

**U.S. District Court  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS (Laredo)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 5:20-cv-00128**

Texas Alliance for Retired Americans et al v. Hughs  
Assigned to: Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Christopher dos Santos  
Related Case: [5:20-cv-00035](#)  
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 08/12/2020  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 441 Civil Rights: Voting  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Texas Alliance for Retired Americans**

represented by **Bruce Spiva**  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 13th St NW  
Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-654-6200  
Email: [bspiva@perkinscoie.com](mailto:bspiva@perkinscoie.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Osher**  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 13th St NW  
Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-654-6200  
Email: [dosher@perkinscoie.com](mailto:dosher@perkinscoie.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Brailey**  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 13th St NW  
Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-654-6211  
Email: [ebrailey@perkinscoie.com](mailto:ebrailey@perkinscoie.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lalitha Madduri**  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 13th Street NW  
Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-654-6200  
Email: [lmadduri@perkinscoie.com](mailto:lmadduri@perkinscoie.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marc Elias**  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 13th St NW  
Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-654-6200  
Email: [melias@perkinscoie.com](mailto:melias@perkinscoie.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Skyler Michelle Howton**  
Perkins Coie LLP  
500 N. Akard Street  
Suite 3300  
Dallas, TX 75201  
214-259-4951

Fax: 214-965-7752  
Email: [showton@perkinscoie.com](mailto:showton@perkinscoie.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Sylvia Bruni**

represented by **Bruce Spiva**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Osher**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Brailey**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lalitha Madduri**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marc Elias**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Skyler Michelle Howton**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**DSCC**

represented by **Bruce Spiva**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Osher**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Brailey**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lalitha Madduri**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marc Elias**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Skyler Michelle Howton**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**DCCC**

represented by **Bruce Spiva**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Osher**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Brailey**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lalitha Madduri**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marc Elias**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Skyler Michelle Howton**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Ruth Hughs**  
*in her official capacity as the Texas  
Secretary of State*

represented by **Todd Lawrence Disher**  
Office of the Attorney General of Texas  
209 W 14th St  
8th Floor  
Austin, TX 78701  
512-936-0677  
Email: [todd.disher@oag.texas.gov](mailto:todd.disher@oag.texas.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**William Thomas Thompson**  
Office of the Attorney General  
Special Litigation Unit  
P.O. Box 12548 (MC-076)  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
512-936-2567  
Email: [will.thompson@oag.texas.gov](mailto:will.thompson@oag.texas.gov)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/12/2020	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Ruth Hughs (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0541-25054762) filed by DCCC, Sylvia Bruni, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 - Declaration of John Oldham, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 - Declaration of Dr. Muer Yang, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 - Declaration of Dr. Catherine Troisi, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 - Declaration of Dr. Allan Lichtman, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 - Declaration of Maxwell Palmer, PhD, # <u>6</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>2</u>	Request for Issuance of Summons as to Ruth Hughs, filed.(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>3</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed.(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>4</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/2/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>5</u>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/2/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/12/2020	<u>6</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support re: <u>5</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix I to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>2</u> Appendix II

