

CLOSED,COMPLEX-CSMGMT,ECF,SIMILAR

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS**

Strouchler et al v. Shah et al
Assigned to: Judge Shira A. Scheindlin
Similar Case: 1:96-cv-00788-SAS
Cause: 42:1396 – Tort Negligence

Date Filed: 04/24/2012
Date Terminated: 09/16/2014
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 890 Other Statutory
Actions
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Charles Strouchler

*individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Benjamin Wait Taylor**
New York Legal Assistance Group
450 West 33rd Street
11th Floor
New York, NY 10001
(212)-613-5069
Fax: (212)-750-0820
Email: btaylor@nylag.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Donna Bernadette Dougherty
Jasa/Legal Services For The Elderly In
Queens
97-77 Queens Boulevard Suite 600
Rego Park, NY 10013
(718)-286-1515
Fax: (718)-275-5352
Email: ddougherty@jasa.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Eileen Mathews Connor
New York Legal Assistance Group
7 Hanover Square
New York, NY 10004
(212) 613-5000
Fax: (212) 714-7870
Email: econnor@nylag.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie Salzman
Cardozo Bet Tzedek Legal Services
55 Fifth Avenue, 11th Floor
New York, NY 10003
(212)-790-0240
Fax: (212)-790-0256
Email: salzman@yu.edu
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Toby Golick
Cardozo Bet Tzedek Legal Services
55 Fifth Avenue, 11th Floor
New York, NY 10003
(212)-790-0240
Fax: (212)-790-0256
Email: tgolick@yu.edu
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sara Campos

by her next friend Ana Simard;

represented by **Eileen Mathews Connor**
(See above for address)

*individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie Salzman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Toby Golick
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Audrey Rokaw
*by her next friend Nina Pinsky;
individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Eileen Mathews Connor**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie Salzman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Toby Golick
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Nirav Shah, M.D.
*as Commissioner of the New York State
Department of Health*

represented by **Robert Lewis Kraft**
Office of the Attorney General, New York
State
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
212-416-8632
Fax: 212-416-6075
Email: robert.kraft@ag.ny.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Elizabeth Berlin
*as Executive Deputy Commissioner of the
New York State Office of Temporary and
Disability Assistance
TERMINATED: 08/29/2012*

represented by **Robert Lewis Kraft**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Robert Doar
*as Administrator of the New York City
Human Resources
Administration/Department of Social
Services*

represented by **David Alan Rosinus , Jr.**
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 356-0877
Fax: (212) 788-0877
Email: arosinus@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gloria Mihee Yi
Nyc Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212)-788-0898
Fax: (212)-788-0940
Email: gyi@law.nyc.gov

