang in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/30/2008	<u>81</u>	NOTICE To Court Regarding Removal proceedings filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1# <u>2</u> Exhibit 2# <u>3</u> Exhibit 3)(Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 04/30/2008)
05/09/2008	<u>84</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Based on these representations, the Court finds that there is no imminent threat of harm that would justify the entry of a preliminary injunction 12 . Accordingly, the Court DENIES plaintiffs' request for a preliminary injunction prohibiting defendants from commencing removal proceedings against plaintiffs without prejudice to the request being renewed if further adverse action is taken, or threatened to be taken, against named plaintiffs. (gk) (Entered: 05/13/2008)
05/12/2008	<u>82</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION to Certify Class 10 <i>Defendants' Response to Plaintiffs' Supplemental Memorandum of Law In Support of Motion For Class Certification</i> filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit 1# <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit 2# <u>3</u> Declaration Exhibit 3)(Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 05/12/2008)
05/13/2008	<u>83</u>	SUPPLEMENT <i>Supplemental Statement To Defendants' Response To Plaintiffs' Supplemental Memorandum Of Law In Support Of Motion For Class Certification</i> filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff, Emilio Gonzalez. (Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 05/13/2008)
05/19/2008	<u>85</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION to Certify Class 10 <i>Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of Supplemental Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion for Class Certification</i> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) ** DOCUMENT STRICKEN PURSUANT TO ORDER FILED 6/6/2008 <u>92</u> ** Modified on 6/9/2008 (gk). (Entered: 05/19/2008)
05/20/2008	<u>86</u>	STIPULATION File Gobeil Decl. (Doc. No. 62); Standifer Decl. (Doc. No. 75); Ex. 1 to Def. Mot. (Doc. No. 82-2) Under Seal filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 05/20/2008)
05/29/2008	<u>87</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Application to file documents under seal should be manually filed and a Notice of Manual Filing should be electronically filed pursuant to General Order 08-02. RE: Stipulated Motion to Seal filed 5/20/2008 <u>86</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (gk) (Entered: 05/29/2008)
06/02/2008	<u>91</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) by Judge Christina A. Snyder: On the Court's own motion, the Court continues Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification to 6/30/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. Court Reporter: Not Present. (gk) (Entered: 06/03/2008)
06/03/2008	<u>88</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Sheri R Glaser counsel for Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. Changing address to P.O. Box 868, Ben Franklin Station, Washington, D.C. 20044. Changing fax number to 202-616-8962. Filed by Counsel for Defendants Sheri R. Glaser (Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 06/03/2008)

06/03/2008	<u>89</u>	First EX PARTE APPLICATION to Strike Reply (Motion related) <u>85</u> <i>In Support of Supplemental Memorandum of Law In Support of Motion for Class Certification, or in the alternative</i> , First EX PARTE APPLICATION for Leave to File A Surreply To Plaintiffs' Unauthorized Reply In Support of Supplemental Memorandum Of Law In Support of Motion For Class Certification filed by Counsel for Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Surreply, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 06/03/2008)
06/03/2008	<u>90</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: account information was not updated in the ECF system RE: Notice of Change of Attorney Information (G-06), Notice of Change of Attorney Information (G-06) <u>88</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (vh) (Entered: 06/03/2008)
06/06/2008	<u>92</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder granting Defendants' Ex Parte Application to Strike Plaintiffs' Unauthorized Reply in Support of Supplemental Memorandum in Support of Motion for Class Certification <u>89</u> . Plaintiffs' reply in support of supplemental memorandum of law in support of motion for class certification <u>85</u> is stricken. (gk) (Entered: 06/09/2008)
06/30/2008	<u>95</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing held before Judge Christina A. Snyder: Hearing held and counsel are present. Tentative provided. The Court confers with counsel and counsel argue. The Court takes plaintiffs motion under submission and orders each side to submit revised proposed definitions forthwith, as stated in Court and on the record. The Court will issue a final order thereafter. Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (pso) (Entered: 07/07/2008)
07/02/2008	<u>93</u>	Proposed Class Definition filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax re: MOTION to Certify Class 10 (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 07/02/2008)
