

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:05-cv-01378-TFH**

ALI v. RUMSFELD

Assigned to: Judge Thomas F. Hogan

Lead case: [1:05-mc-00267-TFH](#)

Member case: [\(View Member Case\)](#)

Case in other court: USCA-DC, 07-05178

Northern district of Illinois, C.A. No.
1:05-01201

Cause: 28:1407 Airline Crash

Plaintiff

ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI

Date Filed: 07/08/2005

Date Terminated: 03/27/2007

Jury Demand: Plaintiff

Nature of Suit: 360 P.I.: Other

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
OF THE NATION'S CAPITAL
4301 Connecticut Avenue, NW
Suite 434
Washington, DC 20008
(202) 457-0800 x113
Fax: (202) 457-0805
Email: artspitzer@gmail.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
WOODROW WILSON SCHOOL OF
PUBLIC AND INTERNATIONAL
AFFAIRS
Princeton University
Princeton, NJ 08540
(609) 924-4535
Fax: (609) 924-8615
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION
125 Broad Street
18th floor
New York, NY 10004
212-284-7321
Fax: 212-549-2654
Email: hshamsi@aclu.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
U.S. LAW AND SECURITY PROGRAM
Human Rights First
333 Seventh Avenue
13th Floor
New York, NY 10001
(212) 845-5200
Fax: (212) 845-5299
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
U.S. LAW AND SECURITY PROGRAM
Human Rights First
333 Seventh Avenue

13th Floor
New York, NY 10001
(212) 845-5200
Fax: (212) 845-5299
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

MEHBOOB AHMAD

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

ALI H.

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi

(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

SAID NABI SIDDIQI

represented by **Arthur B. Spitzer**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Deborah N. Pearlstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hina Shamsi
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H. Posner
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Priti N. Patel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

DONALD H. RUMSFELD

represented by **J. Marcus Meeks**
DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Torts Branch, Civil Division

P.O. Box 7146
 Ben Franklin Station
 Washington, DC 20044
 (202) 616-4176
 Fax: (202) 616-4314
 Email: marcus.meeks@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/08/2005	<u>1</u>	CERTIFIED COPY OF TRANSFER ORDER: from Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation transferring an action in the Northern District of Illinois to the District of Columbia, assigned to Honorable Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan for coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings pursuant to 28 USC Section 1407 N) (ks,) (Entered: 08/12/2005)
08/10/2005	<u>2</u>	COPY OF LETTER from Nancy Mayer-Whittington Clerk, USDC DC to Clerk, USDC for the Northern District of Illinois, requesting transfer of the file and docket entries in C.A. No. 1:05-1201 (ks,) (Entered: 08/12/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>3</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Arthur B. Spitzer on behalf of all plaintiffs (Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/28/2005	<u>4</u>	ORDER scheduling a conference for Tuesday, January 31, 2006 at 10:30 a.m. in Courtroom 25 and scheduling a filing date for defendants' answers to the complaints. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on November 23, 2005. (lctfh2) (Entered: 11/28/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>5</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Respond to Consolidated Amended Complaint</i> by ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/13/2005		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>5</u> Joint Motion for an Extension of Time for Defendants to Respond to a Consolidated Amended Complaint. Accordingly, the Defendant's response to the complaint shall be filed by March 6, 2006 and the conference currently scheduled for January 31, 2006 shall be postponed until March 20, 2006 at 10:30 a.m., at which time the parties shall appear in Courtroom 25A to discuss scheduling further proceedings. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on December 13, 2005. (Entered: 12/13/2005)
01/05/2006	<u>6</u>	CONSOLIDATED AMENDED COMPLAINT against DONALD H. RUMSFELD filed by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI.(nmw,) (Entered: 01/06/2006)
01/06/2006	<u>7</u>	Joint MOTION to Suspend Local Civil Rule Obligation to File Residence Addresses by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 01/06/2006)
01/12/2006	<u>8</u>	Consent MOTION to Consolidate Future Filings by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 01/12/2006)
03/02/2006	<u>9</u>	ORDER granting [#7] Joint Motion to Suspend their Local Rule 5.1(e) and 11.1 Obligations, Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on 3/2/06. (hs,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
03/06/2006	<u>10</u>	MOTION to Dismiss by DONALD H. RUMSFELD. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order # <u>2</u> Exhibit)(Meeks, J.) (Entered: 03/06/2006)

