

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of Ohio (Columbus)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:18-cv-00272-MHW-CMV**

Ray et al v. Director, Ohio Department of Health et al Date Filed: 03/29/2018
Assigned to: Judge Michael H. Watson Date Terminated: 12/16/2020
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura Jury Demand: Defendant
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act Nature of Suit: 950 Constitutional -
State Statute
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Stacie Ray

represented by **Freda J Levenson**
ACLU of Ohio Foundation
4506 Chester Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44103
614-586-1972
Fax: 614-586-1974
Email: flevenson@acluohio.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David J. Carey
Thompson Hine LLP
41 S. High St., Ste. 1700
Columbus, OH 43215
(614) 469-3299
Fax: (614) 469-3361
Email:
david.carey@thompsonhine.com (*Inactive*)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elizabeth Bonham
ACLU of Ohio Foundation
4506 Chester Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44103
614-586-1972
Fax: 614-586-1974
Email: ebonham@acluohio.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gabriel Arkles
American Civil Liberties Union
125 Broad Street
18th Floor

New York, NY 10004
(212) 549-2659
Fax: (212) 549-2650
Email: garkles@aclu.org
TERMINATED: 11/13/2020
PRO HAC VICE

Jennifer S Roach
127 Public Square
3900 Key Center
Cleveland, OH 44114
216 566 5500
Fax: 216 566 5800
Email: jennifer.roach@thompsonhine.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Knight
American Civil Liberties Union
150 N. Michigan
Suite 600
Chicago, IL 60601
(312) 210-9740 ext. 335
Fax: (312) 288-5225
Email: jknight@aclu-il.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kara N. Ingelhart
Lambda Legal Defense and Education
Fund, Inc.
65 E. Wacker Place
Suite 2000
Chicago, IL 60601
(312) 663-4413
Fax: (312) 663-4307
Email: kingelhart@lambdalegal.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Malita Picasso
American Civil Liberties Union
125 Broad Street
18th Floor
New York, NY 10004
(212) 549-2561
Fax: (212) 549-2650

Email: mpicasso@aclu.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter C. Renn
Lambda Legal Defense and Education
Fund, Inc.
4221 Wilshire Boulevard
Suite 280
Los Angeles, CA 90010-3512
(213) 382-7600
Fax: (213) 351-6050
Email: prenn@lambdalegal.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susan Jane Becker
647 Brownstone Circle
Avon Lake, OH 44012
440-864-0715
Email: sbecker@acluohio.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Basil Argento

represented by **Freda J Levenson**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David J. Carey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elizabeth Bonham
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gabriel Arkles
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 11/13/2020
PRO HAC VICE

Jennifer S Roach
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Knight
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kara N. Ingelhart
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Malita Picasso
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter C. Renn
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susan Jane Becker
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Jane Doe

represented by **Freda J Levenson**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David J. Carey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elizabeth Bonham
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gabriel Arkles
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 11/13/2020
PRO HAC VICE

Jennifer S Roach
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Knight

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kara N. Ingelhart

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Malita Picasso

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter C. Renn

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susan Jane Becker

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Ashley Breda

represented by **Freda J Levenson**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David J. Carey

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elizabeth Bonham

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gabriel Arkles

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 11/13/2020

PRO HAC VICE

Jennifer S Roach

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Knight

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kara N. Ingelhart

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Malita Picasso

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter C. Renn

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susan Jane Becker

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**Director, Ohio Department of
Health**

TERMINATED: 07/02/2019

represented by **Jason J. Blake**

Calfee Halter & Griswold LLP

1200 Huntington Center

41 South High Street

Columbus, OH 43215

(614) 621-1500

Fax: (614) 621-0010

Email: jblake@calfee.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Albert J Lucas

Calfee Halter & Griswold

1200 Huntington Center

41 South High Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4243

614-621-7002

Fax: 614-621-0010
Email: alucas@calfee.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Henry G. Appel
Ohio Attorney General
Health and Human Services
30 E Broad Street
26th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3428
614-466-8600
Fax: 866-441-4738
Email:
henry.appel@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
TERMINATED: 06/18/2018

Kimberly Moses
Calfee Halter & Griswold
1400 McDonald Investment Center
800 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114-2688
216-622-8200
Email: kmoses@calfee.com
TERMINATED: 02/27/2019