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
04/24/2012	<u>1</u>	ENDORSEMENT on Declaration in Support of Request to Proceed In Forma Pauperis, I.F.P. REQUEST IS GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote, Part I on 4/24/2012) (mro) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/24/2012	<u>2</u>	COMPLAINT against Elizabeth Berlin, Robert Doar, Nirav Shah, MD. Document filed by Charles Strouchler, Sara Campos, Audrey Rokaw.(mro) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/24/2012		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Elizabeth Berlin, Robert Doar, Nirav Shah, MD. (mro) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/24/2012		CASE REFERRED TO Judge Shira A. Scheindlin as possibly similar to 1:96-cv-00788-SAS. (mro) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/24/2012		Case Designated ECF. (mro) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/24/2012	<u>3</u>	STANDING ORDER IN RE PILOT PROJECT REGARDING CASE MANAGEMENT TECHNIQUES FOR COMPLEX CIVIL CASES IN THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK (See M-10-468 Order filed November 1, 2011). This case is hereby designated for inclusion in the Pilot Project Regarding Case Management Techniques for Complex Civil Cases in the Southern District of New York (the Pilot Project), unless the judge to whom this case is assigned determines otherwise. This case is designated for inclusion in the Pilot Project because it is a class action, an MDL action, or is in one of the following Nature of Suit categories: 160, 245, 315, 355, 365, 385, 410, 830, 840, 850, 893, or 950. The presiding judge in a case that does not otherwise qualify for inclusion in the Pilot Project may nevertheless designate the case for inclusion in the Pilot Project by issuing an order directing that the case be included in the Pilot Project. The description of the Pilot Project, including procedures to be followed, is attached to this Order. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 10/31/2011) (mro) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/26/2012	<u>4</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Benjamin Wait Taylor on behalf of Charles Strouchler (Taylor, Benjamin) (Entered: 04/26/2012)
04/27/2012	<u>5</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Donna Bernadette Dougherty on behalf of Charles Strouchler (Dougherty, Donna) (Entered: 04/27/2012)
04/27/2012		CASE ACCEPTED AS SIMILAR. Create association to 1:96-cv-00788-SAS. Notice of Assignment to follow. (pgu) (Entered: 04/27/2012)
04/27/2012	<u>6</u>	NOTICE OF CASE ASSIGNMENT to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin. Judge Unassigned is no longer assigned to the case. (pgu) (Entered: 04/27/2012)
04/27/2012		Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein is so designated. (pgu) (Entered: 04/27/2012)
05/01/2012	<u>7</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Robert Lewis Kraft on behalf of Elizabeth Berlin, Nirav Shah, MD (Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 05/01/2012)
05/18/2012		MEMORANDUM TO DOCKET CLERK: TRO HELD ON 5/18/2012. (djc) (Entered: 06/05/2012)
05/23/2012	<u>8</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from David A. Rosinus, Jr. dated 5/22/2012 re: I write to respectfully request that City Defendant's deadline for submitting opposition papers to Plaintiffs' TRO request be extended by 48 hours, from the close of business today to the close of business on Thursday, May 24, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. Defendant shall submit its response by COB Thursday. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 5/22/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 05/23/2012)
05/25/2012	<u>9</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from David A. Rosinus, Jr. dated 5/24/12 re: Counsel for the City defendant requests that opposition papers to Plaintiffs' TRO request be extended to 5/25/12.

		ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. The opposition is due May 25, 2012 by the close of business. So ordered. (Responses due by 5/25/2012) (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 5/24/2012) (mro) Modified on 5/29/2012 (mro). (Entered: 05/25/2012)
05/25/2012	<u>10</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by David Alan Rosinus, Jr on behalf of Robert Doar (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 05/25/2012)
05/25/2012	<u>11</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Gloria Mihee Yi on behalf of Robert Doar (Yi, Gloria) (Entered: 05/25/2012)
05/25/2012	<u>12</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A Scheindlin from Gloria M Yi dated 5/25/2012 re: Request to extend time to respond to plaintiffs' application for a TRO to 5/29/2012. ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. Defendant's opposition is now due by 5:00 pm on 5/29/2012. (Response due by 5/29/2012) (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 5/25/2012) (cd) (Entered: 05/29/2012)
05/31/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 5/31/2012. (pl) (Entered: 06/06/2012)
06/06/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 6/6/2012. (Landers, Rigoberto) (Entered: 07/13/2012)
06/12/2012	<u>13</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER CONCERNING TEMPORARY RELIEF: NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the Parties, through their attorneys, as follows : 1. The terms of this Stipulation and Order shall be in effect from the date that the Court so–orders it until the Court hears Plaintiffs' application for a preliminary injunction. And as set forth in this Order. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 6/12/2012) (ama) (Entered: 06/12/2012)
06/20/2012	<u>14</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from David A. Rosinus, Jr. dated 6/20/2012 re: Counsel requests an extension of time for City defendant to respond to the complaint. ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. City defendants may respond to plaintiffs amended complaint within twenty–one days of service. If no amended complaint is served, City defendants must respond to the Complaint by July 6, 2012. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 6/20/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 06/25/2012)
06/20/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Robert Doar answer due 7/6/2012. (jfe) (Entered: 06/25/2012)
06/28/2012	<u>15</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from Robert L. Kraft dated 6/27/2012 re: State defendants request until July 6, 2012, to answer the operative complaint, or until 21 days after service should an amended complaint be served. ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. Defendants' Answer to the original complaint is due by July 6, 2012. If plaintiffs file and serve an Amended Complaint, defendants' Answer will be due 21 days after service., Elizabeth Berlin answer due 7/6/2012; Nirav Shah, MD answer due 7/6/2012. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 6/27/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 06/28/2012)
06/28/2012	<u>17</u>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>2</u> Complaint against Elizabeth Berlin, Robert Doar, Nirav Shah, MD.Document filed by Charles Strouchler, Sara Campos, Audrey Rokaw. Related document: <u>2</u> Complaint filed by Sara Campos, Charles Strouchler, Audrey Rokaw.(pl) (ml). (Entered: 06/29/2012)
06/28/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 6/28/2012. (pl) (Entered: 07/06/2012)
06/29/2012	<u>16</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: Defendants' opposition papers in response to Plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction shall be served by July 6, 2012; Plaintiffs' reply papers in support of their motion for a preliminary injunction shall be served by July 23, 2012. The hearing will proceed as scheduled on July 26 and July 27, 2012. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 6/28/2012) (djc) (Entered: 06/29/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>18</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON–ECF DOCUMENT – FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. Return Date set for 7/26/2012 at 10:00 AM.(Golick, Toby) Modified on