03/07/2006		MINUTE ORDER advising the parties that due to an unavoidable scheduling conflict the status conference currently scheduled for March 20, 2006 has been rescheduled to take place on March 28, 2006 at 9:30 a.m. in Courtroom 25. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on March 7, 2006. (lctfh2) (Entered: 03/07/2006)
03/23/2006		MINUTE ORDER postponing the status conference previously scheduled for March 28, 2006 to a date to be set by a future Order of the Court. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on March 23, 2006. (lctfh2) (Entered: 03/23/2006)
03/24/2006	<u>11</u>	Joint MOTION to Set Briefing Schedule by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 03/24/2006)
03/30/2006		ORDER granting <u>11</u> Joint Motion to Set Briefing Schedule. The plaintiffs' oppositions to the defendants' motions to dismiss shall be due on or before May 19, 2006 and the defendants' replies thereto shall be due on or before June 19, 2006. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on March 30, 2006. (lctfh2) (Entered: 03/30/2006)
04/04/2006	<u>12</u>	ORDER granting <u>8</u> Consent Motion to Consolidate Future Filings. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on April 4, 2006. (lctfh2) (Entered: 04/04/2006)
05/18/2006	<u>13</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Priti N. Patel. :Address- 333 7th Avenue, NY NY 10001. Phone No. - 212-845-5200. Fax No. - 212-845-5299 by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Patel Declaration# <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 05/18/2006)
05/18/2006	<u>14</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Deborah N. Pearlstein. :Address- 333 7th Avenue, NY NY 10001. Phone No. - 212-845-5200. Fax No. - 212-845-5299 by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Pearlstein Declaration# <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 05/18/2006)
05/18/2006	<u>15</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Michael H. Posner. :Address- 333 7th Avenue, NY NY 10001. Phone No. - 212-845-5200. Fax No. - 212-845-5299 by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Posner Declaration# <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 05/18/2006)
05/18/2006	<u>16</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Hina Shamsi. :Address- 333 7th Avenue NY NY 10001. Phone No. - 212-845-5200. Fax No. - 212-845-5299 by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Shamsi Declaration# <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 05/18/2006)
10/17/2006	<u>17</u>	ORDER; granting [#16] Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ;Hina Shamsi, Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on 10/13/06. (hs.) (Entered: 10/17/2006)
10/18/2006		MINUTE ORDER granting the <u>13</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice filed by Priti N. Patel, granting the <u>14</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice filed by Deborah N. Pearlstein, granting the <u>15</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice filed by Michael H. Posner . Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on October 18, 2006. (lctfh2,) (Entered: 10/18/2006)
03/27/2007	<u>18</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on 3/27/07. (Entered: 03/27/2007)

03/27/2007	<u>19</u>	ORDER granting Defendant Pappas' Motion to Dismiss in part and denying in part as moot (13) in case 1:05-cv-01377-TFH; granting Defendant's and United States' Motion to Dismiss in its entirety in case 1:05-cv-01378-TFH (10); granting in part and denying in part as moot Defendant Janis Karpinski's Motion to Dismiss (13) in case 1:05-cv-01379-TFH; granting in part and denying in part as moot Defendant Lieutenant General Ricardo Sanchez's Motion to Dismiss in case 1:05-cv-01380-TFH in case 1:05-cv-01379-TFH; dismissing plaintiff's cases. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas F. Hogan on 3/27/07. (Entered: 03/27/2007)
05/24/2007	<u>20</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL as to <u>19</u> Order on Motion to Dismiss,,, Order on Motion to Dismiss/Lack of Jurisdiction,,,,,,,,,,,,, <u>18</u> Memorandum & Opinion by MEHBOOB AHMAD, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, ALI H., SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI. Filing fee \$ 455, receipt number 1200422. Fee Status: Fee Paid. Parties have been notified. (Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 05/24/2007)
05/25/2007		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals re <u>20</u> Notice of Appeal, (lc,) (Entered: 05/25/2007)
05/31/2007		Supplemental Record on Appeal transmitted to US Court of Appeals re <u>20</u> Notice of Appeal, (lc,) (Entered: 05/31/2007)
06/05/2007		USCA Case Number 07-5178 for <u>20</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, ALI H., ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, MEHBOOB AHMAD, SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID. (lc,) (Entered: 06/06/2007)
09/19/2008		NOTICE of duplicate case. This case is a duplicate of CA 08-1605. Other documents filed on 9/18/08 can be viewed at that case number as well as the entries from the USDC for the Northern District of Illinois. CA 08-1605 will be administratively closed.(jeb,) (Entered: 09/19/2008)
10/27/2008	<u>21</u>	ORDER of USCA as to <u>20</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, ALI H., ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, MEHBOOB AHMAD, SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID; ORDER denying without prejudice to renewal motion for summary affirmance; FURTHER ORDERED, on the court's own motion, that these consolidated cases be held in abeyance pending further order of the court. (USCA 07-5178) (mmh,) Modified on 11/17/2008 (jeb,). (Entered: 11/06/2008)
05/12/2010	<u>22</u>	ORDER of USCA as to <u>20</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, ALI H., ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, MEHBOOB AHMAD, SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID ; ORDERED that appellants' request to hold this case in abeyance be dismissed as moot in light of the Supreme Court's order vacating the judgment and remanding the case in Kiyemba v Obama; FURTHER ORDERED that the renewed motion for summary affirmance be denied. USCA Case Number 07-5178. (mmh,) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
10/03/2011	<u>23</u>	MANDATE of USCA (certified copy) as to (20 in 1:05-cv-01378-TFH) Notice of Appeal, filed by MOHAMMED KARIM SHIRULLAH, SAID NABI SIDDIQI, THAHE MOHAMMED SABAR, HAJI ABDUL RAHMAN, ALI H., ARKAN MOHAMMED ALI, NAJEEB ABBAS AHMED, MEHBOOB AHMAD, SHERZAD KAMAL KHALID ; USCA Case Number 07-5178. ORDERED and ADJUDGED that the judgment of the District Court appealed from in these causes is hereby affirmed, in accordance with the opinion of the court filed herein this date. (kb) (Entered: 10/04/2011)