Defendant

Chief, Office of Vital Statistics represented by **Jason J. Blake**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Albert J Lucas
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Henry G. Appel
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/18/2018

Kimberly Moses
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 02/27/2019

Defendant

State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics represented by **Jason J. Blake**
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Albert J Lucas
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Henry G. Appel
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/18/2018

Kimberly Moses
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 02/27/2019

Defendant

Amy Acton
*in her official capacity
TERMINATED: 12/08/2020*

represented by **Jason J. Blake**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Albert J Lucas
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Stephanie McCloud
*in her official capacity as
Director of the Ohio Department
of Health*

represented by **Jason J. Blake**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Albert J Lucas
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
03/29/2018	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Lance Himes, Judith Nagy, Karen Sorrell (Filing fee \$ 400 paid - receipt number: 0648-6379163), filed by Stacie Ray, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Basil Argento. (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 03/29/2018)
03/29/2018	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Protective Order <i>and Leave to Proceed Anonymously</i> by Plaintiff Jane Doe. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 03/29/2018)

03/29/2018	3	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray re 1 Complaint <i>Civil Cover Sheet</i> (Attachments: # 1 Civil Cover Sheet Attachment) (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 03/29/2018)
03/29/2018	4	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee of \$200 paid, receipt number 0648-6379346) of Gabriel Arkles, by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing) (Levenson, Freda) Modified text on 3/29/2018 (daf). Modified text on 3/30/2018 (ew). (Entered: 03/29/2018)
03/29/2018	5	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee of \$200 paid, receipt number 0648-6379365) of Kara N. Ingelhart by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit) (Levenson, Freda) Modified text on 3/30/2018 (ew). (Entered: 03/29/2018)
03/29/2018	6	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee of \$200 paid, receipt number 268N9NBJ) of John Knight by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit) (Levenson, Freda) Modified text on 3/30/2018 (ew). (Entered: 03/29/2018)
03/29/2018	7	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee of \$200 paid, receipt number 0648-6379402) of Peter C. Renn by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit) (Levenson, Freda) Modified text on 3/30/2018 (ew). (Entered: 03/29/2018)
03/30/2018	8	NOTAION ORDER granting 4 , 5 , 6 , and 7 Motions for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Gabriel Arkles, Kara N. Ingelhart, John Knight, and Peter C. Renn, conditional upon Counsel registering for electronic filing or seeking leave to be excused from doing so within fourteen (14) days. By Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 3/30/2018. (agm) (Entered: 03/30/2018)
04/05/2018	9	ORDER granting Plaintiff's 2 Motion for Protective Order and Leave to Proceed Anonymously. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 4/5/2018. (kpt) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018		Sealed Access was granted by the Court to permit counsel to file documents containing the full name of Plaintiff Jane Doe under seal pursuant to 9 . (ew) (Entered: 04/06/2018)

04/05/2018		The Clerk's Office has provided sealed access to counsel to file documents containing the full name of Plaintiff Jane Doe under seal pursuant to 9 . (ew) (Entered: 04/06/2018)
04/06/2018	10	NOTICE of Appearance by Henry G. Appel for Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics (Appel, Henry) (Entered: 04/06/2018)
04/10/2018	11	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed. Waiver sent to all defendants on 3/29/2018. Answers due 05/29/2018. (Appel, Henry) Modified text on 4/10/2018 (ew). (Entered: 04/10/2018)
05/22/2018	12	NOTICE by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics <i>Stipulated Extension of Time to Move or Plead</i> (Appel, Henry) (Entered: 05/22/2018)
05/23/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Chief, Office of Vital Statistics answer due 6/19/2018; Director, Ohio Department of Health answer due 6/19/2018; State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics answer due 6/19/2018. (er) (Entered: 05/23/2018)
06/14/2018	13	NOTICE of Hearing: Preliminary Pretrial Conference set for 7/16/2018 at 1:30 PM before Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura. (agm) (Entered: 06/14/2018)
06/15/2018	14	NOTICE by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics <i>Notice of Withdrawal and Substitution of Counsel</i> (Lucas, Albert) (Entered: 06/15/2018)
06/15/2018	15	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time New date requested 7/6/2018. by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A) (Lucas, Albert) (Entered: 06/15/2018)
06/18/2018	16	ORDER granting 15 Motion for Extension of Time. Defendants shall have until July 6, 2018 , to move or otherwise plead in this matter. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 6/18/2018. (daf) (Entered: 06/18/2018)
06/18/2018		Set/Reset Answer Deadlines as to All Defendants. (daf) (Entered: 06/18/2018)
06/27/2018	17	RE-NOTICE of Hearing: Preliminary Pretrial Conference reset for 7/18/2018 03:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura. (agm) (Entered: 06/27/2018)