		7/6/2012 (Idi). (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>19</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>18</u> FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Elizabeth Berlin, Nirav Shah, MD. (Kraft, Robert) Modified on 7/6/2012 (Idi). (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>20</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – DECLARATION of Robert L. Kraft in Opposition re: <u>18</u> FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Elizabeth Berlin, Nirav Shah, MD. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A–C)(Kraft, Robert) Modified on 7/6/2012 (Idi). (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – NON–ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney Toby Golick to MANUALLY RE–FILE Document No. <u>18</u> Order to Show Cause, with the Orders and Judgments Department. This document is NOT filed via ECF. (Idi) (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Robert Lewis Kraft to RE–FILE Document <u>19</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>20</u> Declaration in Opposition to Motion. ERROR(S): Documents linked to filing error. Re–File using the (non–motion) events found under the event list Other Answers. (Idi) (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>21</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – AFFIDAVIT of Margaret Willard in Opposition re: <u>18</u> FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Elizabeth Berlin, Nirav Shah, MD. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A–F, # <u>2</u> Exhibit G, # <u>3</u> Exhibit H–L)(Kraft, Robert) Modified on 7/6/2012 (Idi). (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Robert Lewis Kraft to RE–FILE Document <u>21</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion. ERROR(S): Document linked to filing error. (Idi) (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>22</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. Return Date set for 7/26/2012 at 10:00 AM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Salzman Declaration, # <u>2</u> Affidavit Bogart Declaration, # <u>3</u> Affidavit Keilin Declaration, # <u>4</u> Affidavit Jeffrey Declaration)(Golick, Toby) Modified on 7/9/2012 (Idi). (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>23</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>22</u> FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. (<i>City Defendant's Memorandum of Law</i>). Document filed by Robert Doar. (Rosinus, David) Modified on 7/9/2012 (Idi). (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>24</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – DECLARATION of CELESTE LEWIS in Opposition re: <u>22</u> FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Page from Plaintiff Sara Campos's HRA case record, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Pages from Plaintiff Audrey Rokaw's HRA case record, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: New York State Department of Health's 12 OHIP/ADM–1)(Rosinus, David) Modified on 7/9/2012 (Idi). (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Toby Golick to RE–FILE Document <u>22</u> FIRST MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. ERROR(S): Supporting documents must be filed separately, each receiving their own document number. Declaration in Support of Motion is found under the event list Replies, Opposition and Supporting Documents. NOTE: You must sign the Motion before re–filing. (Idi) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/06/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney David Alan Rosinus to RE–FILE Document <u>23</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>24</u>