		to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>3</u> Appendix III to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>4</u> Appendix IV to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>5</u> Appendix V to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>6</u> Appendix VI to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>7</u> Appendix VII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>8</u> Appendix VIII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>9</u> Appendix IX to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>10</u> Appendix X to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>11</u> Appendix XI to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>12</u> Appendix XII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>13</u> Appendix XIII to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>14</u> Appendix XIV to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>15</u> Appendix XV to Memo in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/12/2020)
08/13/2020		Summons Issued as to Ruth Hughs. Issued summons delivered to plaintiff by First-class mail, filed.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>7</u>	ORDER Granting <u>4</u> MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages. It is so ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(mmarquez, 5) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>8</u>	ORDER, Given that Plaintiffs Motion for Preliminary Injunction is time-sensitive they ask the Court for an injunction to occur before the November 2020 election the Court hereby ORDERS Plaintiffs to file an Advisory as soon as possible to apprise the Court of the status of service of process on Defendant. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(atreveno, 5) Modified on 8/13/2020 (atreveno, 5). (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>9</u>	MOTION for Marc Elias to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Elias, Marc) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>10</u>	MOTION for Lalitha Madduri to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Madduri, Lalitha) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>11</u>	MOTION for Bruce V. Spiva to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Spiva, Bruce) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>12</u>	MOTION for Daniel Osher to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Osher, Daniel) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>13</u>	MOTION for Emily Brailey to Appear Pro Hac ViceMotions referred to John A Kazen. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/3/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Brailey, Emily) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>14</u>	ORDER OF RECUSAL. Magistrate Judge John A. Kazen hereby recuses himself in this case. Case reassigned to Magistrate Judge Diana Song Quiroga. (Signed by Magistrate Judge John A Kazen) Parties notified. (JessicaGRodriguez, 5) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<u>15</u>	ADVISORY by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed.(Spiva, Bruce) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/18/2020	<u>16</u>	RETURN of Service of SUMMONS Executed as to Ruth Hughs served on 8/18/2020, answer due 9/8/2020, filed.(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 08/18/2020)
08/19/2020	<u>17</u>	ORDER. Plaintiffs have filed a Motion for Preliminary Injunction (Dkt. No. 5).Defendant is ORDERED to respond to the motion by September 2, 2020. Plaintiffs may file a reply by September 7, 2020. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia

		Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	<u>18</u>	ORDER granting <u>9</u> Motion for Marc E. Elias to Appear Pro Hac Vice.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	<u>19</u>	ORDER granting <u>11</u> Motion for Bruce V. Spiva to Appear Pro Hac Vice.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	<u>20</u>	ORDER granting <u>12</u> Motion for Daniel Osher to Appear Pro Hac Vice.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	<u>21</u>	ORDER granting <u>13</u> Motion for Emily Brailey to Appear Pro Hac Vice.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/19/2020	<u>22</u>	ORDER granting <u>10</u> Motion for Lalitha D. Madduri to Appear Pro Hac Vice.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(ehernandez, 5) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/31/2020	<u>23</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Todd Lawrence Disher on behalf of Ruth Hughs, filed. (Disher, Todd) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
08/31/2020	<u>24</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by William T. Thompson on behalf of Ruth Hughs, filed. (Thompson, William) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
08/31/2020	<u>25</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Leave to File Excess PagesMotions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/21/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
08/31/2020	<u>26</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <u>1</u> Complaint, by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/21/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 08/31/2020)
09/02/2020	<u>27</u>	MOTION to Strike <i>Expert Declaration and Testimony of Dr. Allan Lichtman</i> Motions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/23/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/02/2020	<u>28</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess PagesMotions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/23/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/02/2020	<u>29</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>5</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction, filed by Ruth Hughs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/02/2020	<u>30</u>	APPENDIX re: <u>29</u> Response in Opposition to Motion by Ruth Hughs, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/02/2020)
09/03/2020	<u>31</u>	NOTICE of Filing of Correction to Exhibit 4 of Appendix in Support re: <u>29</u> Response in Opposition to Motion by Ruth Hughs, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Corrected Exhibit 4, Part I of Appendix in Support, # <u>2</u> Corrected Exhibit 4, Part II of Appendix in Support)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/03/2020)
09/07/2020	<u>32</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess PagesMotions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/28/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/07/2020)
09/07/2020	<u>33</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>26</u> MOTION to Dismiss <u>1</u> Complaint, , filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix I to Plaintiffs' Response in Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Dismiss)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/07/2020)