07/06/2018	18	MOTION TO DISMISS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1: Ohio Vital Statistics Birth Occurrence File, # 2 Exhibit 2: Certification of Birth Abstract) (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 07/06/2018)
07/09/2018	19	RULE 26(f) REPORT by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 07/09/2018)
07/18/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 7/18/2018. (agm) (Entered: 07/19/2018)
07/19/2018	20	PRELIMINARY PRETRIAL ORDER: This case is referred to the March 2019 SETTLEMENT WEEK. Joinder of Parties due by 8/20/2018. Motions to Amend due by 8/20/2018. Rule 26(a)(1) Disclosures due by 8/20/2018. Primary Expert due by 4/1/2019. Rebuttal Expert due by 5/1/2019. Discovery due by 6/1/2019. Dispositive motions due by 7/15/2019. Settlement Week due by 3/1/2019. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 7/19/2018. (daf) (Entered: 07/19/2018)
07/20/2018	21	MOTION to Stay <i>Discovery</i> by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 07/20/2018)
07/20/2018	22	Emergency MOTION to Stay <i>in Interim</i> by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order) (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 07/20/2018)
07/27/2018	23	RESPONSE in Opposition re 18 MOTION TO DISMISS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM filed by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 07/27/2018)
07/27/2018	24	RESPONSE in Opposition re 22 Emergency MOTION to Stay <i>in Interim</i> filed by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 07/27/2018)
08/01/2018	25	REPLY to Response to Motion re 22 Emergency MOTION to Stay <i>in Interim</i> filed by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 08/01/2018)

08/02/2018	26	ORDER granting 22 Motion to Stay. Discovery in this case, including the initial disclosure deadlines set forth in the Court's Preliminary Pretrial Order, is stayed pending resolution of Defendants' Motion to Stay Discovery. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 8/2/2018. (daf) (Entered: 08/02/2018)
08/10/2018	27	RESPONSE in Opposition re 21 MOTION to Stay <i>Discovery</i> filed by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 08/10/2018)
08/10/2018	28	REPLY to Response to Motion re 18 MOTION TO DISMISS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM filed by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit) (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 08/10/2018)
08/16/2018	29	NOTICE of Substitution of Counsel - Jennifer S Roach substituting for David J. Carey as to Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Roach, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/16/2018)
08/24/2018	30	REPLY to Response to 21 Motion to Stay Discovery filed by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) Modified text on 8/27/2018 (ew). (Entered: 08/24/2018)
08/24/2018		This entry was created by the Clerk's office for case management purposes to use the correct filing event, Reply to Response to Motion, for ECF 30 . (ew) (Entered: 08/27/2018)
10/10/2018	31	OPINION AND ORDER denying 21 Motion to Stay. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 10/10/2018. (daf) (Entered: 10/10/2018)
10/11/2018	32	NOTICE of Appearance by David J. Carey for Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray (Carey, David) (Entered: 10/11/2018)
10/15/2018	33	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray re 32 Notice of Appearance (Carey, David) (Entered: 10/15/2018)
12/06/2018	34	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 12/6/18. (sem) (Entered: 12/06/2018)
02/25/2019	35	ORDER - Counsel to confer as soon as practicable and inform the Court via email by 3/1/2019 if this case should NOT be set for