		Declaration in Opposition to Motion. ERROR(S): Documents linked to filing error. (ldi) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>25</u>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. Return Date set for 7/26/2012 at 10:00 AM.(Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>26</u>	DECLARATION of Leslie Salzman in Support re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F)(Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>27</u>	DECLARATION of Valerie Bogart in Support re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>28</u>	DECLARATION of Nina Keilin in Support re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>29</u>	DECLARATION of Randal S. Jeffrey in Support re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>30</u>	Exhibit List <i>Document Index to Motion</i> . Document filed by Charles Strouchler.(Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>31</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. (<i>City Defendant's Memorandum of Law</i>). Document filed by Robert Doar. (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/09/2012	<u>32</u>	DECLARATION of CELESTE LEWIS in Opposition re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Page from Plaintiff Sara Campos's HRA case record, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Pages from Plaintiff Audrey Rokaw's HRA case record, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: New York State Department of Health's 12 OHIP/ADM-1)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 07/09/2012)
07/16/2012	<u>33</u>	CONFIDENTIALITY STIPULATION AND QUALIFIED PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material... (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 7/16/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 07/16/2012)
07/17/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Preliminary Injunction Hearing held on 7/17/2012. (rjm) (Entered: 08/01/2012)
07/20/2012	<u>34</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 07/20/2012)
07/20/2012	<u>35</u>	REPLY AFFIRMATION of Benjamin Taylor in Support re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibits A-C, Taylor Reply Dec.)(Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 07/20/2012)
07/21/2012	<u>36</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. <i>Originally filed as #19. Refiled per 07/06 docket order</i> . Document filed by Elizabeth Berlin, Nirav Shah, MD. (Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 07/21/2012)
07/21/2012	<u>37</u>	DECLARATION of Robert L. Kraft in Opposition re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Elizabeth Berlin, Nirav Shah, MD. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A-C)(Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 07/21/2012)
07/21/2012	<u>38</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Margaret Willard in Opposition re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Elizabeth Berlin, Nirav Shah, MD. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A-F, # <u>2</u> Exhibit G, # <u>3</u> Exhibit H-L)(Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 07/21/2012)
07/23/2012	<u>39</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/23/2012)

07/25/2012	<u>40</u>	RULE 26 DISCLOSURE.Document filed by Charles Strouchler.(Golick, Toby) (Entered: 07/25/2012)
07/26/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Motion Hearing held on 7/26/2012 re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Charles Strouchler. (cd) (Entered: 08/03/2012)
07/30/2012	<u>41</u>	DEPOSITION of Michael Eisner taken on July 24, 2012.Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Deposition Transcript Designations, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Deposition Exhibits)(Dougherty, Donna) (Entered: 07/30/2012)
07/30/2012	<u>42</u>	DEPOSITION of Anita Aisner taken on July 19, 2012.Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Designated Pages of Deposition of Anita Aisner, M.D., July 19, 2012)(Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 07/30/2012)
07/30/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 7/30/2012. (rjm) (Entered: 08/01/2012)
08/01/2012	<u>43</u>	DECLARATION of NILZA LOPEZ in Opposition re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction.. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/01/2012)
08/02/2012	<u>44</u>	ANSWER to <u>17</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Nirav Shah, MD.(Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 08/02/2012)
08/02/2012	<u>45</u>	DEPOSITION of Michael Eisner taken on July 24, 2012.Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Cross-designated pages from deposition transcript of Michael Eisner)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/02/2012)
08/02/2012	<u>46</u>	FIRST MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. Responses due by 8/30/2012 Return Date set for 9/13/2012 at 10:00 AM.(Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 08/02/2012)
08/02/2012	<u>47</u>	DEPOSITION of Anita Aisner taken on July 19, 2012.Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Corrections to Deposition, dated July 30, 2012, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Cross-designated pages from deposition transcript of Anita Aisner)(Yi, Gloria) (Entered: 08/02/2012)
08/02/2012	<u>48</u>	DECLARATION of Toby Golick in Support re: <u>46</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exh. A, Part I, to Golick Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exh. A, Part II to Golick Declaration)(Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 08/02/2012)
08/02/2012	<u>49</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>46</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 08/02/2012)
08/06/2012	<u>50</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: HEARING held on 7/17/2012 before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Eve Giniger, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 8/30/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/10/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/8/2012.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/06/2012)
08/06/2012	<u>51</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a HEARING proceeding held on 7/17/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/06/2012)
08/08/2012	<u>52</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Charles Strouchler.(Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 08/08/2012)