09/07/2020	<u>34</u>	REPLY in Support of <u>5</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction, filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix I – to Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction, # <u>2</u> Appendix II – to Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/07/2020)
09/08/2020	<u>35</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>27</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Expert Declaration and Testimony of Dr. Allan Lichtman</i> , filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Lichtman Deposition Transcript)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/08/2020)
09/11/2020	<u>36</u>	ORDER granting <u>25 28 32</u> Motions for Leave to File Excess Pages.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/11/2020)
09/14/2020	<u>37</u>	NOTICE of Supplemental Authority by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. (Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/14/2020)
09/14/2020	<u>38</u>	REPLY in Support of <u>26</u> MOTION to Dismiss <u>1</u> Complaint, , filed by Ruth Hughs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/14/2020)
09/14/2020	<u>39</u>	MOTION to Strike <i>Declaration of Dan Wallach or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Sur–Reply</i> Motions referred to Diana Song Quiroga. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 10/5/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/14/2020)
09/16/2020	<u>40</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>39</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Declaration of Dan Wallach or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Sur–Reply</i> , filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/16/2020)
09/23/2020	<u>41</u>	REPLY in Support of <u>39</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Declaration of Dan Wallach or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Sur–Reply</i> , filed by Ruth Hughs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/23/2020)
09/25/2020	<u>42</u>	ORDER denying Defendant's <u>27</u> Motion to Strike Dr. Lichtman's declaration and any future testimony.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/25/2020)
09/25/2020	<u>43</u>	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER granting in part and denying in part Defendant's <u>26</u> MOTION to Dismiss; denying <u>39</u> MOTION to Strike the Declaration of Dan Wallach; granting Plaintiff's <u>5</u> Request for Preliminary Injunction. (Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/25/2020)
09/26/2020	<u>44</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL to US Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit re: <u>43</u> Memorandum and Order, by Ruth Hughs (Filing fee \$ 505, receipt number 0541–25264681), filed.(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/26/2020)
09/26/2020	<u>45</u>	Opposed MOTION to Stay <i>Preliminary Injunction</i> Motions referred to Christopher dos Santos. by Ruth Hughs, filed. Motion Docket Date 10/19/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Bexar Co. Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Hays Co. Declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Tarrant Co. Declaration, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Collin Co. Declaration, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order)(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 09/26/2020)
09/26/2020	<u>46</u>	Clerks Notice of Filing of an Appeal. The following Notice of Appeal and related motions are pending in the District Court: <u>44</u> Notice of Appeal. Fee status: Paid. Reporter(s): No Hearing Held, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice of Appeal, # <u>2</u> Memorandum and Order, # <u>3</u> Docket Sheet) (dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/28/2020)
09/28/2020	<u>47</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>45</u> Opposed MOTION to Stay <i>Preliminary Injunction</i> , filed by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans. (Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 09/28/2020)
09/28/2020		Notice of Assignment of USCA No. 20–40643 re: <u>44</u> Notice of Appeal, filed.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 09/28/2020)
10/01/2020		Electronic record on appeal certified to the Fifth Circuit Court of Appeals re: <u>44</u> Notice of Appeal USCA No. 20–40643, filed.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 10/01/2020)

10/01/2020		Electronic Access to Record on Appeal Provided re: <u>44</u> Notice of Appeal to counsel for appellant and appellee. Attorneys of record at the Circuit may <u>download the record from the Court of Appeals</u> . (USCA No. 20-40643), filed.(dmorales, 5) (Entered: 10/01/2020)
10/23/2020	<u>48</u>	Opposed MOTION for Clarification Motions referred to Christopher dos Santos. by Sylvia Bruni, DCCC, DSCC, Texas Alliance for Retired Americans, filed. Motion Docket Date 11/13/2020. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Howton, Skyler) (Entered: 10/23/2020)
10/26/2020	<u>49</u>	ORDER granting <u>48</u> Motion for Clarification. Plaintiffs have filed an opposed Motion for Clarification, asking that this Court clarify the scope of its order granting Plaintiffs request for a preliminary injunction (Dkt. No. 48). The Court hereby GRANTS the motion and clarifies that the preliminary injunction entered on September 25, 2020 (Dkt. No. <u>43</u> ) applies only to in-person voting during the November 2020 general election.(Signed by Judge Marina Garcia Marmolejo) Parties notified.(sgonzalez, 5) (Entered: 10/26/2020)
11/03/2020	<u>50</u>	ADVISORY by Ruth Hughs, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Fifth Circuit Order (No. 20-50774))(Disher, Todd) (Entered: 11/03/2020)