		March 2019 Settlement Week. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 2/25/2019. (agm) (Entered: 02/25/2019)
02/27/2019	36	NOTICE by Defendant State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics <i>Notice of Withdrawal</i> (Moses, Kimberly) (Entered: 02/27/2019)
03/26/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura: Telephone Conference held on 3/26/2019. (agm) (Entered: 03/26/2019)
03/26/2019	38	NOTATION ORDER EXTENDING CASE SCHEDULE - Primary Expert due by 7/1/2019. Rebuttal Expert due by 7/30/2019. Discovery due by 8/30/2019. Dispositive motions due by 10/14/2019. by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 3/26/2019. (agm) (Entered: 03/26/2019)
07/01/2019	39	Unopposed MOTION to Substitute Party <i>Director, Ohio Department of Health</i> by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 07/01/2019)
07/01/2019	40	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray <i>of Supplemental Information</i> (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Ex. A to Notice) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 07/01/2019)
07/02/2019	41	NOTATION ORDER granting 39 Motion to Substitute Party. Amy Acton added. By Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 7/2/2019. (agm) (Entered: 07/02/2019)
07/02/2019	42	Response re 40 Notice (Other) by Defendants Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 07/02/2019)
07/26/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura: Telephone Conference held on 7/26/2019. (agm) (Entered: 07/26/2019)
07/26/2019	44	ORDER memorializing the telephonic discovery conference held on July 26,2019. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 7/26/2019. (daf) (Entered: 07/26/2019)
08/14/2019	45	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery New date requested 10/29/2019. by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 08/14/2019)
08/15/2019	46	NOTATION ORDER granting 45 Motion for Extension of Time. By Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 8/15/2019. (agm) (Entered: 08/15/2019)

08/15/2019		Set/Reset Columbus PPTO Deadlines: Discovery due by 10/29/2019. Dispositive motions due by 1/10/2020. (agm) (Entered: 08/15/2019)
09/12/2019	47	OPINION and ORDER denying 18 Defendants' Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim. Signed by Judge Michael H. Watson on 9/12/19. (jk) (Entered: 09/12/2019)
09/26/2019	48	ANSWER to 1 Complaint with Jury Demand filed by All Defendants. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 09/26/2019)
11/12/2019	49	Joint MOTION Set Briefing Schedule by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 11/12/2019)
11/13/2019	50	ORDER granting 49 Motion to Set Briefing Schedule. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 11/13/2019. (daf) (Entered: 11/13/2019)
11/13/2019		Reset deadlines pursuant to 50 : Cross Motions for Summary Judgment due by 1/16/2020. Responses due by 1/13/2020. Replies due by 2/27/2020. (ew) (Entered: 11/14/2019)
11/15/2019		Set/Reset Modified Deadlines: Re: cross motions for summary judgment - Responses due by 2/13/2020 Replies due by 2/27/2020. (jlk) (Entered: 11/15/2019)
01/07/2020	51	Joint MOTION to File Document Under Seal <i>and to File Single Copies of Deposition Transcripts</i> by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order Granting Leave to File under Seal) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/07/2020)
01/08/2020	52	Unopposed MOTION Leave to Exceed Page Limitations by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 01/08/2020)
01/09/2020	53	ORDER granting in part and denying in part 51 Motion to File Document Under Seal and to File Single Copies of Deposition Transcripts. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 1/9/2020. (daf) (Entered: 01/09/2020)
01/09/2020	54	Unopposed MOTION to Seal by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (Bonham, Elizabeth) Modified event on 1/10/2020 (ew). (Entered: 01/09/2020)

01/10/2020	55	DEPOSITION of Judith Nagy taken on August 2, 2019 by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 01/10/2020)
01/10/2020	56	DEPOSITION of Randi Ettner, Ph.D. taken on September 18, 2019 by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 01/10/2020)
01/10/2020	57	DEPOSITION of Quentin Van Meter, M.D. taken on September 27, 2019 by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 01/10/2020)
01/10/2020	58	DEPOSITION of Ryan Gorton, M.D. taken on October 8, 2019 by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 01/10/2020)
01/10/2020	59	ORDER granting 54 Motion to File Document Under Seal. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 1/10/2020. (daf) (Entered: 01/10/2020)
01/14/2020	64	DEPOSITION of Basil Argento taken on August 29, 2019 by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/14/2020)
01/14/2020	65	DEPOSITION of Ashley Breda taken on August 21, 2019 by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/14/2020)
01/14/2020	66	DEPOSITION of Jane Doe taken on September 13, 2019 by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/14/2020)
01/14/2020	67	DEPOSITION of Stacie Ray taken on August 19, 2019 by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/14/2020)
01/14/2020	68	NOTATION ORDER granting 52 Motion for Leave to Exceed Page Limitations. By Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 1/14/2020. (agm) (Entered: 01/14/2020)
01/16/2020	69	MOTION for Summary Judgment by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit List, # 2 Exhibit A - Defendants' Response to Interrogatory 3, # 3 Exhibit B - ODH Deposition Exhibits 5 and 6, # 4 Exhibit C - U Gender marker changed, # 5 Exhibit D - Gender marker changed to H,