08/08/2012	<u>53</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Robert Doar.(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/08/2012)
08/08/2012	<u>54</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from David Alan Rosinus, Jr. dated 8/6/2012 re: Counsel requests that City Defendant's time to respond to the Amended Complaint be extended by one week until 8/15/12. ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. The finding of fact and conclusion of law are due on Wednesday, August 8. No further extensions will be granted. Answer is due August 15, 2012. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 8/8/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 08/09/2012)
08/08/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Robert Doar answer due 8/15/2012. (jfe) (Entered: 08/09/2012)
08/14/2012	<u>55</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: HEARING held on 5/18/2012 before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Martha Drevis, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 9/7/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/17/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/16/2012. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/14/2012)
08/14/2012	<u>56</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a HEARING proceeding held on 5/18/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/14/2012)
08/16/2012	<u>57</u>	ANSWER to <u>17</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Notice of Intent to Reduce for Sara Campos dated 2/10/12, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Notice of Intent to Reduce for Audrey Rokaw dated 3/12/12, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: Form W-410 for Audrey Rokaw dated 11/17/11)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/16/2012)
08/29/2012	<u>58</u>	STIPULATION OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL AGAINST DEFENDANT BERLIN AND ORDER : All claims raised in the Complaint and Amended Complaint against ELIZABETH BERLIN, as Executive Deputy Commissioner of the New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance are hereby voluntarily dismissed. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 8/27/2012) (jar) (Entered: 08/29/2012)
08/30/2012	<u>59</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>46</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Nirav Shah, MD. (Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 08/30/2012)
08/30/2012	<u>60</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>46</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/30/2012)
09/04/2012	<u>61</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 102302 re: <u>25</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Charles Strouchler. For the reasons stated above, plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction is granted in part. I decline to order the reinstatement of split-shift care to all those whose services have been reduced or terminated, pending additional submissions by the parties. A conference is scheduled for September 10, 2012 at 4:00 p.m., (Status Conference set for 9/10/2012 at 04:00 PM before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin.) (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 9/4/2012) (lmb) Modified on 9/12/2012 (ft). (Entered: 09/04/2012)
09/10/2012	<u>62</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Eileen Mathews Connor on behalf of Sara Campos, Audrey Rokaw, Charles Strouchler (Connor, Eileen) (Entered: 09/10/2012)
09/10/2012	<u>63</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>46</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Golick, Toby) (Entered: 09/10/2012)

09/10/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 9/10/2012. (jfe) (Entered: 09/27/2012)
09/12/2012	<u>64</u>	ORDER: Having considered the arguments presented by both parties on the record, I find no good reason to amend the preliminary injunction. Numerous administrative law judges previously found that the City was improperly relying on the "change in condition" exception. Although requiring that a doctor personally examine a patient and sign a declaration may impose minor additional costs on the City, this protection is necessary to prevent further unlawful reductions or terminations. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 9/12/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 09/12/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>65</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: HEARING held on 7/26/2012 before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Toni Stanley, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 10/9/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 10/18/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 12/17/2012. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>66</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a HEARING proceeding held on 7/26/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>67</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: HEARING held on 7/27/2012 before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Rebecca Forman, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 10/9/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 10/18/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 12/17/2012. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>68</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a HEARING proceeding held on 7/27/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/24/2012	<u>69</u>	INTERNET CITATION NOTE: Material from decision with Internet citation re: <u>61</u> Memorandum & Opinion, Set Hearings. (sj) (Entered: 09/25/2012)
10/03/2012	<u>70</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from David Alan Rosinus, Jr. dated 10/2/2012 re: I write to respectfully request that the Court so-order the enclosed proposed Order, which will ensure that HRA will continue to be able to comply with the preliminary injunction that this Court issued in its Opinion and Order dated September 4, 2012 (the "Preliminary Injunction"). ENDORSEMENT: I decline to authorize the proposed relief. As previously argued by the State I lack the authority to abrogate a regulation promulgated by the New York State legislation. The Clerk is directed to docket the October 2 and October 3 letters submitted by the City and State. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 10/3/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 10/03/2012)
10/05/2012	<u>71</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 102465 re: <u>46</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class filed by Charles Strouchler. Because the class definition, as amended by the Court, meets the requirements of Rule 23, plaintiffs' motion for class certification is