07/03/2008	<u>94</u>	Proposed Class Definition filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen (Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 07/03/2008)
07/08/2008	<u>96</u>	Joint STIPULATION to Stay Case pending determination on settlement in 48 hours filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 07/08/2008)
07/09/2008	<u>98</u>	ORDER GRANTING STIPULATION TO HOLD THE COURT'S CLASS CERTIFICATION RULING IN ABEYANCE FOR FORTY-EIGHT HOURS by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Upon Stipulation <u>96</u> , IT IS SO ORDERED, that the Court will hold its ruling on class certification in abeyance for forty-eight hours. (gk) (Entered: 07/11/2008)
07/10/2008	<u>97</u>	STIPULATION to Stay Case pending Settlement Discussions filed by Counsel for Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 07/10/2008)
07/17/2008	<u>99</u>	ORDER GRANTING STIPULATION TO HOLD THE CASE IN ABEYANCE PENDING SETTLEMENT DISCUSSIONS by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Upon Stipulation <u>97</u> , IT IS SO ORDERED, that the Court will hold this case in abeyance pending settlement discussions. Counsel are directed to submit a status report every 30 days. (gk) (Entered: 07/18/2008)
08/15/2008	<u>100</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 08/15/2008)
08/15/2008	<u>101</u>	STIPULATION to Stay Case pending Legislation filed by Counsel for Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 08/15/2008)
08/21/2008	<u>102</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder: <u>101</u> ORDER STAYING CASE pending further order of the Court and the status of 3369, H.R. 6034, or any other legislation that may affect this case by Judge Christina A. Snyder. (MD JS-6. Case Terminated) (rmo) (Entered: 08/22/2008)

10/15/2008	<u>103</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 10/15/2008)
12/12/2008	<u>104</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND First MOTION to Lift Stay re proceedings filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. Motion set for hearing on 1/12/2009 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Lifting Stay)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 12/12/2008)
12/12/2008	<u>105</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support of First MOTION to Lift Stay re proceedings <u>104</u> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 12/12/2008)
12/24/2008	<u>106</u>	NOTICE OF NON-OPPOSITION to First MOTION to Lift Stay re proceedings <u>104</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 12/24/2008)
01/06/2009	<u>107</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Proceedings: Motion for Order Lifting Stay <u>104</u> . The Court finds this motion appropriate for decision without oral argument. Accordingly, the hearing date of January 12, 2008 is hereby vacated and the matter taken under submission. The Court GRANTS plaintiffs' motion and hereby liftsthe stay in the instant action. MD JS-5 Case Reopened. (mg) (Entered: 01/07/2009)
01/06/2009	<u>108</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Proceedings: Order GRANTING Plaintiffs' MOTION for Class Certification 10 . The Court provisionally GRANTS plaintiffs' motion for class certification as to plaintiffs whose cases arise within the jurisdiction of the Ninth Circuit. The Court further certifies a subclass of alien spouses who entered the United States on fiance visas. (mg) (Entered: 01/07/2009)
01/30/2009	<u>109</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Patricia E Bruckner counsel for Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. Changing e-mail to patricia.bruckner@usdoj.gov. Adding Patricia E. Bruckner as attorney as counsel of record for Michael Chertoff; Maura Harty; Jonathan Scharfen for the reason indicated in the G-06 Notice. Filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff; Jonathan Scharfen; Maura Harty (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 01/30/2009)
02/06/2009	<u>110</u>	NOTICE of Decision: The Third Circuit Court of Appeals In Robinson filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 02/06/2009)
02/27/2009	<u>111</u>	STIPULATION for Order Directing Notice to Class filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B Proposed Notice, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order Directing Notice to Class)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 02/27/2009)
03/02/2009	<u>112</u>	ORDER DIRECTING NOTICE TO CLASS (see document for detailed specifics) <u>111</u> . In accordance with the dates set out in the proposed notice, Counsel for Plaintiffs and Defendants agree that both parties will file renewed Motions (and Cross- Motions) for Summary Judgment on or before March 9, 2009 and notice a hearing for April 20, 2009. Both parties agree to file their respective Responses on or before March 23, 2009, and optional Replies on or before April 6, 2009. 13. The Parties will file separate dispositive motions as to the non-Class Plaintiffs from outside the Ninth Circuit according to the same schedule by Judge Christina A. Snyder (lc) (Entered: 03/03/2009)