		# 6 Exhibit E - Expert Report of Dr. Randi Ettner, # 7 Exhibit F - Expert Report of Dr. Ryan Gorton, # 8 Exhibit G - Defendants' Response to Interrogatory 2) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/16/2020)
01/16/2020	71	REDACTED MOTION for Summary Judgment by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Nagy Affidavit, # 2 Exhibit Ohio Vital Stat. Birth Occurrence File Layout, # 3 Exhibit Certificate of Birth Abstract) (Lucas, Albert) Modified text on 2/20/2020 (agm). (Entered: 01/16/2020)
02/13/2020	72	RESPONSE in Opposition re 71 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 02/13/2020)
02/13/2020	73	RESPONSE in Opposition re 69 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 02/13/2020)
02/27/2020	74	REPLY to Response to Motion re 69 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 02/27/2020)
02/27/2020	75	REPLY to Response to Motion re 71 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 02/27/2020)
06/29/2020	76	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray <i>Notice of Supplemental Authority</i> (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 06/29/2020)
11/13/2020	77	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray <i>Notice of Withdrawal of Gabriel Arkles as Co-Counsel</i> (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 11/13/2020)
12/07/2020	78	Unopposed MOTION to Substitute Party by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 12/07/2020)
12/08/2020	79	NOTATION ORDER granting 78 Motion to Substitute Party. Stephanie McCloud added. Amy Acton (in her official capacity)

		terminated. By Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 12/8/2020. (agm) (Entered: 12/08/2020)
12/16/2020	80	OPINION and ORDER granting 69 Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment; denying 70 Defendants' Sealed Motion for Summary Judgment. Signed by Judge Michael H. Watson on 12/16/20. (jk) (Entered: 12/16/2020)
12/16/2020	81	CLERK'S JUDGMENT - Pursuant to the December 16, 2020 Opinion and Order, Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED; Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment is DENIED. (jk) (Entered: 12/16/2020)
01/07/2021	82	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee of \$200 paid, receipt number AOHSDC-7963191) of Malita Picasso by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of Good Standing) (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 01/07/2021)
01/08/2021	83	NOTATION ORDER granting 82 Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Malita Picasso as Co-Counsel. Co-Counsel is directed to register for e-filing through PACER unless they have done so previously. By Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 1/8/2021. (ew) (Entered: 01/08/2021)
01/08/2021	84	MOTION for Designation and Removal from ECF of Highly Sensitive Documents by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/08/2021)
01/11/2021	85	ORDER denying 84 Motion for Designation and Removal from ECF of Highly Sensitive Documents. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 1/11/2021. (daf) (Entered: 01/11/2021)
01/27/2021	86	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray re 83 Order on Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice, <i>Certificate of Good Standing</i> (Levenson, Freda) (Entered: 01/27/2021)
02/01/2021	87	MOTION for Attorney Fees by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Table of Exhibits, # 2 Exhibit A - OSBA Report, # 3 Exhibit B - Levenson Declaration, # 4 Exhibit B1 - Levenson Resume, # 5

Exhibit B2 - Levenson Fees, # [6](#) Exhibit C - Becker Declaration, # [7](#) Exhibit C1 - Becker Resume, # [8](#) Exhibit C2 - Becker Fees, # [9](#) Exhibit D - Carey Declaration, # [10](#)

Exhibit D1 - Carey Resume, # [11](#) Exhibit D2 - Carey Fees, # [12](#) Exhibit E - Bonham Declaration, # [13](#) Exhibit E1 - Bonham Resume, # [14](#) Exhibit E2 - Bonham Fees, # [15](#)

Exhibit F - Renn Declaration, # [16](#) Exhibit F1 - Renn Resume, # [17](#) Exhibit F2 - Renn Fees, # [18](#) Exhibit G - Ingelheart Declaration, # [19](#) Exhibit G1 - Ingelheart Resume, # [20](#) Exhibit G2 - Ingelheart Fees, # [21](#) Exhibit H - Knight Declaration, # [22](#) Exhibit H1 - Knight Resume, # [23](#)

Exhibit H2 - Knight Fees, # [24](#) Exhibit I - Arkles Declaration, # [25](#) Exhibit I1 - Arkles Resume, # [26](#) Exhibit I2 - Arkles Fees, # [27](#) Exhibit J - Picasso Declaration, # [28](#)