		granted. The Clerk of the Court is directed to close this motion [Docket No. 46]. The parties are instructed to submit letters updating the Court on the status of the notice to potential class members by November 1, 2012. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 10/5/2012) (lmb) Modified on 10/16/2012 (ft). (Entered: 10/05/2012)
10/15/2012	<u>72</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the parties to this action, through their undersigned counsel, as follows: (1.)City Defendant agrees to restore Ms. Colon's personal care services from sleep-in services to split-shift services within five days of the so-ordering of this Stipulation and Order. (2.)Plaintiffs' counsel agrees to submit to City Defendant any documentation and/or information that may be necessary to implement the restoration of split-shift services to Ms. Colon. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 10/15/2012) (ama) (Entered: 10/16/2012)
11/02/2012	<u>73</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Letter</i> Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit class members redacted summary and notices)(Dougherty, Donna) (Entered: 11/02/2012)
11/12/2012	<u>74</u>	ORDER: that in consideration of the parties' letters, as well as of the emergency conditions in the wake of Hurricane Sandy, I hereby order the following: First, the City will have seven business days from the date of this order to reinstate the split shift services of the 16 individuals identified by plaintiffs, until these individuals can be reassessed under the standards in GIS 12 MA/026. Second, a conference is scheduled for Wednesday, November 21, 2012 at 4:30 pm to resolve the remaining issues raised in the parties' letters. (Status Conference set for 11/21/2012 at 04:30 PM before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin.) (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 11/12/2012) (pl) (Entered: 11/13/2012)
11/26/2012	<u>75</u>	ORDER: The relief requested by defendant City of New York, on consent, in a letter on November 21, 2012 is hereby granted: First, the City will have until November 30, 2012 to determine if the managed long-term care ("MLTC") plans referred to in the City's letter will comply with a State directive to reinstate split - shift services to those individuals already being served by an MLTC provider. Second, the City will have until December 7, 2012 to attempt to provide care to E.H. and B.B. This Order supersedes the November 12, 2012 Order [Dkt. No. 74] to the extent that the two Orders conflict. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 11/26/2012) (dj) Modified on 11/26/2012 (dj). (Entered: 11/26/2012)
11/28/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 11/28/2012. (pl) (Entered: 12/18/2012)
11/28/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 11/28/2012. (pl) (Entered: 12/18/2012)
01/10/2013	<u>76</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 7/30/2012 before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Toni Stanley, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 2/4/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 2/14/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/15/2013. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 01/10/2013)
01/10/2013	<u>77</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 7/30/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...Filed In Associated Cases: 1:12-cv-03216-SAS, 1:96-cv-00788-SAS(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 01/10/2013)
03/14/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 3/14/2013. (lmb) (Entered: 03/19/2013)