03/09/2009	<u>113</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND Renewed MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. Motion set for hearing on 4/20/2009 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/09/2009)
03/09/2009	<u>114</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support of Renewed MOTION for Summary Judgment <u>113</u> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/09/2009)
03/09/2009	<u>115</u>	STATEMENT of Uncontroverted Facts and Conclusions of Law [proposed] in support of Renewed MOTION for Summary Judgment <u>113</u> filed by Plaintiffs

		Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/09/2009)
03/09/2009	<u>116</u>	STIPULATION for Extension of Time to File Motions for Summary Judgment filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/09/2009)
03/11/2009	<u>117</u>	MINUTES OF IN CHAMBERS ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder. The Court, on its own motion, sets a Telephone Conference for 3/23/2009 at 11:45 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (pp) (Entered: 03/11/2009)
03/11/2009	<u>118</u>	ORDER GRANTING STIPULATION FOR MINOR MODIFICATION OF BRIEFING SCHEDULE by Judge Christina A. Snyder. Defendants are to file Motions for Summary Judgment on or before 3/13/09 for hearing on 4/20/09 and file a Response to Plaintiff's motion by 3/23/09. Plaintiffs are to file a Response by 3/27/2009 and optional Replies are due by 4/6/2009, for both parties. (pp) (Entered: 03/12/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>119</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Melissa S Leibman counsel for Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. Melissa Leibman will no longer receive service of documents from the Clerks Office for the reason indicated in the G-06 Notice. Filed by defendant Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen (Leibman, Melissa) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>120</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs Outside the Ninth Circuit filed by defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. Motion set for hearing on 4/20/2009 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>121</u>	STATEMENT of Uncontroverted Facts and Conclusions of Law in Support of MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs Outside the Ninth Circuit <u>120</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>122</u>	DECLARATION of Michael J. Sheridan in support of MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs Outside the Ninth Circuit <u>120</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>123</u>	PROPOSED ORDER GRANTING DEFENDANTS' re MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs Outside the Ninth Circuit <u>120</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>124</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Ninth Circuit Class Plaintiffs filed by defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. Motion set for hearing on 4/20/2009 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Granting Defendants' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment)(Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>125</u>	STATEMENT of Uncontroverted Facts MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Ninth Circuit Class Plaintiffs <u>124</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>126</u>	DECLARATION of Michael J. Sheridan In Support of MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Ninth Circuit Class Plaintiffs <u>124</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>127</u>	EXHIBIT A to MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Ninth Circuit Class Plaintiffs <u>124</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>128</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: This document tendered for the judge's approval should have been submitted as a separate PDF attachment to the Motion for Summary Judgment [#113] or a Notice of Lodging. RE: Statement (Motion related)

		<u>115</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (pp) (Entered: 03/16/2009)
03/13/2009	<u>129</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Local Rule 11-6, Memorandum/brief exceeds 25 pages. RE: Plaintiffs' Memorandum in Support of Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment <u>114</u> . In response to this notice the court may order: (1) an amended or corrected document to be filed, (2) the document stricken, or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (mg) (Entered: 03/16/2009)
03/17/2009	<u>130</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Sheri R Glaser counsel for Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen.Sheri R. Glaser is no longer attorney of record for the aforementioned party in this case for the reason indicated in the G-06 Notice. Filed by counsel for Defendant Sheri R. Glaser (Glaser, Sheri) (Entered: 03/17/2009)
03/17/2009	<u>131</u>	STIPULATION to Exclude Alan Diamante from Telephonic Status Conference filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A; Notice of Hearing in Removal Proceedings)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/17/2009)
