

**U.S. District Court
DISTRICT OF ARIZONA (Prescott Division)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:06-cv-01575-ROS**

Navajo Nation et al v. Brewer et al
Assigned to: Chief Judge Roslyn O Silver
Lead case: [2:06-cv-01268-ROS](#)
Member case: [\(View Member Case\)](#)
Cause: 28:1331 Federal Question: Other Civil Rights

Date Filed: 06/20/2006
Date Terminated: 05/27/2008
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 441 Civil Rights: Voting
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Navajo Nation
a federally recognized Indian tribe

represented by **Brenna L Clani**,
Navajo Nation Dept of Justice
PO Box 2010
Window Rock, AZ 86515
928-871-7506
Fax: 928-871-6200
Email: brennalclani@navajo.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Dana Lee Bobroff
Navajo Nation Department of Justice
PO Box 2010
Window Rock, AZ 86515
928-871-6936
Fax: 928-871-6177
Email: dbobroff@yahoo.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Judith M Dworkin
Sacks Tierney PA
4250 N Drinkwater Blvd., 4th Fl.
Scottsdale, AZ 85251-3647
480-425-2600
Fax: 480-970-4610
Email: judith.dworkin@sackstierney.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marvin S Cohen
Sacks Tierney PA
4250 N Drinkwater Blvd
4th Floor
Scottsdale, AZ 85251-3647
480-425-2600
Fax: 480-970-4610
Email: marvin.cohen@sackstierney.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Patricia Ferguson-Bohnee
Arizona State University College of Law
P.O. Box 877906
Tempe, AZ 85287-7906
480-727-0420
Fax: 480-727-9270
Email: pafergus@asu.edu
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Agnes Laughter

represented by **Dana Lee Bobroff**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Judith M Dworkin
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marvin S Cohen
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Patricia Ferguson–Bohnee
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Janice K Brewer
individually and in her official capacity
as Secretary of State of the State of
Arizona

represented by **Peter Alex Silverman**
Office of the Attorney General
–
1275 W Washington St
Phoenix, AZ 85007–2926
602–542–8305
Fax: 602–542–8308
Email: peter.silverman@azag.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Patty Hansen
individually and in her official capacity
as Coconino County Election
Administrator

represented by **Jean E Wilcox**
Coconino County Attorneys Office
110 E Cherry St
Flagstaff, AZ 86001
928–779–6518
Fax: 928–779–5618
Email: jwilcox@coconino.az.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Candace Owens
individually and in her official capacity
as Coconino County Recorder

represented by **Jean E Wilcox**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Penny Pew
individually and in her official capacity
as Apache County Elections Director

represented by **Bradley William Carlyon**
Apache County Attorneys Office
P.O. Box 637
Saint Johns, AZ 85936
928–337–7560
Fax: 928–337–2427
Email: bcarlyon@apachelaw.net
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

LeNora Johnson
*individually and in her official capacity
as Apache County Recorder*

represented by **Bradley William Carlyon**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Kelly Dastrup
*individually and in her official capacity
as Navajo County Elections Director*

represented by **Lance B Payette**
Navajo County Attorney
PO Box 668
Holbrook, AZ 86025
928-524-4002
Fax: 928-524-4244
Email: lance.payette@navajocountyaz.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Laurette Justman
*individually and in her official capacity
as Navajo County Recorder*