06/25/2013	<u>78</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin, from Leslie Salzman, dated 6/25/2013 re: the parties are currently scheduled to appear before you tomorrow at 4:30 p.m. for a status conference. We have been actively engaging in settlement negotiations. Request an additional week or two to have a final stipulation settlement. We are hopeful that if we have an additional week or two it is very likely that we will have a final stipulation of settlement. Consequently, we are requesting that tomorrow's conference be adjourned for two weeks to July 10th at 4:30 p.m. ENDORSEMENT: Request to adjourn the June 26th conference is granted and rescheduled to July 10, 2013 at 4:30 p.m. (Status Conference set for 7/10/2013 at 04:30 PM before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin.) (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 6/25/2013) (ja) (Entered: 06/26/2013)
07/11/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 7/11/2013. (Reily, James) (Entered: 08/05/2013)
07/12/2013	<u>79</u>	ORDER OF REFERENCE TO A MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein. *The week of August 5 would be the best. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 7/11/2013) (ja) (Entered: 07/12/2013)
07/15/2013		NOTICE OF REDESIGNATION TO ANOTHER MAGISTRATE JUDGE. The above entitled action has been redesignated to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman. Please note that this is a reassignment of the designation only. (pgu) (Entered: 07/15/2013)
07/15/2013		NOTICE OF REASSIGNMENT OF A REFERRAL TO ANOTHER MAGISTRATE JUDGE. The referral in the above entitled action has been reassigned to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman, for Settlement. Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein no longer referred to the case. (pgu) (Entered: 07/15/2013)
08/14/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Settlement Conference held on 8/14/2013. (Telephone Conference set for 8/23/2013 at 02:00 PM before Judge Bernard A. Friedman.). (sc) (Entered: 08/16/2013)
08/23/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Settlement Conference held on 8/23/2013, (Tentative Settlement Conference set for 10/29/2013 at 02:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman., Telephone Conference set for 9/17/2013 at 11:30 AM before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman.). (sc) (Entered: 08/26/2013)
09/17/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Settlement Conference via telephone held on 9/17/2013, (Telephone Conference set for 9/30/2013 at 02:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman.). (sc) (Entered: 09/17/2013)
09/30/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Settlement Conference via telephone held on 9/30/2013, (Telephone Conference set for 10/18/2013 at 02:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman.). (sc) (Entered: 10/01/2013)
10/18/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Settlement Conference via telephone held on 10/18/2013, (Telephone Conference set for 10/29/2013 at 02:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman.). (sc) (Entered: 10/21/2013)
10/29/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Settlement Conference was held on 10/29/2013 via telephone. (Telephone Conference was set for 11/8/2013 at 10:00 AM before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman.). (sc) (Entered: 10/30/2013)
11/08/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Settlement Conference via telephone held on 11/8/2013. (sc) (Entered: 11/13/2013)
11/12/2013	<u>80</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from David Alan Rosinus, Jr. dated November 12, 2013. Document filed by Robert

		Doar.(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 11/12/2013)
11/13/2013	<u>81</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER granting <u>80</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. So Ordered.11/14/2013 Pretrial Conference reset for 11/19/2013 at 3:30 PM before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 11/13/2013) (cd) Modified on 11/14/2013 (cd). (Entered: 11/14/2013)
11/19/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 11/19/2013. (Reily, James) (Entered: 12/03/2013)
11/26/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 11/26/2013. (Reily, James) (Entered: 12/03/2013)
01/16/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 1/16/2014. (Bloomfield, Clifford) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
02/07/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 2/7/2014. (Bloomfield, Clifford) (Entered: 02/07/2014)
05/27/2014	<u>82</u>	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT . Document filed by Charles Strouchler.(Dougherty, Donna) (Entered: 05/27/2014)
05/27/2014	<u>83</u>	NOTICE of Stipulation and Order of Notice in Class Action. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Notice of Proposed Class Settlement, # <u>2</u> Exhibit List of Legal Services Providers)(Dougherty, Donna) (Entered: 05/27/2014)
06/06/2014	<u>84</u>	NOTICE of of Proposed Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Complaint dated April 23, 2012, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: First Amended Complaint dated June 27, 2012, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: Proposed Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D: Proposed Stipulation of Settlement of Class Action and Order, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E: Side letter fully executed as of May 28, 2014, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F: Proposed Stipulation and Order of Notice in Class Action)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 06/06/2014)
06/06/2014	<u>85</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715 served on the Attorney General of the United States on June 6, 2014. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 06/06/2014)
06/12/2014	<u>86</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from Donna Dougherty dated June 12, 2014 re: Fairness Hearing date. Document filed by Charles Strouchler.(Dougherty, Donna) (Entered: 06/12/2014)
06/13/2014	<u>87</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>86</u> Letter filed by Charles Strouchler. ENDORSEMENT: The fairness hearing is scheduled for Tuesday, September 9, 2014 at 4:30 PM., (Fairness Hearing set for 9/9/2014 at 04:30 PM before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin.) (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 6/12/2014) (lmb) (Entered: 06/13/2014)
06/16/2014	<u>88</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF NOTICE IN CLASS ACTION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and among the parties to this action through their undersigned attorneys, that delivery of a copy of the Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement, annexed hereto as Exhibit A, shall be made as follows: 1) Within the timeframe set forth by 28 U.S.C. 1715(b), City Defendant shall deliver by mail a copy of the Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement, along with all other required materials, to the United States Attorney General, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1715(b). 2. A. City Defendant shall deliver by mail a copy of the Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement to each person who, at any time since January 1, 2011, received 24-hour split shift personal care services and to whom a notice of reduction or discontinuance of such services was issued; B. Plaintiffs' counsel shall deliver by regular mail or e-mail transmission a copy of the Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement to the 24 area legal services providers listed in Exhibit B for the purpose of providing information and assistance to class members. The Court finds that completion of the notification set forth in paragraphs 1 and 2 above at least 30 days before the date of the fairness hearing constitutes reasonable notice to class members who will be bound by the settlement pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(c)(2) &(e)(1). (Signed by Judge Shira A.