03/18/2009	<u>132</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error was found: DOCUMENT SHOULD HAVE BEEN PROVIDED FOR THE JUDGE'S APPROVAL AS A SEPARATE PDF ATTACHMENT TO THE MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT (Doc. No. 120) OR TO A NOTICE OF LODGING. RE: Motion Related Document <u>123</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (pp) (Entered: 03/18/2009)
03/18/2009	<u>133</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error was found: DOCUMENT SHOULD HAVE BEEN SUBMITTED AS A SEPARATE PDF ATTACHMENT TO THE MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT AS TO THE NINTH CIRCUIT CLASS PLAINTIFFS (Doc. No. 124) or to a NOTICE OF LODGING. RE: Statement (Motion related) <u>125</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (pp) (Entered: 03/18/2009)
03/18/2009	<u>134</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error was found: DOCUMENT SHOULD HAVE BEEN SUBMITTED AS A SEPARATE PDF ATTACHMENT TO THE MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT (Doc. No. 120) OR TO A NOTICE OF LODGING. RE: Statement (Motion related) <u>121</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (pp) (Entered: 03/18/2009)
03/18/2009	<u>135</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following errors were found: (1) TITLE PAGE IS MISSING; (2) EXHIBITS COULD BE ATTACHED TO THE MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT AS TO THE NINTH CIRCUIT CLASS PLAINTIFFS (Doc. No. 124) AS A SEPARATE PDF ATTACHMENT. RE: Exhibit to Motion <u>127</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (pp) (Entered: 03/18/2009)
03/19/2009	<u>136</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder Excusing Alan Diamante From Telephonic Status Conference. The Court ordered a Telephonic Status Conference re: Case on March 23, 2009 at 11:45 A.M. Pacific Daylight Time (PDT), and ordered the telephone conference call to include all counsel of record. The parties agree that Mr. Diamante may be excluded from participation in the telephonic status conference. Re: Stipulation to Exclude <u>131</u> . (mg) (Entered: 03/20/2009)
03/23/2009	<u>137</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to Renewed MOTION for Summary Judgment <u>113</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order, # <u>3</u> Statement of Genuine

		Issues of Material Fact)(Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 03/23/2009)
03/23/2009	<u>138</u>	MINUTE ORDER re Telephonic Status Conference held before Judge Christina A. Snyder. The Court confers with counsel regarding the above-referenced action and confirms that the Court will proceed on track with this action as scheduled.Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (pp) (Entered: 03/25/2009)
03/27/2009	<u>139</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Ninth Circuit Class Plaintiffs <u>124</u> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/27/2009)
03/27/2009	<u>140</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs Outside the Ninth Circuit <u>120</u> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A Walsh Approval)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/27/2009)
04/06/2009	<u>141</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Ninth Circuit Class Plaintiffs <u>124</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 04/06/2009)
04/06/2009	<u>142</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs Outside the Ninth Circuit <u>120</u> filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 04/06/2009)
04/06/2009	<u>143</u>	REPLY in support of Renewed MOTION for Summary Judgment <u>113</u> filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/06/2009)
04/08/2009	<u>144</u>	NOTICE of Decision: Lockhart v. Napolitano filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/08/2009)
04/17/2009	<u>145</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) by Judge Christina A. Snyder: On the Court's own motion, the Court continues the following motions from 4/20/09 to 4/22/09 at 10:00 AM: Plaintiffs' MOTION for Summary Judgment <u>113</u> ; Defendants' MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment <u>120</u> ; and Defendants' MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment as to Ninth Circuit Class Plaintiffs <u>124</u> . Therefore, counsel are ordered not to appear on 4/20/09 at 10:00 a.m. (mg) (Entered: 04/17/2009)
04/20/2009	<u>146</u>	STATUS REPORT filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 04/20/2009)
04/20/2009	<u>147</u>	DECLARATION of Michael J. Sheridan filed by Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 04/20/2009)
04/22/2009	<u>148</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Hearing held and counsel are present. Tentative provided to counsel on April 20, 2009by facsimile. The Court confers with counsel and counsel argue. The Court takes the motions under submission. The Court will issue a final ruling.Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (pp) (Entered: 04/23/2009)
04/28/2009	<u>149</u>	Joint STIPULATION for Order dismissing plaintiffs Heard, Walsh, Win, Simmons (Rudl) and Poindexter filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/28/2009)