represented by **Lance B Payette**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
06/20/2006	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT, filed by Navajo Nation, Agnes Laughter. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Index for Exhibits# <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit 1# <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit 2# <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit 3# <u>5</u> Exhibit Exhibit 4# <u>6</u> Exhibit Exhibit 5# <u>7</u> Exhibit Exhibit 6# <u>8</u> Exhibit Exhibit 7-Part A# <u>9</u> Exhibit Exhibit 7-Part B# <u>10</u> Exhibit Exhibit 7-Part C# <u>11</u> Exhibit Exhibit 7-Part D# <u>12</u> Exhibit Exhibit 7-Part E# <u>13</u> Exhibit Exhibit 8-Part A# <u>14</u> Exhibit Exhibit 8-Part B# <u>15</u> Exhibit Exhibit B-Part C# <u>16</u> Exhibit Exhibit 8-Part D# <u>17</u> Exhibit Exhibit 9# <u>18</u> Exhibit Exhibit 10# <u>19</u> Exhibit Exhibit 11# <u>20</u> Exhibit Exhibit 12# <u>21</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Cohen, Marvin) (Entered: 06/20/2006)
06/20/2006	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Navajo Nation, Agnes Laughter. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Setting Hearing on Motion for Preliminary Injunction)(Cohen, Marvin) (Entered: 06/20/2006)
06/20/2006		Filing fee paid 06/20/06, receipt number PHX044753. This case has been assigned to the Honorable Earl H. Carroll. All future pleadings or documents should bear the correct case number: CV06-1575-PHX-EHC. (entered by ESH,) (Entered: 06/21/2006)
06/21/2006	<u>4</u>	Summons Issued as to Laurette Justman, Jan Brewer, Patty Hansen, Candace Owens, Penny Pew, LeNora Johnson, Kelly Dastrup. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Patty# <u>2</u> Candace# <u>3</u> Penny# <u>4</u> Lenora# <u>5</u> Kelly# <u>6</u> Laurette)(ESH,) (Entered: 06/21/2006)
06/30/2006	<u>5</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Peter Alex Silverman on behalf of Jan Brewer (Silverman, Peter) (Entered: 06/30/2006)
06/30/2006	<u>6</u>	Notice re and Motion to Transfer and to Consolidate by Jan Brewer (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supplement # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Silverman, Peter) (Entered: 06/30/2006)
06/30/2006	<u>7</u>	Notice re Plaintiffs' Notice of Opposition to Motion to Transfer and to Consolidate by Navajo Nation, Agnes Laughter (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Cohen, Marvin) (Entered: 06/30/2006)
07/10/2006	<u>8</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by Laurette Justman, Kelly Dastrup.(Payette, Lance) (Entered: 07/10/2006)
07/10/2006	<u>9</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by Penny Pew, LeNora Johnson.(Carlyon, Bradley) (Entered: 07/10/2006)