		Scheidlin on 6/16/2014) (lmb) (Entered: 06/16/2014)
08/13/2014	<u>89</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of class notice served on class members on August 8, 2014. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/13/2014)
09/04/2014	<u>90</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – FIRST MOTION to Approve Class Action Settlement <i>Affirmation in Support</i>. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. Return Date set for 9/9/2014 at 04:30 PM.(Dougherty, Donna) Modified on 9/5/2014 (db). (Entered: 09/04/2014)
09/05/2014		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Donna Bernadette Dougherty to RE-FILE Document <u>90</u> FIRST MOTION to Approve Class Action Settlement <i>Affirmation in Support</i>. Use the event type <i>Affirmation in Support (non-motion)</i> found under the event list <i>Other Answers</i>. (db) (Entered: 09/05/2014)
09/05/2014	<u>91</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement served on Legal Services Offices on June 17, 2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 09/05/2014)
09/05/2014	<u>92</u>	AFFIRMATION of Donna Dougherty in Support re: <u>82</u> Settlement Agreement. Document filed by Charles Strouchler. (Salzman, Leslie) (Entered: 09/05/2014)
09/09/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Shira A. Scheindlin: Status Conference held on 9/9/2014. (Bloomfield, Clifford) (Entered: 09/09/2014)
09/12/2014	<u>93</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Shira A. Scheindlin from David Alan Rosinus, Jr. dated September 12, 2014 re: submission of proposed Order and executed Stipulation of Settlement. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Executed Stipulation of Settlement)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 09/12/2014)
09/12/2014	<u>94</u>	ORDER: The Court hereby approves the settlement in this action, as set forth in the Stipulation of Settlement of Class Action and Order that the parties filed in this action on May 27, 2014 (Dkt. 82) ("the Stipulation of Settlement"), and finds, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2), following the Class having received proper and adequate notice in accordance with this Court's June 16, 2014 Order and the fairness hearing held on September 9, 2014, that the settlement is fair, reasonable, and adequate and meets the standards set forth by the Second Circuit in <i>City of Detroit v. Grinnell Corp.</i> , 495 F.2d 448 (2d Cir. 1974). The Clerk of Court is directed to enter judgment dismissing the Amended Complaint pursuant to the terms of the Stipulation of Settlement. The Court will retain jurisdiction over this action, and the parties thereto, to the extent set forth in the Stipulation of Settlement. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 9/12/2014) (tn) (Entered: 09/12/2014)
09/12/2014		Transmission to Judgments and Orders Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>94</u> Order, to the Judgments and Orders Clerk. (tn) (Entered: 09/12/2014)
09/16/2014	<u>95</u>	CLERK'S JUDGMENT: That for the reasons stated in the Court's Order dated September 12, 2014, the Amended Complaint is hereby dismissed pursuant to the terms of the Stipulation of Settlement, the Court shall retain jurisdiction over this action, and the parties thereto, to the extent set for the Stipulation of Settlement. (Signed by Clerk of Court Ruby Krajick on 9/16/2014) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice of Right to Appeal, # <u>2</u> Notice of Right to Appeal)(dt) (Entered: 09/16/2014)
09/16/2014		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (dt) (Entered: 09/16/2014)
09/24/2014	<u>96</u>	STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT OF CLASS ACTION AND ORDER: This Stipulation constitutes the Parties' entire agreement and its provisions resolve this action in its entirety as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Shira A. Scheindlin on 9/24/2014) (lmb) (Entered: 09/24/2014)