04/28/2009	<u>151</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Granting in part and denying in part Defendants' <u>120</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment as to All Plaintiffs Outside the Ninth Circuit; Denying Defendants' <u>124</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs in the Ninth Circuit; and Granting in part denying in part Plaintiffs' <u>113</u> Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment. (mg) (Entered: 05/01/2009)
04/29/2009	<u>150</u>	STATUS REPORT (JOINT) AS TO PLAINTIFFS WHOSE CASES ARISE OUTSIDE THE NINTH, SIXTH AND THIRD CIRCUITS filed by Plaintiffs Carolyn Robb Hootkins, Maria Moncayo-Gigax. (Renison, Brent) (Entered: 04/29/2009)

		04/29/2009)
04/30/2009	<u>152</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder: Plaintiffs and Defendants, by and through their undersigned counsel, enter the following Stipulation <u>149</u> : Lawful Permanent Resident status has been granted by Defendants to Plaintiffs Dahianna Heard, Gladys Walsh, Khin Thidar Win, Tracy Lee Rudl, and Purita Manuel Pointdexter. Based upon Plaintiffs' and Defendants' stipulation, it is ORDERED that the claims of the LPR Plaintiffs are DISMISSED as moot. (mg) (Entered: 05/01/2009)
05/05/2009	<u>153</u>	Joint STIPULATION to Dismiss plaintiffs Maria Diaz–Ruiz, Diana Engstrom, Yelena Arias Angulo, Agnieszka Bernstein, Sarah Bayor, Farah Batool filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins.(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 05/05/2009)
06/29/2009	<u>154</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL to the 9th CCA filed by defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. Appeal of Order on Motion for Summary Judgment, Order on Motion for Partial Summary Judgment,,,, <u>151</u> . (Filing Fee waived.) (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 06/29/2009)
06/30/2009	<u>155</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL NOTIFICATION form issued regarding Notice of Appeal to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals <u>154</u> as to Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (lr) (Entered: 06/30/2009)
06/30/2009	<u>156</u>	NOTIFICATION by Circuit Court of Appellate Docket Number 09–56019, 9th CCA regarding Notice of Appeal to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals <u>154</u> as to Defendants Maura Harty, Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (lr) (Entered: 07/01/2009)
07/29/2009	<u>157</u>	TRANSCRIPT DESIGNATION AND ORDERING FORM For Dates: April 22, 2009; Court Reporter: Laura Elias; Court of Appeals Case Number: 09–56019; Re: <u>154</u> (Bruckner, Patricia) (Entered: 07/29/2009)
10/21/2009	<u>158</u>	ORDER from 9th CCA filed re: Notice of Appeal to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals <u>154</u> filed by Michael Chertoff, Maura Harty, Jonathan Scharfen, CCA # 09–56019. The court has received and reviewed the responses to the order to show cause. The order to show cause is discharged. If appellants have not already done so, appellants shall within 10 calendar days after the date of this order, designate any repoter's transcripts or serve on appellees a statement indicating that appellants do not intent to order any transcripts. (cbr) (Entered: 10/23/2009)
01/22/2010	<u>159</u>	ORDER from 9th CCA filed re: Notice of Appeal to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals <u>154</u> filed by Michael Chertoff, Maura Harty, Jonathan Scharfen, CCA # 09–56019. The court is in receipt of appellant's correspondence dated January 19, 2010, requesting dismissal of the appeal without prejudice to reinstatement should the district court not approve the parties' pending settlement in this class action litigation. The court construes the request as a motion to dismiss without prejudice to reinstatement. So construed, the motion to dismiss the appeal without prejudice is granted. The appeal is dismissed without prejudcie to reinstatement in the event the district court does not approve the parties' pending settlement agreement. reinstatement shall be by notice filed by any party in this court and served on the other parties and the undersigned within 28 days of the district court order not approving the settlement, but in any event August 17, 2010. If no notice of reinstatement is filed and served by Augsut 17, 2010, the appeal will be deemed dismissed with prejudice. The parties shall bear their own costs on appeal as specified in the settlement agreement. This order served on the district court shall act as and for the mandate of this court. Order received in this district on 1/22/2010. (lr) Modified on 1/25/2010 (lr). (Entered: 01/25/2010)
01/25/2010	<u>160</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND Joint MOTION for Settlement Approval of Class Action Settlement (<i>Preliminary</i>) and for Approval of Notice to Class filed by defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. Motion set for hearing on 3/1/2010 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1: Stipulation adn Agreement of Settlement and Release, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A to Stipulation, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B to Stipulation, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 2 to Motion: USCIS Guidance, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 3 to Motion: Proposed Notice, # <u>6</u> Proposed Order)(Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/25/2010)