Exhibit J1 - Picasso Resume, # [29](#) Exhibit J2 - Picasso Fees, # [30](#) Exhibit K - Roach Declaration, # [31](#) Exhibit K1 - Roach Resume, # [32](#) Exhibit K2 - Thompson Hine Fees, # [33](#)

Exhibit L - Sabo Declaration, # [34](#) Exhibit L1 - Sabo Fees, # [35](#) Exhibit M - Keeshin Declaration, # [36](#) Exhibit M1 - Keeshin Resume, # [37](#) Exhibit M2 - Keeshin Fees, # [38](#)

Exhibit Sabo Second Declaration, # [39](#) Exhibit N1 - ACLU Costs, # [40](#) Exhibit N2 - Lambda Costs, # [41](#)

Exhibit N3 - ACLU Ohio Costs, # [42](#) Exhibit N4 - Costs to Recover) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 02/01/2021)

02/22/2021	88	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply New date requested 3/24/2021. by Defendants Amy Acton, Chief, Office of Vital Statistics, Director, Ohio Department of Health, Stephanie McCloud, State Registrar, Office of Vital Statistics. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (Blake, Jason) (Entered: 02/22/2021)
02/23/2021		NOTATION ORDER granting 88 Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply by Judge Michael H. Watson on 2/23/2021. (jk) (Entered: 02/23/2021)
02/23/2021		Reset deadlines pursuant to the 2/23/2021 notation order. (ew) (Entered: 02/23/2021)
03/24/2021	89	Joint MOTION to Stay re 87 MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>to stay fees briefing and order status report</i> by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 03/24/2021)
03/26/2021	90	ORDER granting 89 Motion to Stay Briefing re 87 MOTION for Attorney Fees. The parties are ORDERED to file a Joint Status Report by 4/7/2021 detailing the status of discussions regarding the motion and Defendants' compliance with the Court's December 16, 2020 order. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 3/26/2021. (kk2) (Entered: 03/26/2021)
03/26/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Status Report due by 4/7/2021 (kk2) (Entered: 03/26/2021)
04/07/2021	91	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 04/07/2021)
04/08/2021	92	ORDER: The parties are ORDERED to file a Joint Status Report by 4/22/2021, detailing the status of their discussion regarding the fee motion and Defendants' compliance with the Court's December 16, 2020 Order. Signed by Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura on 4/8/2021. (kk2) (Entered: 04/08/2021)
04/22/2021	93	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 04/22/2021)

04/26/2021		NOTICE of Hearing: Telephone Status Conference set for 5/18/2021 at 11:00 a.m. before Judge Michael H. Watson. (jk) (Entered: 04/26/2021)
05/13/2021		NOTICE of Hearing: Telephone Status Conference reset for 5/19/2021 at 3:00 p.m. before Judge Michael H. Watson. (jk) (Entered: 05/13/2021)
05/19/2021		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael H. Watson: Telephone Conference held on 5/19/2021. (Court Reporter: Lahana DuFour) (jk) (Entered: 05/19/2021)
05/19/2021		NOTICE of Hearing: Telephone Status Conference set for 5/25/2021 at 4:00 p.m. before Judge Michael H. Watson. (jk) (Entered: 05/19/2021)
05/26/2021	94	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Basil Argento, Ashley Breda, Jane Doe, Stacie Ray <i>Withdrawal as Counsel of Elizabeth Bonham</i> (Bonham, Elizabeth) (Entered: 05/26/2021)
05/27/2021		NOTICE of Hearing - Telephone Status Conference set for 6/8/2021 at 3:30 p.m. before Judge Michael H. Watson. (jk) (Entered: 05/27/2021)
06/09/2021	95	ORDER signed by Judge Michael H. Watson on 6/9/2021. (jk) (Entered: 06/09/2021)
06/23/2021	96	CONSENT JUDGMENT. Signed by Judge Michael H. Watson on 6/23/2021. (er) (Entered: 06/23/2021)
07/16/2021		ORDER - Status Report due by 7/26/21. Signed by Judge Michael H. Watson on 7/16/2021. (jk) (Entered: 07/16/2021)

PACER Service Center

Transaction Receipt

07/21/2021 10:39:20

PACER Login:	CRClearinghouse	Client Code:	Duffield
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	2:18-cv-00272-MHW-CMV
Billable Pages:	14	Cost:	1.40