07/10/2006	<u>10</u>	MOTION for Admission Pro Hac Vice by Brenna L Clani on behalf of the Navajo Nation. (BAS,) (Entered: 07/11/2006)
07/11/2006	11	ORDER pursuant to General Order 05-25 granting <u>10</u> Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice.Per the Court's Administrative Policies and Procedures Manual, applicant has five (5) days in which to register as a user of the Electronic Filing System. Registration to be accomplished via the court's website at www.azd.uscourts.gov. (BAS,)(This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no.pdf document associated with this entry.) (Entered: 07/11/2006)
07/13/2006	<u>12</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer by Jan Brewer. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Silverman, Peter) (Entered: 07/13/2006)
07/17/2006	<u>13</u>	ORDER granting <u>12</u> Joint Stipulation to Motion for Extension of Time to Answer. Jan Brewer (Secretary of State) answer due 7/24/2006. . Signed by Judge Earl H Carroll on 7/17/06. (LCF) (Entered: 07/17/2006)
07/17/2006	<u>14</u>	MOTION to Expedite Motion for Preliminary Injunction by Navajo Nation, Agnes Laughter. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Ferguson, Patricia) (Entered: 07/17/2006)
07/17/2006	<u>15</u>	Notice re Plaintiffs' Response to Motion to Transfer and Consolidate by Navajo Nation, Agnes Laughter (Attachments: # <u>1</u> # <u>2</u> Exhibit 1 # <u>3</u> Exhibit 2)(Ferguson, Patricia) (Entered: 07/17/2006)
07/17/2006	<u>16</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by Patty Hansen, Candace Owens.(Wilcox, Jean) (Entered: 07/17/2006)
07/17/2006	<u>17</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Jean E Wilcox on behalf of Patty Hansen, Candace Owens (Wilcox, Jean) (Entered: 07/17/2006)
07/18/2006	<u>18</u>	STIPULATION (<i>Joint</i>) by Navajo Nation, Agnes Laughter. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Ferguson, Patricia) (Entered: 07/18/2006)
07/19/2006	<u>19</u>	ORDER granting stipulation <u>18</u> ; ORDERED that the Court will delay briefing and ruling on the plas' motion for expedited hearing and ruling on plas' motion for preliminary injunction until a ruling is issued by Judge Roslyn Silver on Secretary of State's Motion to Transfer and Consolidate this actio with nos. CV 06-01268-PHX-ROS and CV 06-01362-PCT-JAT. Signed by Judge Earl H Carroll on 7/18/2006. (LAD) (Entered: 07/19/2006)
07/19/2006	<u>20</u>	Notice re of Association by Jan Brewer (Richards, William) (Entered: 07/19/2006)
07/19/2006	<u>21</u>	Reply <i>in Support of Motion to Transfer and to Consolidate</i> by Defendant Jan Brewer. (Richards, William) (Entered: 07/19/2006)
07/24/2006	<u>22</u>	STIPULATION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO ANSWER COMPLAINT by Jan Brewer. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Silverman, Peter) (Entered: 07/24/2006)
07/27/2006	<u>23</u>	ORDER granting <u>22</u> STIPULATION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO ANSWER COMPLAINT, Jan Brewer answer due 7/27/2006.. Signed by Judge Earl H Carroll on 7/24/06. (SBU,) (Entered: 07/27/2006)
07/27/2006	<u>24</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by Jan Brewer.(Silverman, Peter) (Entered: 07/27/2006)
08/04/2006	<u>25</u>	CONSOLIDATION ORDER – MEMBER CASE. Case reassigned to Judge Roslyn O Silver for all further proceedings. Judge Earl H Carroll terminated. Signed by Judge Roslyn O Silver on 8/2/06. (TLJ) (Entered: 08/04/2006)
08/11/2006		Appeal Remark; Notice of Interlocutory Appeal filed in lead case CV 06-1268-PHX-ROS (#152) (REW,) (Entered: 09/12/2006)
09/11/2006		Appeal Remark; Notice of Interlocutory Appeal filed in lead case CV 06-1268-PHX-ROS (#184) (REW,) (Entered: 09/12/2006)
09/12/2006		Appeal Remark; Notice of Appeal filed in lead case CV 06-1268-PHX-ROS (#189) (REW,) (Entered: 09/14/2006)

04/01/2008	<u>26</u>	ORDER per Stipulation filed in Lead Case CV06-1268-PHX-ROS it is ORDERED that PFAWF's claims are dismissed without prejudice. Signed by Judge Roslyn O Silver on 04/01/08. (ESL) (Entered: 04/01/2008)
05/27/2008	<u>27</u>	ORDER DISMISSING CASE granting Stipulation in Case No. CV-06-1268-PHX-ROS, this case {CV-06-1575-PHX-ROS) is dismissed without prejudice. Order 775 . Signed by Judge Roslyn O Silver on 05/27/08. (DNH) (Entered: 05/27/2008)
08/20/2008	<u>28</u>	ORDER FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW the Clerk of Court shall enter judgment on behalf of the Defendants. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED this case shall be terminated. Signed by Judge Roslyn O Silver on 08/20/08. (ESL,) (Entered: 08/20/2008)
08/20/2008	<u>29</u>	CLERK'S JUDGMENT that pursuant to the Courts order filed August 20, 2008, judgment is entered in favor of defendants and against plaintiff. Plaintiff to take nothing, and complaint and action are dismissed.(ESL,) (Entered: 08/20/2008)