01/27/2010	<u>161</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Memorandum/brief exceeding 10 pages shall contain table of contents, Local Rule 11-8 RE: Notice of Motion and Joint Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement and Approval of Notice to Class filed 1/25/2010 <u>160</u> . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (gk) (Entered: 01/27/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>162</u>	Amendment to Joint MOTION for Settlement Approval of Class Action Settlement (<i>Preliminary</i>) and for Approval of Notice to Class Joint MOTION for Settlement Approval of Class Action Settlement (<i>Preliminary</i>) and for Approval of Notice to Class Joint MOTION for Settlement Approval of Class Action Settlement (<i>Preliminary</i>) and for Approval of Notice to Class <u>160</u> Adding Table of Contents and Authorities filed by Defendants Michael Chertoff, Jonathan Scharfen. (Stevens, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
02/01/2010	<u>163</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents. The following error(s) was found: Title page does not indicate that this is an Amendment to the Motion (document 160), and instead is entitled as a new Motion. RE: Notice of Motion and Joint Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement, etc. <u>162</u> , (docketed as Amendment (Motion related). In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. (mg) (Entered: 02/01/2010)
02/24/2010	<u>164</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Leave of Brent W. Renison to Appear for plaintiff by telephone filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins. Motion set for hearing on 3/1/2010 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 02/24/2010)
02/24/2010	<u>165</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder granting Motion for Leave of Brent W. Renison to Appear for plaintiff by telephone <u>164</u> . The undersigned counsel for plaintiffs respectfully requests the Courts permission to appear via telephone at the hearing for settlement approval of the class action settlement (preliminary) and for approval of notice to class, scheduled for 3/1/2010 at 10:00 AM. Intervening legislation has aided the parties reach a settlement favorable to plaintiffs, and no opposition is anticipated at the hearing. Counsel for plaintiffs Alan Diamante is prepared to appear in person at the hearing. Counsel for defendants do not object to this motion. Brent W. Renison can be reached on his direct office line at (503) 597-7190. (jp) (Entered: 02/25/2010)
03/01/2010	<u>166</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing on Joint Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement and Approval of Notice to Class <u>160</u> held before Judge Christina A. Snyder: The Court inquires of counsel regarding the anticipated date for the Final Settlement Hearing is to be scheduled and orders parties to return on 4/5/2010 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. The Court advises counsel that the proposed order will be executed and provided to counsel later today. Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (gk) (Entered: 03/01/2010)
03/01/2010	<u>167</u>	ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT AND APPROVAL OF NOTICE TO CLASS by Judge Christina A. Snyder: The Court has decided to GRANT the Joint Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement and Approval of Notice To Class <u>160</u> . The Court will hold a Final Settlement Hearing ("Fairness Hearing") on 4/5/2010, at 10:00 AM, to determine whether the terms of the Settlement Agreement are fair, reasonable, and adequate and should be approved by the Court, and to rule upon such other matters as the Court may deem appropriate; and whether a Final Judgment, attached as Exhibit B to the Settlement Agreement, should be entered and the Released Parties should be released from the Settled Claims by the Releasing Parties, as provided in the Settlement Agreement. See document for details. (gk) (Entered: 03/02/2010)
03/02/2010	<u>168</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) by Judge Christina A. Snyder: The Court orders this matter statistically reopened. (Case reopened. MD JS-5.) Court Reporter: Not Present. (gk) (Entered: 03/02/2010)

03/29/2010	<u>169</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Leave of Brent W. Renison to Appear for plaintiffs by telephone filed by plaintiff Carolyn Robb Hootkins. Motion set for hearing on 4/5/2010 at 10:00 AM before Judge Christina A. Snyder. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Renison, Brent) (Entered: 03/29/2010)
03/30/2010	<u>170</u>	ORDER by Judge Christina A. Snyder granting <u>169</u> Motion for Leave to Appear of Brent Renison for plaintiffs at the telephonic Final Settlement Hearing on 4/5/10 @ 10:00 a.m. (pp) (Entered: 04/01/2010)
04/05/2010	<u>171</u>	FINAL ORDER AND JUDGMENT by Judge Christina A. Snyder. (MD JS-6, Case Terminated). (pp) (Entered: 04/05/2010)
04/05/2010	<u>172</u>	MINUTES OF FINAL SETTLEMENT HEARING held before Judge Christina A. Snyder.Court Reporter: Laura Elias. (pp) (Entered: 04/05/2010)